

Instructional Materials Evaluation - Student Standards Review

Louisiana educators engaged in a professional review of the state’s academic standards for English language arts (ELA) and mathematics to ensure they continue to maintain strong expectations for teaching and learning aligned with college and workplace demands. The new ELA and math standards will be effective beginning with the 2016-2017 school year. As part of the Louisiana Department of Education’s support for a seamless transition to these new standards, the LDOE identified the major changes of the standards and their potential impact upon criteria used to review instructional materials.

Title: **HMD Literature**

Grade: **6-8**

Publisher: **Houghton Mifflin Harcourt**

Copyright: **2012**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, not representing quality**

This English Language Arts review has been examined for the following changes in alignment resulting from the Louisiana Student Standards Review:

- Materials do not contain references to specific authors and texts
- Include citing *relevant* textual evidence beginning in grade 6
- Include an *awareness of audience* when making speeches and delivering presentations

This review remains a Tier 3 rating. As a result of these changes, the following chart identifies the potential impact on specific elements in the current review. The LDOE recommends that district curriculum staff, principals, and teachers take these findings into consideration when using these instructional materials.

Criteria	Currently in the Rubric	Next Steps for Educators
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as “No” for this criteria because the designated texts appear to serve the theme of the unit and study and support an instructional purpose, but 90% are not scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading.	Since these materials received a “No” for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as “No” for this criteria because while questions and tasks are often text dependent, they do not always provide students with enough opportunities to engage with the more difficult passages of text. Materials emphasize breadth over depth.	Since these materials received a “No” for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Speaking and Listening	This program currently is reviewed as a “No” for this criteria because oral tasks were not always text-dependent nor were there materials for speaking and listening that reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.	Since these materials received a “No” for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: HMD Literature

Grade: 6-8

Publisher: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt

Copyright: 2012

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

[Tier I](#), [Tier II](#), [Tier III](#) elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
<u>Scaffolding and Support</u>	<u>Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)</u>
	<u>Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)</u>
	<u>Range and Volume of Texts</u>
	<u>Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)</u>
	<u>Assessment</u>
	<u>Writing to Sources</u>
	<u>Speaking and Listening</u>
	<u>Language</u>

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a “Yes” for all Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings received a “Yes” for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings received a “No” for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

[Grade 6 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 7 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 8 \(Tier 3\)](#)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: HMD Literature

Grade: 6

Publisher: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt

Copyright: 2012

Overall Rating: Tier III, not representing quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Scaffolding and Support	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Assessment
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10¹.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) Materials provide texts that <u>fall within grade-level complexity</u> bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis² were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p>	No	Materials provide texts that fall above level, on level and below level, with the range representing materials as low as 760 and as high as 1510 on the Lexile Scale. The Fry Graph and the Dale-Chall Scale were also used in selection of texts and these scales also indicate below, on, and above level texts were used. Poetry and drama have no qualitative measures noted.
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.</p>	No	There are few titles that correlate with those exemplars represented in Appendix B.
	<p>REQUIRED 1c) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	No	The texts vary in complexity but there is no apparent trend in complexity increasing across the 6 th grade band.
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level</p>	<p>REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.</p>	No	The designated texts appear to serve the theme of the unit of study and support an instructional purpose. 90% do not appear to be scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading.
	<p>REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build</p>	Yes	Materials provide a collection of texts that may build knowledge through reading, writing, listening and / or speaking about

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the [Supplement to Appendix A](#). Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.</p>		<p>topics of study.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 2c) Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There do not appear to be specific anchor texts selected for multiple, careful readings</p>
	<p>2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Nearly all texts are previously published rather than commissioned.</p>
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There is not a 50/50 balance between literature and informational text. There is a ratio of 80 literary to 54 nonfiction texts. Of the nonfiction selections, only 30 are informational and the rest are literary nonfiction.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Materials include texts of different formats: memoirs, drama, film, poetry, short story, instructional , etc.</p>
	<p>3c) Materials include <u>many informational texts</u> with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>There are few informational texts with an informational, rather than a narrative, text structure but there are literary non-fiction texts represented, such as The Dog of Pompeii and Pompeii and Vesuvius.</p>
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Limited evidence that the additional materials will truly increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading to appeal to student interests to build stamina, confidence, etc.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4a) Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>		Not Applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>		Not Applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>		Not Applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>		Not Applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.</p>		Not Applicable.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
<p>Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT--DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Throughout the materials, the majority of questions are text-dependent and require students to express their ideas in both written and oral responses.</p> <p>It should be noted, however, that there are specific passages/pieces of text that are more laden with text-dependent questions than the indicator would allow. For instance, while reading the short story “Aaron’s Gift,” students are asked “Do you find Aaron’s reaction to the boys’ plan believable? Explain?” and “Reread lines 167–183. Recall a time when you were invited to join something. Why do you think Aaron chooses to join the boys?” While reading this same short story, students are asked to “Think of a time you saw an animal in need. Why do you think Aaron decides to help Pidge?” Other than a reference to the characters in the story, these specific questions do not necessarily require that students read the text itself.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Many questions elicit sustained attention to the text by driving the student back to the text itself.</p> <p>A large majority of questions prompt students to refer back to specific lines in the text in order to answer questions, but they do not build on knowledge. They are not sequenced to deepen student understanding. They are randomized and superficial.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
	REQUIRED 5c) Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. (<i>Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.</i>)	No	While the majority of questions require that students use textual evidence in their responses and some questions do include the language of the standards, the questions do not always assess the depth and complexity required by the standards. There is not enough evidence that the majority of questions serve to advance and deepen student learning.
	5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.	Yes	This indicator is met. ‘After Reading’ questions move through the required levels of thinking and are explicitly identified as <i>comprehension, text analysis, extension and challenge</i> .
	5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.	No	Terms are typically frontloaded and/or defined for the students at the bottom and side of the page. There are not enough opportunities for students to study syntax, unpack academic language, or learn new vocabulary from reading.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 6a) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	No	There is not enough provided in <i>the textbook itself</i> for students to adequately measure their independent abilities. While there are aligned rubrics provided within the textbook that accompany ‘Writing Workshops’ where students are can evaluate their writing, the majority of supporting scaffolds are found in the ‘Online Extras’ and ‘Student Resources.’
	REQUIRED 6b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide	No	There are ‘strong’ and ‘weak’ interactive student models provided in a ‘Writing Model Bank’ and are accessible online through

