

Instructional Materials Evaluation - Student Standards Review

Louisiana educators engaged in a professional review of the state’s academic standards for English language arts (ELA) and mathematics to ensure they continue to maintain strong expectations for teaching and learning aligned with college and workplace demands. The new ELA and math standards will be effective beginning with the 2016-2017 school year. As part of the Louisiana Department of Education’s support for a seamless transition to these new standards, the LDOE identified the major changes of the standards and their potential impact upon criteria used to review instructional materials.

Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **6-8**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

This English Language Arts review has been examined for the following changes in alignment resulting from the Louisiana Student Standards Review:

- Materials do not contain references to specific authors and texts
- Include citing *relevant* textual evidence beginning in grade 6
- Include an *awareness of audience* when making speeches and delivering presentations

This review remains a Tier 3 rating. As a result of these changes, the following chart identifies the potential impact on specific elements in the current review. The LDOE recommends that district curriculum staff, principals, and teachers take these findings into consideration when using these instructional materials.

Criteria	Currently in the Rubric	Next Steps for Educators
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as “No” for this criterion because authentic English language arts texts are limited to excerpts, making it difficult to ensure that students would have enough opportunities to practice skills that would help them master the ELA standards through well crafted, quality texts.	Since these materials received a “No” for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as “No” for this criterion because questions do not assess the complexity of the grade level standards.	Since these materials received a “No” for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Speaking and Listening	Not reviewed	

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **6-8**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

[Grade 6 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 7 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 8 \(Tier 3\)](#)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **6**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10¹.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that vary in complexity levels. The provided levels are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.² Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p>	No	<p>Materials note that the texts included are "based on the CCSS" and "[were] written to the 6th grade Lexile level: 925L to 1070L."</p> <p>However, individual Lexile levels are not provided for each text. Teachers would have to determine if texts are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group on their own, using an outside source like Lexile.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress. They place an emphasis on increasing student reading ability toward or beyond their grade level.</p>	No	<p>Aside from the above blurb (found on page vii), materials do not note the Lexile level of each text. Some texts at the end of the materials are at the higher end of the Lexile band (an excerpt from L. Frank Baum's Dorothy and the Wizard of Oz in Chapter 11 has a 1020L), but the Lexile level of this text had to be found through an outside source. The materials themselves do not provide Lexiles for each text and offer no indication that individual texts increase in Lexile as the units progress.</p> <p>The Real Princess, found in in Chapter 3, has a Lexile of 850L, which is below the noted range.</p>
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and</p>	<p>REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to practice skills that will help them master the ELA standards in the particular grade; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various</p>	No	<p>Within the student edition, texts are authored by authorities in the field. Materials include excerpts from Adventures of Tom Sawyer by Mark Twain and Twenty Thousand Leagues Under the Sea by Jules Verne, as well as poems by William Blake, Robert Frost, and Henry Wadsworth Longfellow.</p>

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5> or the [Supplemental Information for Appendix A](#).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).</p>		<p>Texts from various disciplines were included, most notably in Chapters 7 and 8 (e.g. students read about lunar and solar eclipses, earthquakes, Mahalia Jackson, the English colonies, the Hindenburg disaster, and static electricity).</p> <p>Yet, in the chapter tests within the teacher edition, not all texts state known authors, such as an informational piece written about Harriet Tubman and a literary piece titled "Poor Fool's Gold."</p> <p>As a whole, however, materials do not always identify the author or the source, making it difficult to determine if many of the informational texts are authentic and/or if the writers are experts in the field. Further, authentic English language arts texts are limited to excerpts.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide opportunities for students to build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.</p> <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Chapter 4 is wholly dedicated to vocabulary. The table of contents notes that in Chapter 4, students will study context clues, roots and affixes, figurative language, and word choice. Throughout this chapter, students are prompted to reread sentences from previous passages and are asked "As used here, what does the word mean?" or "Based on the passage what does the word mean? Explain your answer."</p> <p>However, aside from this chapter, opportunities to build vocabulary knowledge through reading, writing, listening and speaking were not found.</p> <p>Further, opportunities to build knowledge about concepts, themes, or topics were not found. Texts do not require multiple readings and do not appear to be sequenced, scaffolded, or arranged to advance knowledge. Rather, texts and excerpts stand alone as the skills and strategies are taught in isolation.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials include both literary and informational texts to support students in developing independent reading ability that is at or above grade level.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and build their ability to apply skills learned in small-group instruction to new texts.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop</p>	<p>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4a) Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p>	N/A	
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	N/A	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4c) In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	N/A	
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	N/A	
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students’ reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>	N/A	
	<p>4f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.</p>	N/A	
	<p>4g) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.</p>	N/A	

III. Questions and Tasks

Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable

5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:

Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.

Yes

No

REQUIRED

5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.

Yes

Questions in the grade 6 materials are text-dependent at least 80% of the time and students answer in both multiple choice and short answer format.

In Chapter 1, students read two texts about jobs for young people and are then asked: "What are two drawbacks that Suzie should consider before taking a job? Use information from at least two sources to support your answer" and "Based on Suzie's schedule and interests, which job might be the best option for her?"

In the student edition, which starts with pre-tests and test-taking strategies and suggestions, most questions require students to refer back to the text. After reading "The Real Princess" by Hans Christian Andersen, in the "Exploring Texts" chapter, students answer the following question: "In the second sentence, the author uses a hyperbole, saying the prince traveled around the entire world. Why does he use this exaggerated language?" The question requires that students read the passage that includes the referenced sentence and determine what author Andersen hopes the reader infers about the prince.

