

Instructional Materials Evaluation - Student Standards Review

Louisiana educators engaged in a professional review of the state’s academic standards for English language arts (ELA) and mathematics to ensure they continue to maintain strong expectations for teaching and learning aligned with college and workplace demands. The new ELA and math standards will be effective beginning with the 2016-2017 school year. As part of the Louisiana Department of Education’s support for a seamless transition to these new standards, the LDOE identified the major changes of the standards and their potential impact upon criteria used to review instructional materials.

Title: **Shurley English**

Grade: **3-6**

Publisher: **Shurley Instructional Materials, Inc.**

Copyright: **2013**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

This English Language Arts review has been examined for the following changes in alignment resulting from the Louisiana Student Standards Review:

- Materials do not contain references to specific authors and texts
- Include citing *relevant* textual evidence beginning in grade 6
- Include an *awareness of audience* when making speeches and delivering presentations

This review remains a Tier 3 rating. As a result of these changes, the following chart identifies the potential impact on specific elements in the current review. The LDOE recommends that district curriculum staff, principals, and teachers take these findings into consideration when using these instructional materials.

Criteria	Currently in the Rubric	Next Steps for Educators
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as “No” for this criterion because although the program includes added units on literature, there is not enough text to support a rich and well-crafted selection and meet the indicator. Texts are not all content-rich and well-crafted as this is primarily a language program.	Since these materials received a “No” for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as “No” for these criteria because at least 80% of all questions in the materials are not text-dependent questions as required by the indicator; there are not enough texts to elicit a wide selection of text-dependent questions.	Since these materials received a “No” for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Speaking and Listening	This program currently is reviewed as “No” for this criterion because texts do not meet the criteria for complexity, quality, or range.	

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: Shurley English

Grade: 3-6

Publisher: Shurley Instructional Materials, Inc.

Copyright: 2013

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

[Tier I](#), [Tier II](#), [Tier III](#) elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Assessment	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a “Yes” for all Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings received a “Yes” for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings received a “No” for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

[Grade 3 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 4 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 5 \(Tier 3\)](#)

[Grade 6 \(Tier 3\)](#)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: Shurley English Level 3

Grade: 3

Publisher: Shurley Instructional Materials, Inc.

Copyright: 2013

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Assessment	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10¹.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis² were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p>	No	Materials fall well within grade-level complexity; however, student interaction with text is limited to pages U47-U114. In these pages only 5 short poems, one short story, and one commissioned drama are provided for student practice. Pages 1-836 contain instruction on discrete language, writing, and vocabulary skills.
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.</p>	No	Students have some interaction with texts. However not enough texts to satisfy this indicator. This is primarily a language-based program
	<p>REQUIRED 1c) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	Yes	The passages and grade selections meet this indicator; however, this is primarily a language based program.
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and</p>	<p>REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.</p>	No	There are some poetry selections, brief passages, selections and outlines, however texts are not all content rich and well-crafted as this is a language program. Most selections are informational. The few included texts serve as a platform to practice discrete skills instead of models of quality, content-rich writing.
	<p>REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.</p>	Yes	There are collections of articles and brief text selections that build through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics under study. There is a unit on research.