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
	sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.		‘WriteSmart.’ Aside from this, however, there is not sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.
	REQUIRED 6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	Yes	While this lacks within the textbook itself, the teacher can access varied modes of assessment online through ‘Teacher Resources.’ There are both formative and summative assessments available, as well as extension activities provided in the ‘Teacher Resources’ where students are given a variety of options for demonstrating understanding of lesson concepts.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.		Not reviewed non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7a) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	Yes	Pre-reading activities precede each selection in the series. Students discuss the theme of the selection, necessary skills, upcoming vocabulary, and develop a plan to follow while reading. For example, in the short story <i>The School Play</i> by Gary Soto, students are guided to create a chart to use while they read where they record questions that they have about the selection. They are then prompted to find

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
			the answers to their own questions within the selection and record them on their charts.
	<p>REQUIRED 7b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p>	Yes	Reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight of the text. Texts and collection themes drive development of student knowledge and insight.
	<p>REQUIRED 7c) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p>	Yes	Each selection provides students with extensive opportunities to reread, discuss, and write about text. Students are guided throughout the selection to reread certain parts and think, discuss, or write about certain topics. For example, in the selection <i>Eleven</i> , students are asked to reread a section of dialogue and discuss how the characters may have reacted differently if events had been different. These responses can also be recorded in the <i>Interactive Reader</i> that accompanies the stories.
	<p>REQUIRED 7d) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.</p>	Yes	Materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for both students and teachers. All reading selections are the center of focus. The interactive tools in the online book are user-friendly and provide various forms of supplements including videos, vocabulary practice, and activities.
	<p>7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).</p>	Yes	There is a supplemental resource titled “Ideas for Extension” which provides multiple activities to support learning at multiple levels of learning. The “Best Practices Toolkit” provides teachers with multiple strategies to teach the different skills throughout the text. Each selection contains activities within the teacher edition for both struggling and AP students.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	<p>7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>In order to achieve maximum student understanding from each selection, the content cannot be reasonably completed within a regular school year. The teacher would have to select appropriate texts for the class.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
<p>8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 8a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.</p>	No	Opportunities are provided for writing tasks. Students are asked to analyze and synthesize sources, but opportunities for writing well-defined claims and drawing from textual evidence to support claims are not a writing focus throughout the text. Most writing activities are short answers in response to questions at the end of each reading selection. In order to meet the standard of writing to sources using textual evidence, teachers must pull activities that are not in the teacher’s manual, but are only occasionally available by going to supplemental materials.
	<p>REQUIRED 8b) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.</p>	Yes	There are additional writing prompts available through various supplemental materials. Opportunities are present for various modes of writing. Students do more text-based writing rather than imaginative narratives. For example, in “Ideas for Extension” supplemental material, the selection “No Thought of Reward” asks students to reread Asgedom’s speech and write a letter to the author in which they share their reactions to his message by citing specific examples from the speech.
	<p>REQUIRED 8c) Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).</p>	No	The majority of the writing activities are short answers in response to questions at the end of each reading selection. Formal essays are available but lack opportunities for peer or self-reflection. These activities are not the prominent focus of the selection.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>8d) Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.</p>	No	<p>There are opportunities for small group activities that are part of the selections. These activities are spoken in the language of the standards. Students read the text, complete a short activity where they review the selection for the answer, write a response, and share with either another group or with the class. Rubrics or guidelines are not provided to ensure that students have mastered the standards addressed within the activity. The activities end after sharing. Peer/Teacher feedback is not included within the activities.</p>
	<p>8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.</p>	No	<p>Research projects do not occur on a regular basis. If the teacher decides to include research projects, he or she must use supplemental materials that may or may not have a research activity associated with the main selection.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