In the Chapter 2 post test, students read an excerpt from A Little Princess and are asked "How might the story vary if Miss Minchin was the one telling it?" In the Chapter 3 post test, after reading "Poor Fool's Gold," students not only match the chapter to the point of view that is used, but they also analyze the writer's craft in using that point of view and are asked "What effect does Felicity's first-person narration have on the story?"

Student ideas are expressed through written responses, but evidence of spoken responses was not noted in the post tests. The only time conversation was noted was in the final chapter of the student edition, Speaking and Listening. In order to ensure that student ideas are expressed through spoken responses, a teacher using this material could use some of the questions as discussion prompts and conversation starters.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There is not a coherent sequence of questions and tasks, building on the prior question until Chapter 7. In this chapter, students answer questions about eclipse seasons that build to a final task, asking students: "What reason does the author provide to explain why eclipse seasons occur only twice a year? Write a short response, and use evidence from the text to support your answer."</p> <p>This indicator is not met as there is an absence of culminating questions that ask students to synthesize their understanding from two or more passages until students reach Chapter 7's post-test.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. (<i>Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.</i>)</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Questions do not assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at the sixth grade level. For example, a variety of questions use cite and summarize; however many questions do not develop the ability to require inferencing or synthesizing which are critical within the ELA standards.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5d) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Questions and tasks do not focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5e) Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Vocabulary study were not evident until the Chapter 4 test. When present, the vocabulary study did advance depth of word knowledge with questions such as "Based</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).		<p>on what you know about roots and affixes, what does the word discontented mean? Explain your answer."</p> <p>Moreover, students were asked to use word families in questions such as "The word rushing has the root word rush. Which definition of rushing would best fit how it is used in this sentence?"</p> <p>Still, this indicator is not met as vocabulary study is not prevelant throughout the materials or with each text.</p>
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of diagnostic, formative, summative and self-assessment measures for placement of students into and out of small groups and to monitor progress along the way.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
<p>7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read</p>	<p>REQUIRED 7a) Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight.		
	REQUIRED 7b) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED 7c) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED 7d) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
---------	----------	--------	------------------------------

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Lexile levels of each text are not indicated other than the grade-level range noted in the introduction to the materials. There is no evidence of increasing text complexity as students move and progress throughout the program.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Materials include some authentic English language arts texts, but opportunities to build vocabulary and content knowledge through text is limited.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	Not Evaluated	
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable)	N/A	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	While at least 80% of questions are text dependent, they do not assess the complexity of the sixth grade level standards.
	6. Assessment	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier III, Not representing quality			

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **7**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10³.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>1a) In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that vary in complexity levels. The provided levels are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.⁴ Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Materials note that the texts included are "based on the CCSS" and "[were] written to the 7th grade Lexile level: 970L to 1120L."</p> <p>However, materials do not provide individual levels for each text, so it is difficult to determine whether texts vary in complexity levels without doing outside research.</p> <p>Teachers would need to conduct their own quantitative analysis using a tool such as Lexile. For example, a Lexile search of <i>The Metamorphosis</i> by Kafka in Chapter 3 has a 1340L. While this is above the reading level of the identified group, this is not true of all chapters. An excerpt from <i>The Adventures of Tom Sawyer</i> at the end of Chapter 6 has a 640L.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>1b) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress. They place an emphasis on increasing student reading ability toward or beyond their grade level.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Materials do not note the Lexile level for individual texts, nor are all texts, even at the end of the materials, at the higher end of the grade 6-8 Lexile band. Further, as literary texts are excerpted, a progression of text complexity is difficult to determine.</p> <p>An excerpt from <i>The Raven</i> in Chapter 5 only contains six lines rather than the entire text. Chapter 5 there also contains an excerpt from <i>Pygmalion</i> by George Bernard Shaw that only conveys a part of one scene. While these texts in their entirety are appropriate for middle school instruction, the fact that they are only excerpted makes it difficult for a teacher to place an emphasis on increasing student ability to read on or above grade level.</p>

³ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

⁴ The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5> or the [Supplemental Information for Appendix A](#).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2a) 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to practice skills that will help them master the ELA standards in the particular grade; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Within the student edition, literary texts are authored by authorities in the field. Materials include excerpts from <i>Treasure Island</i> by Robert Louis Stevenson and <i>The Negro</i> by W.E.B. duBois, fables by Aesop, and poems by Robert Frost and Henry Wadsworth Longfellow. Materials also include excerpts from pieces by Jack London and F. Scott Fitzgerald.</p> <p>While many literary texts in the lessons of the student edition allow students to practice skills that help them master the ELA standards as they are well-crafted and authentic, they are typically excerpted, and do not elicit sustained attention to the quality of content, language and writing produced by experts.</p> <p>Chapter tests within both the student and teacher edition, include unnamed authors and/or what appear commissioned texts (an example includes a text entitled "The Legacy at Watergate") in the teacher edition.</p> <p>As materials do not always identify the author or the source, making it difficult to determine if many of the informational texts are authentic and/or if the writers are experts in the field, and authentic English language arts texts are limited to excerpts, this indicator is not met.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2b) Materials provide opportunities for students to build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.</p> <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Chapter 4 is wholly dedicated to vocabulary. The table of contents notes that in Chapter 4, students will study context clues, roots and affixes, figurative language, and analysis of word meanings. Throughout Chapter 4, students are prompted to read small excerpts and respond to questions that build meaning, such as: "Which sentence uses the word pungent correctly?", "Based on the definition, how would a person most likely react to a pungent remark?", and "Explain how the etymology (origin) of the word relates to its various meanings."</p> <p>However, aside from this chapter, opportunities to build</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>vocabulary knowledge through reading, writing, listening and speaking were not found.</p> <p>Further, opportunities to build knowledge about concepts, themes, or topics were not found. Texts do not require multiple readings and do not appear to be sequenced, scaffolded, or arranged to advance knowledge. Rather, texts and excerpts stand alone as the skills and strategies are taught in isolation.</p>
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials include both literary and informational texts to support students in developing independent reading ability that is at or above grade level.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and build their ability to apply skills learned in small-group instruction to new texts.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics,</p>	<p>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4a) Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in</p>	N/A	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	each of the foundational skills.		
	REQUIRED 4b) In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	N/A	
	REQUIRED 4c) In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.	N/A	
	REQUIRED 4d) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.	N/A	
	REQUIRED 4e) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	N/A	
	4f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills	N/A	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.		
	4g) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	N/A	