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the [Supplement to Appendix A](#). Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 2c) Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	No	No specific anchor text are selected for multiple, careful readings, as this program is focused on language and writing standards
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”	No	Although there are few poems and a short story that are previously published, the materials are commissioned language exercises and a commissioned drama.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9 , RL.9-10.6 , RI.7.7 , or RI.11-12.9). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	No	Because this is primarily a language and writing program, most selections are informational. There are nine poems, one story, and a short play.
	REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	No	Materials use jingles to teach skills, but there is no audio, film or much art to supplement the study of texts. The units in the back of the materials attempt to address different formats, but there is not a substantial amount to warrant a “yes” for this indicator.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	Yes	Passages are mostly informational. Students are taught differences between fiction and nonfiction.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	No	Although suggestions for independent reading are made, there are not enough text selections to meet this indicator for regular, accountable independent reading of texts to build reading stamina.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4a) Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	Yes	Student materials provide a firm understanding of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills. This is taught via lessons.
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	Yes	Materials encourage students to use strategies taught for self-correct, word recognition and reading for meaning, as well as analyzing and comprehending.
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	Yes	Power Words provides practice in word study. Most lessons have the following components: Word time, Jingle Time, grammar time and assessment. There is a chapter on research near end of grade materials.
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>	No	Materials are primarily language and writing based and will not achieve reading fluency.
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.</p>	Yes	Although not the basis of the materials, passages, selections and articles do guide students to read for purpose and understanding at grade-level.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
<p>Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT--DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	No	Not enough texts to meet this criterion for text-dependent questions
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.</p>	No	Not enough text selections to meet this indicator. This program is primarily language with writing focus.
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. <i>(Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.)</i></p>	Yes	Questions do not use the language of the standards or assess the depth and complexity required by the standards.
	<p>5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.</p>	No	Few begin with comprehension of text because the materials do not have many texts, mostly brief selections and passages.
	<p>5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.</p>	Yes	Although sections of the materials are devoted to vocabulary, these studies are discrete and not related to complex text. The few text selections do not include enough questions for students to determine meaning from texts in learning new vocabulary from reading.
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	Yes	Yes, this is noted throughout the student workbook. Student engagement and involvement in measuring their abilities is apparent in the student rubrics in the workbook.
	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	Yes	Rubrics are aligned with assessment guidelines and scoring guides plus student work exemplars are provided.
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p>	Yes	Pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures are provided as well as assessments to prepare for standardized tests.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	Yes	Accessible to all students.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
<p>7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 7a) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p>	No	There are no specific pre-reading activities to engage students in understanding text. Strategies are taught, but they are not focused on frequent opportunities for engagement with texts
	<p>REQUIRED 7b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p>	No	This primarily a language and writing program, but the supplemental units on analyzing literature do substitute a mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text. Strategies and definitions are front loaded with few, if any, examples of text for students to comprehend and analyze.
	<p>REQUIRED 7c) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p>	No	Strategies are taught; however, materials do not direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text for rereading.
	<p>REQUIRED 7d) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.</p>	Yes	Materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out each page adds to students learning
	<p>7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student</p>	Yes	Modifications suggestions given as well as scaffolding approaches and remediation strategies.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).		
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	Yes	The materials and student workbook are designed to be completed within an academic school year.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
<p>8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 8a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.</p>	No	Although there is one chapter on writing a research report, most written tasks do not require students to analyze and synthesize sources, present careful analysis, well-defended claims or draw on textual evidence. For example, the writing assignment prompts for the Poetry unit ask students to “look up lore information” about the author and write an informational paragraph, look up other poems by the author and pick the one they like best , or write their own poem using the same theme.
	<p>REQUIRED 8b) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.</p>	Yes	Tasks noted that are aligned to some of the modes of writing as well as some blended modes. Students write a thematic comparison, a descriptive paragraph, a research report, and a persuasive essay.
	<p>REQUIRED 8c) Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).</p>	Yes	Students write notes, essays, research and short answer responses. Frequent writing opportunities varied in length and time demands and are prominent.
	<p>REQUIRED 8d) Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.</p>	No	Materials do not meet this indicator based discrete skill and strategy instruction. The integration of text to connect writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards is not the focus of these materials. Strategies for analyzing text are taught separately.
	<p>8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.</p>	Yes	Short research projects are included as well as a chapter on writing a research report.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 9a) Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	No	The selections, articles and passages do not meet the criteria for complexity, range and quality of texts.
	REQUIRED 9b) Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	Yes	Students are engaged and collaboration through conversation by expressing well supported ideas through discussion and building on other's ideas noted.
	REQUIRED 9c) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	No	Materials do not build on connections between speaking and listening, writing and reading and the language standards. This is a primarily language based program with a focus on writing.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	Yes	Materials develop active listening skills such as main idea and asking relevant questions addressed during research.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
<p>10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 10a) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.</p>	Yes	Language Standards at each grade level build from previous grade.
	<p>REQUIRED 10b) Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.</p>	Yes	Students are expected to analyze, confront and correct their error patterns in their writing.
	<p>REQUIRED 10c) Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.</p>	Yes	Although the materials do not contain full or previously published texts in the chapters, short paragraphs and sentences are given for students to model their own writing. Students are encouraged to examine the language of these sentences to improve their own writing. (i.e. language iPower vocabulary, sentences and structure addressed).
	<p>REQUIRED 10d) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.</p>	No	Although the materials make connection between language standards, writing, and speaking and listening, the focus of this program is not on reading. The program is not integrated, but rather Unit Studies are included as an addendum.
	<p>10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).</p>	Yes	Yes, real word activities for students to practice with natural language are included.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Y/N	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	The program does include added units on literature, but there is enough text to support a rich and well-crafted selection and meet indicator.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Better quality, however texts are not all content rich and well-crafted as this is primarily a language program.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	No	Limited range and volume of texts to build reading fluency.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)	No	Students will not achieve reading fluency as with this program alone, It is primarily a language based program with focus on writing.
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	Not enough texts to elicit a wide selection of text-dependent questions. Program is primarily language.
	6. Assessment	Yes	Yes, pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures noted, also assessments for preparation for standardized tests.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	No	A few texts, articles, passages, poems, strategies are taught but not enough focused and frequent opportunities for regular student engagement with texts
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	No	Writing tasks in the materials are not always text-dependent and no real connection between writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards is made.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	No	Texts do not meet the criteria for complexity, quality or range.
VII: Language	10. Language	No	Although materials provide rigorous language lessons there no real connection between writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: Shurley English Level 4