<p>9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 9a) Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Some of the “extension” activities ask that students collaborate with others. Yet, there are not sole texts that are used for speaking and listening. There are text-dependent questions asked of the students within the texts and at the end of the selection, yet they do not challenge students to share those answers with one another. For example, in Unit 2, students ask questions and paraphrase. They listen carefully to a formal presentation, paraphrase the ideas, and ask specific questions. This all relates to the comparison/contrast essay wrote. Although students are asked to inform their audience to the similarities and differences between two literary texts, characters, or settings, no specific texts are named that must be utilized.</p> <p>Therefore, if students are not using specific texts or are using no texts at all, this indicator is not met. The complexity and rigor of the standards is not met.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 9b) Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others’ ideas.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There is a “Speaking and Listening” handbook for students. Speaking and listening links are also available that direct students to history.com so that they may listen to great speeches, etc. The links focus on how to be not just a great speaker but also an active listener.</p> <p>Yet, although there is some evidence that students collaborate (such as reading aloud a poem), effective and consistent engagement in conversations is not noted. They are not asked to build on one another’s ideas.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>9c) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.</p>	No	Materials do not build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts. Students only practice with academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions at the end of sections in “vocabulary” or “grammar in context” sections.
	<p>9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.</p>	No	While some ancillary materials do provide resources to assist with note-taking and questioning, these do not encourage speaking/listening components. It is not evident whether or not students will be asking relevant questions or elaborating on the remarks of others.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
<p>10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 10a) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>GrammarNotes are available for use. These are PowerPoint presentations that explain various standards in student-friendly language, such as Lesson 6: Understanding Verb Forms” and Lesson 16: Improving Spelling. The same GrammarNotes are provided for Grades 6-8 though with no differentiation.</p> <p>Different methods of grammar instruction are provided: a systematic grammar instruction as well as a more integrated grammar, writing, and literature approach. Teaching opportunities are noted within various texts as well as an accompanying grammar handbook and language handbook to use as well. Also, the grammar handbook is organized chronologically by the skills that are taught, such as using capital letters and correcting run-ons, etc.</p> <p>Writing and grammar re-teaching resources are available as well such as sentence combining: words and phrases.</p> <p>“Grammar in context” handouts are available in each unit. Moreover, there are interactive grammar tutorial videos as well as practice questions.</p> <p>However, not all of the standards build on those taught in Grades 6-8, nor do they build increasingly within these units.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 10b) Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Interactive revision lessons/resources are available for student use—allowing them to understand the grammar focus first and then revise their own writing by confronting errors,</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
			<p>editing, and revising the piece.</p> <p>Oral corrections were not noted.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 10c) Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There are “Language Coach” sections of the text that draw students to definitions and encourage them to examine the language of the texts such as speaker tags (while reading “Sootface: an Ojibwa Cinderella Story” in Unit 6), yet there is no evidence that students are asked to model the language within their own writings. These are more often tips such as: “Do not add the word <i>more</i> to the comparative form of a one-syllable word; it’s incorrect to say “more quicker.”</p> <p>There are also “vocabulary” or “grammar in context” sections at the end of most selections or throughout and revising tips are suggested or practice is suggested, such as: “Use a glossary to look up the syllabication of each of the following vocabulary words and record them in your notebook. Then, practice the pronunciation of each word by sounding the syllables out loud.”</p> <p>However, students were not consistently asked to model their own pieces after texts they have read.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 10d) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>The speaking and listening sections (page near the end of the unit) directly relates to the writing that the students are asked to do but not necessarily to the texts that the students are reading. The only connections that are evident with language do not encourage students to interact with others (just to practice interactively or revise their own</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
			pieces). The opportunities that do exist are not frequent.
	10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	Yes	Students are given real-world practice with natural language in the types of “speaking and listening” opportunities they are given, such as participating in a discussion in Unit 1

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Y/N	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Texts are selected using quantitative measures, but there are few texts that compare with the complexity of the exemplars but there is no apparent trend in complexity increasing across the grade band.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	The designated texts appear to serve the theme of the unit of study and support an instructional purpose, but 90% are not scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	No	Materials include texts of different formats: memoirs, drama, film, poetry, short story, instructional, etc., but there is not a 50/50 balance between literature and informational text.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)	N/A	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	While questions and tasks often require text-dependent responses, the materials seem to emphasize breadth over depth. Questions and tasks do not always provide students with enough opportunities to engage with the more difficult passages of text.
	6. Assessment	No	Materials do not offer enough assessment opportunities that genuinely measure student progress.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Yes	Materials provide all students with opportunities to comprehend grade level texts.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	No	Students are not given enough practice in writing to sources. Writing activities did not provide adequate discussion and research opportunities.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	No	Oral tasks were not always text-dependent nor were there always materials for speaking and listening that reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.
VII: Language	10. Language	No	Although interactive grammar tools are available, students were not expected to orally correct their grammar errors nor were they expected to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: HMD Literature