III. Questions and Tasks

<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Despite the fact that students are asked to refer to the text on both assignments and chapter tests in the 7th grade materials, less than 80% of the questions require students to support their answers with evidence or examples.</p> <p>For example, after students read Walt Whitman's "Oh Captain! My Captain!" in the chapter 6 test, they are asked to identify a type of figurative language used in the poem and then, as a follow up question, students are asked to "Name at least three ways the poem develops this comparison." The first part of this question could be answered without referring to the text; only the second part requires text evidence.</p> <p>The following question asks students "What does the line 'our fearful trip is done' (line 1) most likely refer to?" Due to the fact that students are asked to read a short biographical article on Abraham Lincoln before this text, this is not truly a text-dependent question because it is asking students to activate prior knowledge rather than interpret the connotative meanings of words like "fearful trip." The next question asks students to determine the theme of the poem, but does not ask them to cite direct evidence to support their understanding of the theme.</p> <p>Student ideas are expressed through written responses, yet evidence of spoken responses was not noted in the post tests. The only time conversation was noted was in</p>
--	--	------------------	---

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>the final chapter of the student edition, Speaking and Listening. In order to ensure that student ideas are expressed through spoken responses, a teacher using this material could use some of the questions as discussion prompts and conversation starters.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There is not a coherent sequence of questions and tasks, and questions included do not build on prior questions or elicit sustained attention to the texts.</p> <p>For example, after reading "The Road Not Taken" by Frost in Chapter 6, students answer some questions relating to figurative language, then answer the following question: "If a girl says, 'My dad is a real Grinch around the holidays,' she most likely means that..." which does not focus on student understanding of the text itself. This question could serve as an opening to a lesson on figurative language, but is unrelated to Frost's poem. Not all questions allow for students to prove mastery of concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts themselves.</p> <p>Moreover, in the post tests, texts do not seem to correlate with one another until Chapter 8. In other words, students answer standards-based questions, referring back to the text for textual evidence, yet there is an absence of culminating questions prompting students to synthesize their understanding from two or more passages until students reach Chapter 8's test with the following question: "How does reading both "The Carpool" and "Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. and the Civil Rights Movement" make your understanding of the topic more complete? Use your own paper to explain your answer by citing examples from the texts."</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. <i>(Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.)</i></p>	No	<p>Questions do not assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at the seventh grade level.</p> <p>For example, in Chapter 2, after listening to the audio, "A Good Day," students answer the following multiple-choice question: "What is the order of activities Daphne and Rochelle plan for their afternoon?" This does not assess the depth and complexity of RL 7.2.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5d) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>	No	<p>Questions and tasks do not focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5e) Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).</p>	No	<p>Vocabulary study was not evident until Chapter 3, and even here, the text-dependent question focused more on writer's craft: "The last stage direction calls for Hull to "whistle." How does this add to the meaning?"</p> <p>Yet, when present in Chapter 4, the vocabulary study did advance depth of word knowledge with questions such as "What does exclusive mean? How does knowing the meaning of roots or affixes help you determine the word's meaning?"</p> <p>This indicator is not met, however, as vocabulary study is not prevalent throughout the materials or with each text.</p>
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of diagnostic, formative, summative and self-assessment measures for placement of students into and</p>	Not Evaluated	<p>The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	out of small groups and to monitor progress along the way.		
	REQUIRED 6b) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED 6c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7a) Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED 7b) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED 7c) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	REQUIRED 7d) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	More than 90% of the English language arts texts are excerpted and students do not have enough opportunities to analyze a text in its entirety. Further, there is no evidence of increasing text complexity as students move and progress throughout the program.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Materials include excerpts from authentic English language arts texts, as well as commissioned pieces. Opportunities to build vocabulary and content knowledge is limited.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable)	N/A	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	Less than 80% of questions are text-dependent. Questions do not assess the complexity of the seventh grade level standards.
	6. Assessment	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>			

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **8**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10⁵.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that vary in complexity levels. The provided levels are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.⁶ Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Materials note that the texts included are "based on the CCSS" and "[were] written to the 8th grade Lexile level: 1010L to 1185L."</p> <p>However, individual Lexile levels are not provided for each text. Teachers would have to determine if texts are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group on their own using a tool like Lexile.</p> <p>A search for Lexiles on included texts yielded the following: The Arabian Nights in Chapter 4 has a 920L; The Prince and the Pauper which follows it has a 550L.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress. They place an emphasis on increasing student reading ability toward or beyond their grade level.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Materials do not note the Lexile level for texts, nor are all texts, even at the end of the materials, at the higher end of the grade 6-8 Lexile band. Further, as literary texts are excerpted, a progression of text complexity is difficult to determine.</p> <p>An excerpt from A Study in Scarlet by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle at the end of Chapter 3 has a Lexile of 1050, but the materials only include a five sentence excerpt. The same can be said for a six-line excerpt from Edgar Allan Poe's "The Tell-Tale Heart" in Chapter 4. While this is an appropriate literary text for grade 8, six lines is not enough to ensure that an eighth grade student is reading on or beyond their grade level. Middle school teachers would typically study these pieces in their entirety during classtime.</p>