Grade: 4

Publisher: Shurley Instructional Materials, Inc.

Copyright: 2013

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Assessment	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:</p> <p>Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10¹.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>1a) Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis² were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p>	No	Materials fall well within grade-level complexity; however, student interaction with text is limited to pages U45-U120. In these pages only 6 short poems, one short story, two folktales, and one commissioned drama are provided for student practice. Pages 1 -786 contain instruction on discrete language, writing, and vocabulary skills.
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>1b) Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.</p>	No	Students have some interaction with texts. However not enough texts to satisfy this indicator. This is primarily a language-based program
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>1c) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	Yes	The passages and grade selections meet this indicator; however, this is primarily a language based program.
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</p> <p>2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:</p> <p>Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and</p>	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2a) 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.</p>	No	There are some poetry selections, brief passages, selections and outlines, however texts are not all content rich and well-crafted as this is a language program. Most selections are informational. The few included texts serve as a platform to practice discrete skills instead of models of quality, content-rich writing.
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>2b) Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.</p>	Yes	There are collections of articles and brief text selections that build through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics under study. There is a unit on research.

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the [Supplement to Appendix A](#). Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 2c) Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	No	No specific anchor text are selected for multiple, careful readings, as this program is focused on language and writing standards
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”	No	Although there are few poems and a short story that are previously published, the materials are commissioned language exercises and a commissioned drama.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9 , RL.9-10.6 , RI.7.7 , or RI.11-12.9). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	No	Because this is primarily a language and writing program, most selections are informational. There are nine poems, one story, and a short play.
	REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	No	Materials use jingles to teach skills, but there is no audio, film or much art to supplement the study of texts. The units in the back of the materials attempt to address different formats, but there is not a substantial amount to warrant a “yes” for this indicator.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	Yes	Passages are mostly informational. Students are taught differences between fiction and nonfiction.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	No	Although suggestions for independent reading are made, there are not enough text selections to meet this indicator for regular, accountable independent reading of texts to build reading stamina.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4a) Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	Yes	Students materials provide a firm understanding of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills this is taught via lessons.
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	Yes	Materials encourage students to use strategies taught for self-correct, word recognition and reading for meaning, as well as analyzing and comprehending.
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	Yes	Power Words provides practice in word study. Most lessons have the following components: Word time, Jingle Time, grammar time and assessment. There is a chapter on research near end of grade materials.
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>	No	Materials are primarily language and writing based and will not achieve reading fluency.
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.</p>	Yes	Although not the basis of the materials, passages, selections and articles do guide students to read for purpose and understanding at grade-level.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
<p>Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT--DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	No	Not enough texts to meet this criterion for text-dependent questions
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.</p>	No	Not enough text selections to meet this indicator. This program is primarily language with writing focus.
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. <i>(Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.)</i></p>	No	Questions do not use the language of the standards or assess the depth and complexity required by the standards.
	<p>5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.</p>	No	Few begin with comprehension of text because the materials do not have many texts, mostly brief selections and passages.
	<p>5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.</p>	No	Although sections of the materials are devoted to vocabulary, these studies are discrete and not related to complex text. The few text selections do not include enough questions for students to determine meaning from texts in learning new vocabulary from reading.
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	Yes	Yes, this is noted throughout the student workbook. Student engagement and involvement in measuring their abilities is apparent in the student rubrics in the workbook.
	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	Yes	Rubrics are aligned with assessment guidelines and scoring guides plus student work exemplars are provided.
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p>	Yes	Pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures are provided as well as assessments to prepare for standardized tests.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	Yes	Accessible to all students.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7a) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	No	There are no specific pre-reading activities to engage students in understanding text. Strategies are taught, but they are not focused on frequent opportunities for engagement with texts