Grade: 7

Publisher: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt

Copyright: 2012

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Scaffolding and Support	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Assessment
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10¹.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis² were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p>	No	Materials provide texts that fall above level, on level and below level, with the range representing materials as low as 480 and as high as 1440 on the Lexile Scale. The Fry Graph and the Dale-Chall Scale were also used in selection of texts and these scales also indicate below, on, and above level texts were used. Poetry and drama have no qualitative measures noted.
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.</p>	No	There are few titles that correlate with those exemplars represented in Appendix B.
	<p>REQUIRED 1c) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	No	The texts vary in complexity but there is no apparent trend in complexity increasing across the 7 th grade band.
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level</p>	<p>REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.</p>	No	The designated texts appear to weakly serve the theme of the unit of study and support of the instructional purpose is unclear. 90% do not appear to be scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading.
	<p>REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build</p>	Yes	Materials provide a collection of texts that may build knowledge through reading, writing, listening and / or speaking about

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the [Supplement to Appendix A](#). Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.</p>		<p>topics of study.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 2c) Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There do not appear to be specific anchor texts selected for multiple, careful readings</p>
	<p>2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Nearly all texts are previously published rather than commissioned.</p>
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There is not a 50/50 balance between literature and informational text. There is a ratio of 84 literary to 48 nonfiction texts. Of the nonfiction selections, 31 are informational and the rest are literary nonfiction.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Materials include texts of different formats: memoirs, drama, film, poetry, short story, instructional , etc.</p>
	<p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There are few informational texts with an informational, rather than a narrative, text structure but there is literary non-fiction texts represented, such as <i>The Papers of Martin Luther King Jr.</i> and <i>Why We Shouldn't Go to Mars.</i></p>
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Limited evidence that the additional materials will truly increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading to appeal to student interests to build stamina, confidence, etc.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4a) Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>		Not applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>		Not applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>		Not applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>		Not applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.</p>		Not applicable.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
<p>Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT--DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	Yes	<p>Throughout the materials, the majority of the questions are text-dependent and require students to express their ideas in both written and oral responses.</p> <p>It should be noted, however, that questions sometimes stay at the surface of what the text explicitly says. Students are not always challenged to dig deeper into the text.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.</p>	No	<p>Students are prompted to look back at the text and its accompanying illustrations. For instance, while reading the short story “Amigo Brothers,” students are asked to view two paintings and “compare and contrast these pictures with your own mental images of Felix and Antonio” and later, compare a picture of a neighborhood with the description given in lines 98–101.</p> <p>However, even when questions are text-dependent and elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations, they do not always meet the rigor required by grade-specific standards, and they do not build on knowledge.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. (<i>Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.</i>)</p>	No	<p>The majority of questions do not include the language of the standards and there is not enough evidence that the questions will advance and deepen student learning.</p>
	<p>5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.</p>	Yes	<p>‘After Reading’ questions are found at the end of each text selection – these questions move from <i>comprehension</i>, to <i>text analysis</i>, and end on <i>extension and challenge</i>.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
	5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.	No	Terms are typically frontloaded and/or defined for the students at the bottom and side of the page. There are not enough opportunities for students to study syntax, unpack academic language, or learn new vocabulary from reading.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 6a) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	No	There is not enough provided in <i>the textbook itself</i> for students to adequately measure their independent abilities. While there are aligned rubrics provided within the textbook that accompany ‘Writing Workshops’ where students are can evaluate their writing, the majority of supporting scaffolds are found in the ‘Online Extras’ and ‘Student Resources.’ Further, when assessments are included, the questions themselves often focus on comprehension/surface level understanding.
	REQUIRED 6b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	No	Teachers can access both assessment keys as well as ‘strong’ and ‘weak’ interactive student models provided in a ‘Writing Model Bank’ through the online teacher resource, ‘WriteSmart.’ Aside from this, however, there is not sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.
	REQUIRED 6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	Yes	Even though this lacks within the textbook itself, the teacher can access varied modes of assessment online through ‘Teacher Resources.’ There are both formative and summative assessments available, as well as extension

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
			activities provided in the 'Teacher Resources' where students are given a variety of options for demonstrating understanding of lesson concepts
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.		Not reviewed non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7a) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	Yes	Pre-reading activities precede each selection in the series. Students discuss the theme of the selection, necessary skills, upcoming vocabulary, and develop a plan to follow while reading. For example, in the short story <i>The Last Dog</i> by Katherine Paterson, students are guided to create a flow chart to keep track of the sequence of important events from the story.
	REQUIRED 7b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	Yes	Reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight of the text. Texts and collection themes drive development of student knowledge and insight.
	REQUIRED 7c) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	Yes	Each selection provides students with extensive opportunities to reread and write about text. The Teacher's Edition provides targeted passages and dialogue boxes for scaffolding and support for struggling readers as well as enrichment for advanced learners. Mastery indicators are the same for all