⁵ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

⁶ The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5> or the [Supplemental Information for Appendix A](#).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2a) 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to practice skills that will help them master the ELA standards in the particular grade; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Within the student edition, texts are authored by authorities in the English language arts field. Materials include excerpts from Siddhartha, A Doll’s House by Henrik Ibsen and “The Widow and the Parrot” by Virginia Woolf, plays by Shakespeare, and poems by Robert Frost and Elizabeth Barrett Browning.</p> <p>Yet, in both the chapter tests within the teacher and student edition, not all texts state known authors, such as a text entitled "Fall Days and Friday Night Lights" in the teacher edition or "My Bar Mitzvah" in the student edition. As a whole, materials do not always identify the author or the source, making it difficult to determine if many of the informational texts are authentic and/or if the writers are experts in the field. For example, in the Chapter 7 of the student edition, students read a text entitled "Using an AED to save a life," yet it is unclear who authored it.</p> <p>Further, authentic English language arts texts are limited to excerpts, making it difficult to ensure that students would have enough opportunities to practice skills that would help them master the ELA standards through well-crafted, quality texts. The same can be said for many informational texts. In Chapter 6, students read a well crafted and authentic speech by Lyndon Baines Johnson ("The Great Society,") but materials only include an excerpt.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2b) Materials provide opportunities for students to build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts,</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Chapter 3 is wholly dedicated to vocabulary. The table of contents notes that in Chapter 3, students will study context clues, roots and affixes, figurative language, and</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.</p> <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text.</p>		<p>analysis of word meanings. Throughout Chapter 3, students are prompted to read small excerpts and respond to questions such as, "Based on your knowledge of the suffix -ion, what does the word temptation mean?" Vocabulary study lessons do not build on one another. For example, students practice with isolated denotation and connotation examples in this chapter.</p> <p>Further, aside from this chapter, opportunities to build vocabulary knowledge through reading, writing, listening and speaking were not found.</p> <p>Texts do not require multiple readings and do not appear to be sequenced, scaffolded, or arranged to advance knowledge. Rather, texts and excerpts stand alone as the skills and strategies are taught in isolation.</p>
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials include both literary and informational texts to support students in developing independent reading ability that is at or above grade level.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and build their ability to apply skills learned in small-group instruction to new texts.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only</p> <p>4a) Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p>	N/A	
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>4b) In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	N/A	
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>4c) In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	N/A	
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>4d) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	N/A	
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>4e) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral</p>	N/A	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.		
	4f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.	N/A	
	4g) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	N/A	
III. Questions and Tasks			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</p> <p>Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>80% of questions in the grade 8 materials are text-dependent and students answer in both multiple choice and short answer format.</p> <p>Even in the student edition, which starts with pre-tests and test-taking strategies and suggestions, most questions require students to refer back to the text.</p> <p>After students read "There are Such Weary Little Lines" from Cross Roads by Margaret E. Sangster, they respond to text-dependent questions such as: "What is the effect of the repetition in lines 1, 5, and 9 of the poem, and how does it compare to the narrator's description of the siblings' feelings in 'The Gravel Road'?"</p> <p>Student ideas are expressed through written responses, yet evidence of spoken responses was not noted in the post tests. The only time conversation was noted was in the final chapter of the student edition, Speaking and Listening. In order to ensure that student ideas are expressed through spoken responses, a teacher using this material could use some of the questions as discussion</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			prompts and conversation starters.
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts.</p>	No	<p>Some question sets are coherent and sequenced beginning with citing evidence and transitioning to creating inferences and even establishing theme.</p> <p>This is not, however, evident throughout the materials or with each text, as many questions are asked in isolation and do not build on prior questions.</p> <p>For example, after reading an excerpt from <i>Twenty Thousand Leagues Under the Sea</i> by Jules Verne, students are asked to "Identify words and phrases from the text that contribute to the meaning and tone of the story" and then finally "What is the setting of this scene?" The order of the questions is not coherent nor do all of the questions allow for students to prove mastery of concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. (<i>Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.</i>)</p>	No	<p>Questions do not assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at the eighth grade level.</p> <p>For example, in Chapter 4, after reading an adapted excerpt from "The Story of the Fisherman and the Genie" from <i>The Arabian Nights</i> edited by Kate Douglas Wiggin and Nora A. Smith, students answer the following questions: "What is the primary conflict of the story?", "This conflict is an example of which type of conflict?" Similar questions are included in both the sixth and seventh grade student editions and are not aligned with the depth and complexity of the eighth grade standards.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5d) Questions and tasks support students in examining the</p>	No	Questions and tasks do not focus on engaging students

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>		<p>with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5e) Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Vocabulary study was not evident until Chapter 3, and even here, some of the questions were void of advancing depth of word knowledge, such as, "Define the word remedy."</p> <p>There are some instances in which the vocabulary study did advance depth of word knowledge. In Chapter 3, after several questions relating to the word "formidable," students are asked to "Fill in the blank with the correct form of formidable."</p> <p>Yet, vocabulary study is not prevalent throughout the materials or with each text.</p>
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of diagnostic, formative, summative and self-assessment measures for placement of students into and out of small groups and to monitor progress along the way.</p>	<p>Not Evaluated</p>	<p>The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	<p>Not Evaluated</p>	<p>The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	<p>Not Evaluated</p>	<p>The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
	<p>6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that</p>	<p>Not Evaluated</p>	<p>The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	are unbiased and accessible to all students.		criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
<p>7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 7a) Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>REQUIRED 7b) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>REQUIRED 7c) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>REQUIRED 7d) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p>7e) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
FINAL EVALUATION			
<i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.			
<i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.			
<i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	More than 90% of the English language arts texts are excerpted and teachers would need to determine the quantitative measure of texts on their own as levels are not given for individual texts. Further, there is no evidence of increasing text complexity as students move and progress throughout the program.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Materials include some authentic English language arts texts, but opportunities to build vocabulary and content knowledge is limited.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable)	N/A	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	Questions are text dependent at least 80% of the time but do not assess the complexity of the eighth grade level standards.
	6. Assessment	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>			

Appendix I.