	REQUIRED 7b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	No	This primarily a language and writing program, but the supplemental units on analyzing literature do substitute a mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text. Strategies and definitions are front loaded with few, if any, examples of text for students to comprehend and analyze.
	REQUIRED 7c) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	No	Strategies are taught; however, materials do not direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text for rereading.
	REQUIRED 7d) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	Yes	Materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out each page adds to students learning
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student	Yes	Modifications suggestions given as well as scaffolding approaches and remediation strategies.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).		
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	Yes	The materials and student workbook are designed to be completed within an academic school year.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
<p>8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 8a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.</p>	No	Although there is one chapter on writing a research report, most written tasks do not require students to analyze and synthesize sources, present careful analysis, well-defended claims or draw on textual evidence. For example, the writing assignment prompts for the Poetry unit ask students to “look up lore information” about the author and write an informational paragraph, look up other poems by the author and pick the one they like best , or write their own poem using the same theme.
	<p>REQUIRED 8b) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.</p>	Yes	Tasks noted that are aligned to some of the modes of writing as well as some blended modes. Students write a thematic comparison, a descriptive paragraph, a research report, and a persuasive essay.
	<p>REQUIRED 8c) Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).</p>	Yes	Students write notes, essays, research and short answer responses. Frequent writing opportunities varied in length and time demands and are prominent.
	<p>REQUIRED 8d) Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.</p>	No	Materials do not meet this indicator based discrete skill and strategy instruction. The integration of text to connect writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards is not the focus of these materials. Strategies for analyzing text are taught separately.
	<p>8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.</p>	Yes	Short research projects are included as well as a chapter on writing a research report.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 9a) Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	No	The selections, articles and passages do not meet the criteria for complexity, range and quality of texts.
	REQUIRED 9b) Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	Yes	Students are engaged and collaboration through conversation by expressing well supported ideas through discussion and building on other's ideas noted.
	REQUIRED 9c) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	No	Materials do not build on connections between speaking and listening, writing and reading and the language standards. This is a primarily language based program with a focus on writing.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	Yes	Materials develop active listening skills such as main idea and asking relevant questions addressed during research.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
<p>10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 10a) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.</p>	Yes	Language Standards at each grade level build from previous grade.
	<p>REQUIRED 10b) Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.</p>	Yes	Students are expected to analyze, confront and correct their error patterns in their writing.
	<p>REQUIRED 10c) Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.</p>	Yes	Although the materials do not contain full or previously published texts in the chapters, short paragraphs and sentences are given for students to model their own writing. Students are encouraged to examine the language of these sentences to improve their own writing. (i.e. language iPower vocabulary, sentences and structure addressed).
	<p>REQUIRED 10d) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.</p>	No	Although the materials make connection between language standards, writing, and speaking and listening, the focus of this program is not on reading. The program is not integrated, but rather Unit Studies are included as an addendum.
	<p>10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).</p>	Yes	Yes, real word activities for students to practice with natural language are included.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Y/N	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	The program does include added units on literature, but there is enough text to support a rich and well-crafted selection and meet indicator.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Better quality, however texts are not all content rich and well-crafted as this is primarily a language program.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	No	Limited range and volume of texts to build reading fluency.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)	No	Students will not achieve reading fluency as with this program alone, It is primarily a language based program with focus on writing.
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	Not enough texts to elicit a wide selection of text-dependent questions. Program is primarily language.
	6. Assessment	Yes	Yes, pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures noted, also assessments for preparation for standardized tests.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	No	A few texts, articles, passages, poems, strategies are taught but not enough focused and frequent opportunities for regular student engagement with texts
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	No	Writing tasks in the materials are not always text-dependent and no real connection between writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards is made.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	No	Texts do not meet the criteria for complexity, quality or range.
VII: Language	10. Language	No	Although materials provide rigorous language lessons there no real connection between writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: Shurley English Level 5