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
			students. Rather than share ideas with the class or in small groups, these responses are recorded in the <i>Interactive Reader</i> that accompanies the stories.
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>7d) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.</p>	Yes	Materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for both students and teachers. All reading selections are the center of focus. The interactive tools in the online book are user-friendly and provide various forms of supplements including videos, vocabulary practice, and activities.
	<p>7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).</p>	Yes	There is a supplemental resource titled “Ideas for Extension” which provides multiple activities to support learning at multiple levels of learning. The “Best Practices Toolkit” provides teachers with multiple strategies to teach the different skills throughout the text. Each selection contains activities within the teacher edition for both struggling and AP students.
	<p>7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.</p>	No	In order to achieve maximum student understanding from each selection, the content cannot be reasonably completed within a regular school year. The teacher would have to select appropriate texts for the class.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
<p>8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 8a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Opportunities are provided for writing tasks. Students are asked to analyze and synthesize sources, but opportunities for writing well-defined claims and drawing from textual evidence to support claims are not a writing focus throughout the text. Most writing activities are short answers in response to questions at the end of each reading selection. In order to meet the standard of writing to sources using textual evidence, teachers must pull activities that are not in the teacher’s manual, but are only occasionally available by going to supplemental materials.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 8b) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There are additional writing prompts available through various supplemental materials. Opportunities are present for various modes of writing. Students do more imaginative narratives rather than text based description writing. Rubrics and/or scoring recommendations are not present.</p> <p>Although these activities are available, rubrics and/or scoring recommendations are not present.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 8c) Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>The majority of the writing activities are short answers in response to questions at the end of each reading selection. Formal essays are available but lack opportunities for peer or self-reflection.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 8d) Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There are opportunities for small group activities that are part of the selections. These activities are spoken in the language of the standards. Students read the text, complete a short activity where they review the selection for the answer, write a response, and share with either another</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.		group or with the class. Rubrics or guidelines are not provided to ensure that students have mastered the standards addressed within the activity. The activities end after group sharing. Peer/Teacher feedback is not included within the activities.
	8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	No	Research projects do not occur on a regular basis. If the teacher decides to include research projects, he or she must use supplemental materials that may or may not have a research activity associated with the main selection.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
<p>9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 9a) Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Some of the “extension” activities ask that students collaborate with others. Yet, there are not sole texts that are used for speaking and listening. There are text-dependent questions asked of the students within the texts and at the end of the selection, yet they do not challenge students to share those answers with one another. For example, in Unit 8, “Presenting a Persuasive Speech,” students adapt their written essay into a persuasive speech. They present their speeches to the class and listen to others (evaluating their delivery and evidence).</p> <p>Also, in Unit 4, students are asked to adapt their literary analysis into a critique. In Unit 4, the writing prompt asks that students to “Write a literary analysis in which they examine one or two elements of a literary text.” Although ideas from texts within the textbook are used, no specific text is named that must be utilized.</p> <p>Therefore, if students are not using specific texts or are using no texts at all, this indicator is not met.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 9b) Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others’ ideas.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There is a “Speaking and Listening” handbook for students. For example, one handout is entitled “Speech” and directs students to information on audience, purpose, and occasion, as well as how to write a speech. The document explains different types of oral presentations, how to actively listen, etc. Speaking and listening links are also available that direct students to history.com so that they may listen to great speeches, etc. The links focus on how to be not just a great</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
			<p>speaker but also an active listener.</p> <p>Yet, it is not noted in the student edition that students should collaborate with peers other than listening to speeches presented. They are not asked to build on one another's ideas.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>9c) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.</p>	No	<p>Materials do not build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts. Students only practice with academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions at the end of sections in "vocabulary" or "grammar in context" sections.</p>