Publisher Response

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **6-8**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

[Grade 6 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 7 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 8 \(Tier 3\)](#)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **6**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
I. Text Selection				
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10¹.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that vary in complexity levels. The provided levels are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.² Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p>	No	<p>Materials note that the texts included are "based on the CCSS" and "[were] written to the 6th grade Lexile level: 925L to 1070L."</p> <p>However, individual Lexile levels are not provided for each text. Teachers would have to determine if texts are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group on their own, using an outside source like Lexile.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress. They place an emphasis on increasing student reading ability toward or beyond their grade level.</p>	No	<p>Aside from the above blurb (found on page vii), materials do not note the Lexile level of each text. Some texts at the end of the materials are at the higher end of the Lexile band (an excerpt from L. Frank Baum's Dorothy and the Wizard of Oz in Chapter 11 has a 1020L), but the Lexile level of this text had to be found through an outside source. The materials themselves do not provide Lexiles for each text and offer no indication that individual texts increase in Lexile as the units progress.</p> <p>The Real Princess, found in in Chapter 3, has a Lexile of 850L, which is below the noted range.</p>	
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of</p>	<p>REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to practice skills that will help them master the ELA standards in the particular grade; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).</p>	No	<p>Within the student edition, texts are authored by authorities in the field. Materials include excerpts from Adventures of Tom Sawyer by Mark Twain and Twenty Thousand Leagues Under the Sea by Jules Verne, as well as poems by William Blake, Robert Frost, and Henry Wadsworth Longfellow.</p> <p>Texts from various disciplines were included, most notably in Chapters 7 and 8 (e.g. students read about lunar and</p>	

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5> or the [Supplemental Information for Appendix A](#).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<p>grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>			<p>solar eclipses, earthquakes, Mahalia Jackson, the English colonies, the Hindenburg disaster, and static electricity).</p> <p>Yet, in the chapter tests within the teacher edition, not all texts state known authors, such as an informational piece written about Harriet Tubman and a literary piece titled "Poor Fool's Gold."</p> <p>As a whole, however, materials do not always identify the author or the source, making it difficult to determine if many of the informational texts are authentic and/or if the writers are experts in the field. Further, authentic English language arts texts are limited to excerpts.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide opportunities for students to build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.</p> <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Chapter 4 is wholly dedicated to vocabulary. The table of contents notes that in Chapter 4, students will study context clues, roots and affixes, figurative language, and word choice. Throughout this chapter, students are prompted to reread sentences from previous passages and are asked "As used here, what does the word mean?" or "Based on the passage what does the word mean? Explain your answer."</p> <p>However, aside from this chapter, opportunities to build vocabulary knowledge through reading, writing, listening and speaking were not found.</p> <p>Further, opportunities to build knowledge about concepts, themes, or topics were not found. Texts do not require multiple readings and do not appear to be sequenced, scaffolded, or arranged to advance knowledge. Rather, texts and excerpts stand alone as the skills and strategies are taught in isolation.</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials include both literary and informational texts to support students in developing independent reading ability that is at or above grade level.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and build their ability to apply skills learned in small-group instruction to new texts.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)				
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop</p>	<p>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4a) Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	N/A		

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<p>proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4c) In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students’ reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>	N/A		
	<p>4f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.</p>	N/A		
	<p>4g) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.</p>	N/A		

III. Questions and Tasks

Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable
5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:
 Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.

Yes No

REQUIRED
5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.

Yes

Questions in the grade 6 materials are text-dependent at least 80% of the time and students answer in both multiple choice and short answer format.

In Chapter 1, students read two texts about jobs for young people and are then asked: "What are two drawbacks that Suzie should consider before taking a job? Use information from at least two sources to support your answer" and "Based on Suzie's schedule and interests, which job might be the best option for her?"

In the student edition, which starts with pre-tests and test-taking strategies and suggestions, most questions require students to refer back to the text. After reading "The Real Princess" by Hans Christian Andersen, in the "Exploring Texts" chapter, students answer the following question: "In the second sentence, the author uses a hyperbole, saying the prince traveled around the entire world. Why does he use this exaggerated language?" The question requires that students read the passage that includes the referenced sentence and determine what author Andersen hopes the reader infers about the prince.

In the Chapter 2 post test, students read an excerpt from A Little Princess and are asked "How might the story vary if Miss Minchin was the one telling it?" In the Chapter 3 post test, after reading "Poor Fool's Gold," students not only match the chapter to the point of view that is used, but they also analyze the writer's craft in using that point of view and are asked "What effect does Felicity's first-person narration have on the story?"