Grade: 5

Publisher: Shurley Instructional Materials, Inc.

Copyright: 2013

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Assessment	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10 ¹ . <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 1a) Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis ² were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.	No	Materials fall well within grade-level complexity; however, student interaction with text is limited to pages U45-U131. In these pages only 9 short poems, one short story, and one commissioned drama are provided for student practice. Pages 1-772 contain instruction on discrete language, writing, and vocabulary skills.
	REQUIRED 1b) Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B .	No	Students have some interaction with texts. However not enough texts to satisfy this indicator. This is primarily a language-based program
	REQUIRED 1c) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	Yes	The passages and grade selections meet this indicator; however, this is primarily a language based program.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and	REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.	No	There are some poetry selections, brief passages, selections and outlines, however texts are not all content rich and well-crafted as this is a language program. Most selections are informational. The few included texts serve as a platform to practice discrete skills instead of models of quality, content-rich writing.
	REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.	Yes	There are collections of articles and brief text selections that build through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics under study. There is a unit on research.

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the [Supplement to Appendix A](#). Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 2c) Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	No	No specific anchor text are selected for multiple, careful readings, as this program is focused on language and writing standards
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”	No	Although there are few poems and a short story that are previously published, the materials are commissioned language exercises and a commissioned drama.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9 , RL.9-10.6 , RI.7.7 , or RI.11-12.9). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	No	Because this is primarily a language and writing program, most selections are informational. There are nine poems, one story, and a short play.
	REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	No	Materials use jingles to teach skills, but there is no audio, film or much art to supplement the study of texts. The units in the back of the materials attempt to address different formats, but there is not a substantial amount to warrant a “yes” for this indicator.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	Yes	Passages are mostly informational. Students are taught differences between fiction and nonfiction.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	No	Although suggestions for independent reading are made, there are not enough text selections to meet this indicator for regular, accountable independent reading of texts to build reading stamina.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4a) Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	Yes	Student materials provide a firm understanding of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills. This is taught via lessons.
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	Yes	Materials encourage students to use strategies taught for self-correct, word recognition and reading for meaning, as well as analyzing and comprehending.
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	Yes	Power Words provides practice in word study. Most lessons have the following components: Word time, Jingle Time, grammar time and assessment. There is a chapter on research near end of grade materials.
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>	No	Materials are primarily language and writing based and will not achieve reading fluency.
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.</p>	Yes	Although not the basis of the materials, passages, selections and articles do guide students to read for purpose and understanding at grade-level.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
<p>Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT--DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	No	Not enough texts to meet this criterion for text-dependent questions
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.</p>	No	Not enough text selections to meet this indicator. This program is primarily language with writing focus.
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. <i>(Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.)</i></p>	No	Questions do not use the language of the standards or assess the depth and complexity required by the standards.
	<p>5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.</p>	No	Few begin with comprehension of text because the materials do not have many texts, mostly brief selections and passages.
	<p>5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.</p>	No	Although sections of the materials are devoted to vocabulary, these studies are discrete and not related to complex text. The few text selections do not include enough questions for students to determine meaning from texts in learning new vocabulary from reading.
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	Yes	Yes, this is noted throughout the student workbook. Student engagement and involvement in measuring their abilities is apparent in the student rubrics in the workbook.
	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	Yes	Rubrics are aligned with assessment guidelines and scoring guides plus student work exemplars are provided.
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p>	Yes	Pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures are provided as well as assessments to prepare for standardized tests.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	Yes	Accessible to all students