	<p>9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.</p>	No	<p>There are audio versions of texts and even some audio summaries, such as for "The Noble Experiment" in Unit 7 where students may actively listen.</p> <p>However, other than a blurb pertaining to "listening to others" while presenting, it is not evident whether or not students will be asking relevant questions or elaborating on the remarks of others.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
<p>10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 10a) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>GrammarNotes are available for use. These are PowerPoint presentations that explain various standards in student-friendly language, such as Lesson 1: Correcting Sentence Fragments” and Lesson 15: Using End Marks. The same GrammarNotes are provided for Grades 6-8 though with no differentiation.</p> <p>Different methods of grammar instruction are provided: a systematic grammar instruction as well as a more integrated grammar, writing, and literature approach. Teaching opportunities are noted within various texts as well as an accompanying grammar handbook and language handbook to use as well. For example, in Unit One, while reading “Rikki-tikki-tavi”, a “teaching opportunity” involves pronoun-antecedent agreement.” Also, the grammar handbook is organized chronologically by the skills that are taught, such as beginning with parts of speech, progressing to verbals, etc.</p> <p>Writing and grammar re-teaching resources are available as well such as assistance with misplaced commas.</p> <p>“Grammar in context” handouts are available in each unit. Moreover, there are interactive grammar tutorial videos as well as practice questions (such as “Level Up: Fragments and Run-Ons” in Unit One).</p> <p>However, not all of the standards build on those taught in Grades 6-8, nor do they build increasingly within these units.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	<p>REQUIRED 10b) Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.</p>	No	<p>Interactive revision lessons/resources are available for student use—allowing them to understand the grammar focus first and then revise their own writing by confronting errors, editing, and revising the piece.</p> <p>Oral corrections were not noted.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 10c) Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.</p>	No	<p>There are “Language Coach” sections of the text that draw students to definitions and encourage them to examine the language of the texts (such as idioms within the nonfiction text on Eleanor Roosevelt in Unit 7, yet there is no evidence that students are asked to model the language within their own writings.</p> <p>There are also “vocabulary” or “grammar in context” sections at the end of most selections and revising tips are suggested, such as: “Review your explanation. If you missed capitalizing any proper nouns, be sure to correct them.”</p> <p>However, students were not asked to model their own pieces after texts they have read.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 10d) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.</p>	No	<p>The speaking and listening sections (page near the end of the unit) directly relates to the writing that the students are asked to do but not necessarily to the texts that the students are reading. The only connections that are evident with language do not encourage students to interact with others (just to practice interactively or revise their own pieces).</p> <p>The opportunities that do exist are not frequent.</p>
	<p>10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews,</p>	Yes	<p>Students are given real-world practice with natural language in the types of “speaking</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	presentations).		and listening” opportunities they are given, such as a persuasive podcast in Unit 1, participating in a panel discussion in Unit 2, and conducting an interview I Unit 7.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Y/N	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Texts are selected using quantitative measures, but there are few texts that compare with the complexity of the exemplars but there is no apparent trend in complexity increasing across the grade band.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	The designated texts appear to serve the theme of the unit of study and support an instructional purpose, but 90% are not scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	No	Materials include texts of different formats: memoirs, drama, film, poetry, short story, instructional, etc., but there is not a 50/50 balance between literature and informational text.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)	N/A	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	While questions and tasks are often text-dependent, they do not reflect the rigor or depth required by the standards.
	6. Assessment	No	Materials do not offer enough assessment opportunities in order to genuinely measure student progress.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Yes	Materials provide all students with opportunities to comprehend grade level texts.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	No	Students are not given enough practice in writing to sources. Writing activities did not provide adequate discussion and research opportunities.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	No	Oral tasks were not always text-dependent nor were there always materials for speaking and listening that reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.
VII: Language	10. Language	No	Although interactive grammar tools are available, students were not expected to orally correct their grammar errors nor were they expected to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier III, Not representing quality			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: HMD Literature