Student ideas are expressed through written responses, but evidence of spoken responses was not noted in the post tests. The only time conversation was noted was in the final chapter of the student edition, Speaking and Listening. In order to ensure that student ideas are expressed through spoken responses, a teacher using this material could use some of the questions as discussion prompts and conversation starters.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts.</p>	No	<p>There is not a coherent sequence of questions and tasks, building on the prior question until Chapter 7. In this chapter, students answer questions about eclipse seasons that build to a final task, asking students: "What reason does the author provide to explain why eclipse seasons occur only twice a year? Write a short response, and use evidence from the text to support your answer."</p> <p>This indicator is not met as there is an absence of culminating questions that ask students to synthesize their understanding from two or more passages until students reach Chapter 7's post-test.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. (<i>Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.</i>)</p>	No	<p>Questions do not assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at the sixth grade level. For example, a variety of questions use cite and summarize; however many questions do not develop the ability to require inferencing or synthesizing which are critical within the ELA standards.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 5d) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>	No	<p>Questions and tasks do not focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 5e) Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).</p>	No	<p>Vocabulary study were not evident until the Chapter 4 test. When present, the vocabulary study did advance depth of word knowledge with questions such as "Based on what you know about roots and affixes, what does the word discontented mean? Explain your answer."</p> <p>Moreover, students were asked to use word families in questions such as "The word rushing has the root word rush. Which definition of rushing would best fit how it is used in this sentence?"</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
			Still, this indicator is not met as vocabulary study is not prevelant throughout the materials or with each text.	
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 6a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of diagnostic, formative, summative and self-assessment measures for placement of students into and out of small groups and to monitor progress along the way.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	REQUIRED 6b) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	REQUIRED 6c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
IV. Scaffolding and Support				
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.	REQUIRED 7a) Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	REQUIRED 7b) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7c) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	REQUIRED 7d) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	7e) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
FINAL EVALUATION <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7. <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.				
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.				
Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments	
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Lexile levels of each text are not indicated other than the grade-level range noted in the introduction to the materials. There is no evidence of increasing text complexity as students move and progress throughout the program.	
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Materials include some authentic English language arts texts, but opportunities to build vocabulary and content knowledge through text is limited.	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	Not Evaluated		
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable)	N/A		
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	While at least 80% of questions are text dependent, they do not assess the complexity of the sixth grade level standards.	
	6. Assessment	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>				

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **7**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
I. Text Selection				
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10³.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that vary in complexity levels. The provided levels are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.⁴ Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Materials note that the texts included are "based on the CCSS" and "[were] written to the 7th grade Lexile level: 970L to 1120L."</p> <p>However, materials do not provide individual levels for each text, so it is difficult to determine whether texts vary in complexity levels without doing outside research.</p> <p>Teachers would need to conduct their own quantitative analysis using a tool such as Lexile. For example, a Lexile search of <i>The Metamorphosis</i> by Kafka in Chapter 3 has a 1340L. While this is above the reading level of the identified group, this is not true of all chapters. An excerpt from <i>The Adventures of Tom Sawyer</i> at the end of Chapter 6 has a 640L.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress. They place an emphasis on increasing student reading ability toward or beyond their grade level.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Materials do not note the Lexile level for individual texts, nor are all texts, even at the end of the materials, at the higher end of the grade 6-8 Lexile band. Further, as literary texts are excerpted, a progression of text complexity is difficult to determine.</p> <p>An excerpt from <i>The Raven</i> in Chapter 5 only contains six lines rather than the entire text. Chapter 5 there also contains an excerpt from <i>Pygmalion</i> by George Bernard Shaw that only conveys a part of one scene. While these texts in their entirety are appropriate for middle school instruction, the fact that they are only excerpted makes it difficult for a teacher to place an emphasis on increasing student ability to read on or above grade level.</p>	

³ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

⁴ The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5> or the [Supplemental Information for Appendix A](#).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2a) 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to practice skills that will help them master the ELA standards in the particular grade; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Within the student edition, literary texts are authored by authorities in the field. Materials include excerpts from <i>Treasure Island</i> by Robert Louis Stevenson and <i>The Negro</i> by W.E.B. duBois, fables by Aesop, and poems by Robert Frost and Henry Wadsworth Longfellow. Materials also include excerpts from pieces by Jack London and F. Scott Fitzgerald.</p> <p>While many literary texts in the lessons of the student edition allow students to practice skills that help them master the ELA standards as they are well-crafted and authentic, they are typically excerpted, and do not elicit sustained attention to the quality of content, language and writing produced by experts.</p> <p>Chapter tests within both the student and teacher edition, include unnamed authors and/or what appear commissioned texts (an example includes a text entitled "The Legacy at Watergate") in the teacher edition.</p> <p>As materials do not always identify the author or the source, making it difficult to determine if many of the informational texts are authentic and/or if the writers are experts in the field, and authentic English language arts texts are limited to excerpts, this indicator is not met.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2b) Materials provide opportunities for students to build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.</p> <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Chapter 4 is wholly dedicated to vocabulary. The table of contents notes that in Chapter 4, students will study context clues, roots and affixes, figurative language, and analysis of word meanings. Throughout Chapter 4, students are prompted to read small excerpts and respond to questions that build meaning, such as: "Which sentence uses the word pungent correctly?", "Based on the definition, how would a person most likely react to a pungent remark?", and "Explain how the etymology (origin) of the word relates to its various meanings."</p> <p>However, aside from this chapter, opportunities to build</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
			<p>vocabulary knowledge through reading, writing, listening and speaking were not found.</p> <p>Further, opportunities to build knowledge about concepts, themes, or topics were not found. Texts do not require multiple readings and do not appear to be sequenced, scaffolded, or arranged to advance knowledge. Rather, texts and excerpts stand alone as the skills and strategies are taught in isolation.</p>	
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials include both literary and informational texts to support students in developing independent reading ability that is at or above grade level.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and build their ability to apply skills learned in small-group instruction to new texts.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)				
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development,</p>	<p>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4a) Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p>	N/A		

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<p>syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4b) In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>	N/A		
	<p>4f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular</p>	N/A		