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7a) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	No	There are no specific pre-reading activities to engage students in understanding text. Strategies are taught, but they are not focused on frequent opportunities for engagement with texts
	REQUIRED 7b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	No	This primarily a language and writing program, but the supplemental units on analyzing literature do substitute a mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text. Strategies and definitions are front loaded with few, if any, examples of text for students to comprehend and analyze.
	REQUIRED 7c) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	No	Strategies are taught; however, materials do not direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text for rereading.
	REQUIRED 7d) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	Yes	Materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out each page adds to students learning
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student	Yes	Modifications suggestions given as well as scaffolding approaches and remediation strategies.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).		
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	Yes	The materials and student workbook are designed to be completed within an academic school year.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
<p>8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 8a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.</p>	No	Although there is one chapter on writing a research report, most written tasks do not require students to analyze and synthesize sources, present careful analysis, well-defended claims or draw on textual evidence. For example, the writing assignment prompts for the Poetry unit ask students to “look up lore information” about the author and write an informational paragraph, look up other poems by the author and pick the one they like best , or write their own poem using the same theme.
	<p>REQUIRED 8b) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.</p>	Yes	Tasks noted that are aligned to some of the modes of writing as well as some blended modes. Students write a thematic comparison, a descriptive paragraph, a research report, and a persuasive essay.
	<p>REQUIRED 8c) Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).</p>	Yes	Students write notes, essays, research and short answer responses. Frequent writing opportunities varied in length and time demands and are prominent.
	<p>REQUIRED 8d) Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.</p>	No	Materials do not meet this indicator based discrete skill and strategy instruction. The integration of text to connect writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards is not the focus of these materials. Strategies for analyzing text are taught separately.
	<p>8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.</p>	Yes	Short research projects are included as well as a chapter on writing a research report.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 9a) Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	No	The selections, articles and passages do not meet the criteria for complexity, range and quality of texts.
	REQUIRED 9b) Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	Yes	Students are engaged and collaboration through conversation by expressing well supported ideas through discussion and building on other's ideas noted.
	REQUIRED 9c) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	No	Materials do not build on connections between speaking and listening, writing and reading and the language standards. This is a primarily language based program with a focus on writing.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	Yes	Materials develop active listening skills such as main idea and asking relevant questions addressed during research.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
<p>10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 10a) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.</p>	Yes	Language Standards at each grade level build from previous grade.
	<p>REQUIRED 10b) Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.</p>	Yes	Students are expected to analyze, confront and correct their error patterns in their writing.
	<p>REQUIRED 10c) Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.</p>	Yes	Although the materials do not contain full or previously published texts in the chapters, short paragraphs and sentences are given for students to model their own writing. Students are encouraged to examine the language of these sentences to improve their own writing. (i.e. language iPower vocabulary, sentences and structure addressed).
	<p>REQUIRED 10d) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.</p>	No	Although the materials make connection between language standards, writing, and speaking and listening, the focus of this program is not on reading. The program is not integrated, but rather Unit Studies are included as an addendum.
	<p>10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).</p>	Yes	Yes, real word activities for students to practice with natural language are included.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Y/N	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	The program does include added units on literature, but there is enough text to support a rich and well-crafted selection and meet indicator.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Better quality, however texts are not all content rich and well-crafted as this is primarily a language program.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	No	Limited range and volume of texts to build reading fluency.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)	No	Students will not achieve reading fluency as with this program alone, It is primarily a language based program with focus on writing.
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	Not enough texts to elicit a wide selection of text-dependent questions. Program is primarily language.
	6. Assessment	Yes	Yes, pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures noted, also assessments for preparation for standardized tests.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	No	A few texts, articles, passages, poems, strategies are taught but not enough focused and frequent opportunities for regular student engagement with texts
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	No	Writing tasks in the materials are not always text-dependent and no real connection between writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards is made.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	No	Texts do not meet the criteria for complexity, quality or range.
VII: Language	10. Language	No	Although materials provide rigorous language lessons there no real connection between writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: Shurley English Level 6