Grade: 8

Publisher: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt

Copyright: 2012

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

[Tier I](#), [Tier II](#), [Tier III](#) elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Scaffolding and Support	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Assessment
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10¹.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis² were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p>	No	Materials provide texts that fall above level, on level and below level, with the range representing materials as low as 700 and as high as 1400 on the Lexile Scale. The Fry Graph and the Dale-Chall Scale were also used in selection of texts and these scales also indicate below, on, and above level texts were used. Poetry and drama have no qualitative measures noted.
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.</p>	No	There are few titles that correlate with those exemplars represented in Appendix B.
	<p>REQUIRED 1c) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	No	The texts vary in complexity but there is no apparent trend in complexity increasing across the 8 th grade band. The final Units are informational text heavy and do not provide literature based reading
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level</p>	<p>REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.</p>	No	The designated texts appear to weakly serve the theme of the unit of study and support of the instructional purpose is unclear. 90% do not appear to be scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading.
	<p>REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build</p>	Yes	Materials provide a collection of texts that may build knowledge through reading,

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the [Supplement to Appendix A](#). Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.</p>		<p>writing, listening and / or speaking about topics of study.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 2c) Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.</p>	No	<p>There do not appear to be specific anchor texts selected for multiple, careful readings</p>
	<p>2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”</p>	Yes	<p>Nearly all texts are previously published rather than commissioned.</p>
<p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.</p>	No	<p>The materials do not seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. There is a ratio of 67 literary to 50 nonfiction texts. Of the nonfiction selections, 28 are informational and the rest are literary nonfiction.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.</p>	Yes	<p>The materials include texts of different formats and of different lengths. There are poems, short stories, vignettes, screenplays, interviews, biographies, and journal articles included.</p>
	<p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.</p>	Yes	<p>While there are not many informational texts, literary nonfiction is included – examples include an excerpt from Anne Frank’s diary and Gary Soto’s narrative essay ‘One Last Time.’</p>
	<p>3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students’ interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.</p>	No	<p>It is not evident that the additional materials will increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading to appeal to student interests to build stamina, confidence, etc.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4a) Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>		Not applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>		Not applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>		Not applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>		Not applicable.
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.</p>		Not applicable.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
<p>Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT--DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	Yes	<p>Throughout the materials, the majority of questions are text-dependent and require students to express their ideas in both written and oral responses. Questions often prompt students to refer back to specific lines in the text in order to answer questions.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.</p>	No	<p>Questions elicit attention to the text by driving the student back to the text itself. There are also questions that prompt students to consider accompanying illustrations.</p> <p>However, the questions are not always written at the depth and complexity that the standards require, and they do not build on knowledge. They are not sequenced to deepen student understanding. They are randomized and superficial.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. (<i>Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.</i>)</p>	No	<p>While many questions require that students use textual evidence in their responses, questions do not include the language of the standards enough to meet the indicator.</p> <p>Further, questions do not always assess the depth and complexity required by the standard and there is not enough evidence that the majority of questions serve to advance and deepen student learning.</p>
	<p>5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.</p>	Yes	<p>This indicator is met as after each text, 'After Reading' questions are scaffolded and explicitly identified as <i>comprehension, text analysis, extension and challenge</i>.</p> <p>However, it should be noted that these questions do not always assess and depth</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
			and complexity required by the standards.
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	No	<p>While questions often direct students to specific words and lines, there are not enough opportunities for students to learn new vocabulary from reading. Rather, definitions of new and/or difficult vocabulary are often provided at the side or bottom of the text.</p> <p>There is not enough provided in <i>the textbook itself</i> for students to adequately measure their independent abilities.</p> <p>While there are aligned rubrics provided within the textbook that accompany ‘Writing Workshops’ where students are can evaluate their writing, the majority of supporting scaffolds are found in the ‘Online Extras’ and ‘Student Resources.’</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	No	<p>There are ‘strong’ and ‘weak’ interactive student models provided in a ‘Writing Model Bank’ and are accessible online through ‘WriteSmart.’</p> <p>Aside from this, however, there is not sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p>	Yes	<p>While this lacks within the textbook itself, the teacher can access varied modes of assessment online through ‘Teacher Resources.’</p> <p>There are both formative and summative assessments available, as well as extension activities provided in the ‘Teacher Resources’ where students are given a variety of options</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
			for demonstrating understanding of lesson concepts.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.		Not reviewed non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7a) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	Yes	Pre-reading activities precede each selection in the series. Students discuss the theme of the selection, necessary skills, upcoming vocabulary, and develop a plan to follow while reading. For example, in the short story <i>The Tell-Tale Heart</i> by Edgar Allan Poe, students are guided to create a chart to use while they read where they record clues that reveal whether the narrator is reliable or not.
	REQUIRED 7b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	Yes	Reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight of the text. Texts and collection themes drive development of student knowledge and insight.
	REQUIRED 7c) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	Yes	Each selection provides students with extensive opportunities to reread and write about text. The Teacher’s Edition provides targeted passages and dialogue boxes for scaffolding and support for struggling readers as well as enrichment for advanced learners. Mastery indicators are the same for all students. Rather than share ideas with the