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
	feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.			
	4g) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	N/A		
III. Questions and Tasks				
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Despite the fact that students are asked to refer to the text on both assignments and chapter tests in the 7th grade materials, less than 80% of the questions require students to support their answers with evidence or examples.</p> <p>For example, after students read Walt Whitman's "Oh Captain! My Captain!" in the chapter 6 test, they are asked to identify a type of figurative language used in the poem and then, as a follow up question, students are asked to "Name at least three ways the poem develops this comparison." The first part of this question could be answered without referring to the text; only the second part requires text evidence.</p> <p>The following question asks students "What does the line 'our fearful trip is done' (line 1) most likely refer to?" Due to the fact that students are asked to read a short biographical article on Abraham Lincoln before this text, this is not truly a text-dependent question because it is asking students to activate prior knowledge rather than interpret the connotative meanings of words like "fearful trip." The next question asks students to determine the theme of the poem, but does not ask them to cite direct evidence to support their understanding of the theme.</p> <p>Student ideas are expressed through written responses, yet evidence of spoken responses was not noted in the post tests. The only time conversation was noted was in the final chapter of the student edition, Speaking and Listening. In order to ensure that student ideas are</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
			expressed through spoken responses, a teacher using this material could use some of the questions as discussion prompts and conversation starters.	
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts.</p>	No	<p>There is not a coherent sequence of questions and tasks, and questions included do not build on prior questions or elicit sustained attention to the texts.</p> <p>For example, after reading "The Road Not Taken" by Frost in Chapter 6, students answer some questions relating to figurative language, then answer the following question: "If a girl says, 'My dad is a real Grinch around the holidays,' she most likely means that..." which does not focus on student understanding of the text itself. This question could serve as an opening to a lesson on figurative language, but is unrelated to Frost's poem. Not all questions allow for students to prove mastery of concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts themselves.</p> <p>Moreover, in the post tests, texts do not seem to correlate with one another until Chapter 8. In other words, students answer standards-based questions, referring back to the text for textual evidence, yet there is an absence of culminating questions prompting students to synthesize their understanding from two or more passages until students reach Chapter 8's test with the following question: "How does reading both "The Carpool" and "Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. and the Civil Rights Movement" make your understanding of the topic more complete? Use your own paper to explain your answer by citing examples from the texts."</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. <i>(Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.)</i></p>	No	<p>Questions do not assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at the seventh grade level.</p> <p>For example, in Chapter 2, after listening to the audio, "A Good Day," students answer the following multiple-choice question: "What is the order of activities Daphne and Rochelle plan for their afternoon?" This does not assess the depth and complexity of RL 7.2.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 5d) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>	No	<p>Questions and tasks do not focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 5e) Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).</p>	No	<p>Vocabulary study was not evident until Chapter 3, and even here, the text-dependent question focused more on writer's craft: "The last stage direction calls for Hull to "whistle." How does this add to the meaning?"</p> <p>Yet, when present in Chapter 4, the vocabulary study did advance depth of word knowledge with questions such as "What does exclusive mean? How does knowing the meaning of roots or affixes help you determine the word's meaning?"</p> <p>This indicator is not met, however, as vocabulary study is not prevalent throughout the materials or with each text.</p>	
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of diagnostic, formative, summative and self-assessment measures for placement of students into and out of small groups and to monitor progress along the way.</p>	Not Evaluated	<p>The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<p>the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
IV. Scaffolding and Support				
<p>7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 7a) Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 7b) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 7c) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 7d) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
	level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).			
	7e) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
FINAL EVALUATION				
<i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.				
<i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.				
<i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.				
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.				
Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments	
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	More than 90% of the English language arts texts are excerpted and students do not have enough opportunities to analyze a text in its entirety. Further, there is no evidence of increasing text complexity as students move and progress throughout the program.	
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Materials include excerpts from authentic English language arts texts, as well as commissioned pieces. Opportunities to build vocabulary and content knowledge is limited.	
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable)	N/A		
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	Less than 80% of questions are text-dependent. Questions do not assess the complexity of the seventh grade level standards.	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
	6. Assessment	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>				

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Common Core in ELA**

Grade: **8**

Publisher: **American Book Company**

Copyright: **2014**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
I. Text Selection				
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10⁵.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>1a) In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that vary in complexity levels. The provided levels are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.⁶ Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p>	No	<p>Materials note that the texts included are "based on the CCSS" and "[were] written to the 8th grade Lexile level: 1010L to 1185L."</p> <p>However, individual Lexile levels are not provided for each text. Teachers would have to determine if texts are appropriate for the reading level of the identified group on their own using a tool like Lexile.</p> <p>A search for Lexiles on included texts yielded the following: The Arabian Nights in Chapter 4 has a 920L; The Prince and the Pauper which follows it has a 550L.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>1b) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress. They place an emphasis on increasing student reading ability toward or beyond their grade level.</p>	No	<p>Materials do not note the Lexile level for texts, nor are all texts, even at the end of the materials, at the higher end of the grade 6-8 Lexile band. Further, as literary texts are excerpted, a progression of text complexity is difficult to determine.</p> <p>An excerpt from A Study in Scarlet by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle at the end of Chapter 3 has a Lexile of 1050, but the materials only include a five sentence excerpt. The same can be said for a six-line excerpt from Edgar Allan Poe's "The Tell-Tale Heart" in Chapter 4. While this is an appropriate literary text for grade 8, six lines is not enough to ensure that an eighth grade student is reading on or beyond their grade level. Middle school teachers would typically study these pieces in their entirety during classtime.</p>	