Grade: 6

Publisher: Shurley Instructional Materials, Inc.

Copyright: 2013

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

[Tier I](#), [Tier II](#), [Tier III](#) elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Assessment	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10¹.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 1a) Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis² were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p>	No	Materials fall well within grade-level complexity; however, student interaction with text is limited to pages U43-U151. In these pages only 7 short poems, one short story, one fairy tale, and one commissioned drama are provided for student practice. Pages 1 -787 contain instruction on discrete language, writing, and vocabulary skills.
	<p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.</p>	No	Students have some interaction with texts. However not enough texts to satisfy this indicator. This is primarily a language-based program
	<p>REQUIRED 1c) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	Yes	The passages and grade selections meet this indicator; however, this is primarily a language-based program.
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge</p>	<p>REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.</p>	No	Although the 6th grade program does include a folktale and fairytale section, only one text is included in these sections. There is not enough text to support a rich and well-crafted selection and meet indicator. The few included texts serve as a platform to practice discrete skills instead of models of quality, content-rich writing.
	<p>REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build</p>	Yes	There are collections of article and brief text selections that build through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics under study.

¹ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the [Supplement to Appendix A](#). Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
(ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.		There is a unit on research.
	REQUIRED 2c) Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	No	No specific anchor text is selected for multiple, careful readings, as this program is focused on language and writing standards
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”	No	Although there are few poems and a short story that are previously published, the materials are commissioned language exercises and a commissioned drama.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9 , RL.9-10.6 , RI.7.7 , or RI.11-12.9). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	No	Because this is primarily a language and writing program, most selections are informational. There are seven poems, one story, a fairy tale and a short play.
	REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	No	Materials use jingles to teach skills, but there is no audio, film or much art to supplement the study of texts. The units in the back of the materials attempt to address different formats, but there is not a substantial amount to warrant a “yes” for this indicator.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	Yes	Passages are mostly informational. Students are taught differences between fiction and nonfiction.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	No	Although suggestions for independent reading are made, there are not enough text selections to meet this indicator for regular, accountable independent reading of texts to build reading stamina.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
<p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p>	<p>REQUIRED 4a) Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>		
	<p>REQUIRED 4b) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>		
	<p>REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>		
	<p>REQUIRED 4d) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.</p>		
	<p>REQUIRED 4e) Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.</p>		