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
			class or in small groups, these responses are recorded in the <i>Interactive Reader</i> that accompanies the stories.
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>7d) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.</p>	Yes	Materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for both students and teachers. All reading selections are the center of focus. The interactive tools in the online book are user-friendly and provide various forms of supplements including videos, vocabulary practice, and activities.
	<p>7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).</p>	Yes	There is a supplemental resource titled “Ideas for Extension” which provides multiple activities to support learning at multiple levels of learning. The “Best Practices Toolkit” provides teachers with multiple strategies to teach the different skills throughout the text. Each selection contains activities within the teacher edition for both struggling and AP students.
	<p>7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.</p>	No	In order to achieve maximum student understanding from each selection, the content cannot be reasonably completed within a regular school year. The teacher would have to select appropriate texts for the class.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
<p>8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 8a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Opportunities are provided for writing tasks. Students are asked to analyze and synthesize sources, but opportunities for writing well-defined claims and drawing from textual evidence to support claims are not a writing focus throughout the text. Most writing activities are short answers in response to questions at the end of each reading selection. In order to meet the standard of writing to sources using textual evidence, teachers must pull activities that are not in the teacher’s manual, but are only available by going to supplemental materials.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 8b) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There are additional writing prompts available through various supplemental materials. Opportunities are present for various modes of writing. Students do more imaginative narratives rather than text based description writing. Rubrics and/or scoring recommendations are not present.</p> <p>Although these activities are available, rubrics and/or scoring recommendations are not present.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 8c) Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>The majority of the writing activities are short answers in response to questions at the end of each reading selection. Formal essays are available but lack opportunities for peer or self-reflection.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 8d) Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>There are opportunities for small group activities that are part of the selections. These activities are spoken in the language of the standards. Students read the text, complete a short activity where they review the selection for the answer, write a response, and share with either another group or with the class. Although the</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	peer review checklist.		activities are present, students are not able to gain feedback on their work. Rubrics or guidelines are not provided to ensure that students have mastered the standards addressed within the activity. The activities end after sharing, so that peer/teacher feedback is not included within the activities.
	8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	No	Research projects do not occur on a regular basis. If the teacher decides to include research projects, he or she must use supplemental materials that may or may not have a research activity associated with the main selection.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
<p>9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 9a) Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).</p>	No	<p>Some of the “extension” activities ask that students collaborate with others. Yet, there are not sole texts that are used for speaking and listening. There are text-dependent questions asked of the students within the texts and at the end of the selection, yet they do not challenge students to share those answers with one another. For example, in Unit 6, after writing a Literary Analysis (“in which you analyze a literary text that you have enjoyed. Assume that your audience includes people who have and have not read the text”), students are asked to “Adapt your literary analysis into an oral response.”</p> <p>No specific text is named that must be utilized.</p> <p>Therefore, if students are not using specific texts or are using no texts at all, this indicator is not met.</p> <p>While speaking and listening questions are included, they do not address the complexity and rigor of the standards.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 9b) Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others’ ideas.</p>	No	<p>There is a “Speaking and Listening” handbook for students. The document explains different types or oral presentations, how to actively listen, etc. Speaking and listening links are also available for students. The links focus on how to be not just a great speaker but also an active listener.</p> <p>Yet, it is not noted in the student edition that students should collaborate with peers other than listening to speeches presented. They</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
			are not asked to build on one another's ideas.
	<p>REQUIRED 9c) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.</p>	No	Materials do not build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts. Students only practice with academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions at the end of sections in "vocabulary" or "grammar in context" sections.
	<p>9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.</p>	No	While some ancillary materials do provide resources to assist with note-taking and questioning, it is not evident whether or not students will be asking relevant questions or elaborating on the remarks of others.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS	
VII. Language				
<p>10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 10a) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>GrammarNotes are available for use. These are PowerPoint presentations that explain various standards in student-friendly language, such as Lesson 1: Correcting Sentence Fragments and Lesson 15: Using End Marks. The same GrammarNotes are provided for Grades 6-8 though with no differentiation.</p> <p>Teaching opportunities are noted within various texts as well as an accompanying grammar handbook and language handbook to use as well.</p> <p>However, not all of the standards build on those taught in Grades 6-8, nor do they build increasingly within these units. For example, in Unit 2, students are avoiding misplaced modifiers; whereas, in Unit 4, they are capitalizing correctly.</p> <p>Writing and grammar re-teaching resources are available. Moreover, “grammar in context” handouts are available in each unit. Furthermore, there are interactive grammar tutorial videos as well as practice questions.</p>	
	<p>REQUIRED 10b) Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.</p>		<p>No</p>	<p>Interactive revision lessons/resources are available for student use—allowing them to understand the grammar focus first and then revise their own writing by confronting errors, editing, and revising the piece.</p> <p>Oral corrections were not noted.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED 10c) Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to</p>		<p>No</p>	<p>There are “Language Coach” sections of the text that draw students to definitions and encourage them to examine the language of the texts (such as prefixes within “The</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.		<p>“Monkey’s Paw” within Unit 3), yet there is no evidence that students are asked to model the language within their own writings.</p> <p>There are also “vocabulary” or “grammar in context” sections at the end of most selections and revising tips are suggested. For example, while reading “The Snapping Turtle” in Unit 7, students are told: “This sentence contains both a subordinate clause and a main clause. Notice that the subordinate clause cannot stand alone as a sentence. The main clause can.” However, students were not asked to model their own pieces after texts they have read.</p>
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>10d) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.</p>	No	<p>The speaking and listening sections (page near the end of the unit) directly relates to the writing that the students are asked to do but not necessarily to the texts that the students are reading. The only connections that are evident with language do not encourage students to interact with others (just to practice interactively or revise their own pieces).</p> <p>The opportunities that do exist are not frequent.</p>
	<p>10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).</p>	Yes	<p>Students are given real-world practice with natural language in the types of “speaking and listening” opportunities they are given, such as in Unit 6, presenting a response to literature and in Unit 10, giving and listening to an informative speech.</p>

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Y/N	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Texts are selected using quantitative measures, but there are few texts that compare with the complexity of the exemplars. There is no apparent trend in complexity increasing across the grade band.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	The designated texts appear to serve the theme of the unit of study and support an instructional purpose, but 90% are not scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	No	Materials include literacy nonfiction as well as texts of different formats, but there is not a 50/50 balance between literature and informational text.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)	N/A	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	While questions and tasks often require text-dependent responses, the materials seem to emphasize breadth over depth. Questions and tasks do not always provide students with enough opportunities to engage with the more difficult passages of text.
	6. Assessment	No	Materials do not offer enough assessment opportunities that genuinely measure student progress.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	Yes	Materials provide all students with opportunities to comprehend grade level texts.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	No	Students are not given enough practice in writing to sources. Writing activities did not provide adequate discussion and research opportunities.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	No	Oral tasks were not always text-dependent nor were there always materials for speaking and listening that reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.
VII: Language	10. Language	No	Although interactive grammar tools are available, students were not expected to orally correct their grammar errors nor were they expected to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier III, Not representing quality			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)