⁵ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

⁶ The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5> or the [Supplemental Information for Appendix A](#).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2a) 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to practice skills that will help them master the ELA standards in the particular grade; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Within the student edition, texts are authored by authorities in the English language arts field. Materials include excerpts from Siddhartha, A Doll’s House by Henrik Ibsen and “The Widow and the Parrot” by Virginia Woolf, plays by Shakespeare, and poems by Robert Frost and Elizabeth Barrett Browning.</p> <p>Yet, in both the chapter tests within the teacher and student edition, not all texts state known authors, such as a text entitled "Fall Days and Friday Night Lights" in the teacher edition or "My Bar Mitzvah" in the student edition. As a whole, materials do not always identify the author or the source, making it difficult to determine if many of the informational texts are authentic and/or if the writers are experts in the field. For example, in the Chapter 7 of the student edition, students read a text entitled "Using an AED to save a life," yet it is unclear who authored it.</p> <p>Further, authentic English language arts texts are limited to excerpts, making it difficult to ensure that students would have enough opportunities to practice skills that would help them master the ELA standards through well-crafted, quality texts. The same can be said for many informational texts. In Chapter 6, students read a well crafted and authentic speech by Lyndon Baines Johnson ("The Great Society,") but materials only include an excerpt.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2b) Materials provide opportunities for students to build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.</p> <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Chapter 3 is wholly dedicated to vocabulary. The table of contents notes that in Chapter 3, students will study context clues, roots and affixes, figurative language, and analysis of word meanings. Throughout Chapter 3, students are prompted to read small excerpts and respond to questions such as, "Based on your knowledge of the suffix -ion, what does the word temptation mean?" Vocabulary study lessons do not build on one another. For</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
	students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text.		<p>example, students practice with isolated denotation and connotation examples in this chapter.</p> <p>Further, aside from this chapter, opportunities to build vocabulary knowledge through reading, writing, listening and speaking were not found.</p> <p>Texts do not require multiple readings and do not appear to be sequenced, scaffolded, or arranged to advance knowledge. Rather, texts and excerpts stand alone as the skills and strategies are taught in isolation.</p>	
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials include both literary and informational texts to support students in developing independent reading ability that is at or above grade level.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and build their ability to apply skills learned in small-group instruction to new texts.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)				
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development,</p>	<p>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only 4a) Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p>	N/A		

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
<p>syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4b) In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	N/A		
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>	N/A		
	<p>4f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular</p>	N/A		

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
	feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.			
	4g) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	N/A		
III. Questions and Tasks				
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</p> <p>Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	Yes	<p>80% of questions in the grade 8 materials are text-dependent and students answer in both multiple choice and short answer format.</p> <p>Even in the student edition, which starts with pre-tests and test-taking strategies and suggestions, most questions require students to refer back to the text.</p> <p>After students read “There are Such Weary Little Lines” from Cross Roads by Margaret E. Sangster, they respond to text-dependent questions such as: "What is the effect of the repetition in lines 1, 5, and 9 of the poem, and how does it compare to the narrator’s description of the siblings’ feelings in 'The Gravel Road'?"</p> <p>Student ideas are expressed through written responses, yet evidence of spoken responses was not noted in the post tests. The only time conversation was noted was in the final chapter of the student edition, Speaking and Listening. In order to ensure that student ideas are expressed through spoken responses, a teacher using this material could use some of the questions as discussion prompts and conversation starters.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>5b) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts.</p>	No	<p>Some question sets are coherent and sequenced beginning with citing evidence and transitioning to creating inferences and even establishing theme.</p> <p>This is not, however, evident throughout the materials or with each text, as many questions are asked in isolation and do not build on prior questions.</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
			For example, after reading an excerpt from <i>Twenty Thousand Leagues Under the Sea</i> by Jules Verne, students are asked to "Identify words and phrases from the text that contribute to the meaning and tone of the story" and then finally "What is the setting of this scene?" The order of the questions is not coherent nor do all of the questions allow for students to prove mastery of concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts.	
	REQUIRED 5c) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. (<i>Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.</i>)	No	Questions do not assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at the eighth grade level. For example, in Chapter 4, after reading an adapted excerpt from "The Story of the Fisherman and the Genie" from <i>The Arabian Nights</i> edited by Kate Douglas Wiggin and Nora A. Smith, students answer the following questions: "What is the primary conflict of the story?", "This conflict is an example of which type of conflict?" Similar questions are included in both the sixth and seventh grade student editions and are not aligned with the depth and complexity of the eighth grade standards.	
	REQUIRED 5d) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).	No	Questions and tasks do not focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts.	
	REQUIRED 5e) Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).	No	Vocabulary study was not evident until Chapter 3, and even here, some of the questions were void of advancing depth of word knowledge, such as, "Define the word remedy." There are some instances in which the vocabulary study did advance depth of word knowledge. In Chapter 3, after several questions relating to the word "formidable,"	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
			<p>students are asked to "Fill in the blank with the correct form of formidable."</p> <p>Yet, vocabulary study is not prevelant throughout the materials or with each text.</p>	
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of diagnostic, formative, summative and self-assessment measures for placement of students into and out of small groups and to monitor progress along the way.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p>6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
IV. Scaffolding and Support				
<p>7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and</p>	<p>REQUIRED 7a) Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight.</p>	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7b) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	REQUIRED 7c) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	REQUIRED 7d) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	7e) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
FINAL EVALUATION <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 7. <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills, Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.				
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.				
Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments	
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	More than 90% of the English language arts texts are excerpted and teachers would need to determine the quantitative measure of texts on their own as levels are not given for individual texts. Further, there is no evidence of increasing text complexity as students move and	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER COMMENTS
			progress throughout the program.	
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Materials include some authentic English language arts texts, but opportunities to build vocabulary and content knowledge is limited.	
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable)	N/A		
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	Questions are text dependent at least 80% of the time but do not assess the complexity of the eighth grade level standards.	
	6. Assessment	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Not Evaluated	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>				

Appendix II.

Public Comments

There were no public comments submitted.