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
<p>Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT--DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	No	Not enough texts to meet this criterion for text-dependent questions
	<p>REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.</p>	No	Not enough text selections to meet this indicator. This program is primarily language with writing focus.
	<p>REQUIRED 5c) Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. <i>(Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.)</i></p>	No	Questions do not use the language of the standards or assess the depth and complexity required by the standards.
	<p>5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.</p>	No	Few begin with comprehension of text because the materials do not have many texts, mostly brief selections and passages.
	<p>5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.</p>	No	Although sections of the materials are devoted to vocabulary, these studies are discrete and not related to complex text. The few text selections do not include enough questions for students to determine meaning from texts in learning new vocabulary from reading.
<p>6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 6a) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	Yes	Yes, this is noted throughout the student workbook. Student engagement and involvement in measuring their abilities is apparent in the student rubrics in the workbook.
	<p>REQUIRED 6b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	Yes	Rubrics are aligned with assessment guidelines and scoring guides plus student work exemplars are provided.
	<p>REQUIRED 6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p>	Yes	Pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures are provided as well as assessments to prepare for standardized tests.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	Yes	Materials are accessible to all students.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 7a) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	No	There are no specific pre-reading activities to engage students in understanding text. Strategies are taught, but they are not focused on frequent opportunities for engagement with texts
	REQUIRED 7b) Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	No	This primarily a language and writing program, but the supplemental units on analyzing literature do substitute a mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text. Strategies and definitions are front loaded with few, if any, examples of text for students to comprehend and analyze.
	REQUIRED 7c) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	No	Strategies are taught; however, materials do not direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text for rereading.
	REQUIRED 7d) The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	Yes	Materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out each page adds to students learning
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student	Yes	Modifications suggestions given as well as scaffolding approaches and remediation strategies.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).		
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	Yes	The materials and student workbook are designed to be completed within an academic school year.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 8a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.	No	Although there is one chapter on writing a research report, most written tasks do not require students to analyze and synthesize sources, present careful analysis, well-defended claims or draw on textual evidence. For example, the writing assignment prompts for the Poetry unit ask students to “look up lore information” about the author and write an informational paragraph, look up other poems by the author and pick the one they like best , or write their own poem using the same theme.
	REQUIRED 8b) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	Yes	Tasks noted that are aligned to some of the modes of writing as well as some blended modes. Students write a thematic comparison, a descriptive paragraph, a research report, and a persuasive essay.
	REQUIRED 8c) Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	Yes	Students write notes, essays, research and short answer responses. Frequent writing opportunities varied in length and time demands and are prominent.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	<p>REQUIRED</p> <p>8d) Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.</p>	No	Materials do not meet this indicator based discrete skill and strategy instruction. The integration of text to connect writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards is not the focus of these materials. Strategies for analyzing text are taught separately.
	<p>8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.</p>	Yes	Short research projects are included as well as a chapter on writing a research report.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	REQUIRED 9a) Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	No	The selections, articles and passages do not meet the criteria for complexity, range and quality of texts.
	REQUIRED 9b) Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	Yes	Students are engaged and collaboration through conversation by expressing well supported ideas through discussion and building on other's ideas noted.
	REQUIRED 9c) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	No	Materials do not build on connections between speaking and listening, writing and reading and the language standards. This is a primarily language based program with a focus on writing.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	Yes	Materials develop active listening skills such as main idea and asking relevant questions addressed during research.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
<p>10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>REQUIRED 10a) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.</p>	Yes	Language Standards at each grade level build from previous grade.
	<p>REQUIRED 10b) Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.</p>	Yes	Students are expected to analyze, confront and correct their error patterns in their writing.
	<p>REQUIRED 10c) Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.</p>	Yes	Although the materials do not contain full or previously published texts in the chapters, short paragraphs and sentences are given for students to model their own writing. Students are encouraged to examine the language of these sentences to improve their own writing. (i.e. language iPower vocabulary, sentences and structure addressed).
	<p>REQUIRED 10d) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.</p>	No	Although the materials make connection between language standards, writing, and speaking and listening, the focus of this program is not on reading. The program is not integrated, but rather Unit Studies are included as an addendum.
	<p>10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).</p>	Yes	Yes, real word activities for students to practice with natural language are included.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Y/N	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	The 6th grade program does include a folktale and fairytale section. I do not think there is enough text to support a rich and well-crafted selection and meet indicator.
	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	No	Better quality, however texts are not all content rich and well-crafted as this is primarily a language program.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	No	Limited range and volume of texts to build reading fluency.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)	N/A	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	No	Not enough texts to elicit a wide selection of text-dependent questions. Program is primarily language.
	6. Assessment	Yes	Yes, pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures noted, also assessments for preparation for standardized tests.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	No	A few texts, articles, passages, poems, strategies are taught but not enough focused and frequent opportunities for regular student engagement with texts
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	No	Writing tasks in the materials are not always text-dependent and no real connection between writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards is made.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	No	Texts do not meet the criteria for complexity, quality or range.
VII: Language	10. Language	No	Although materials provide rigorous language lessons there no real connection between writing, speaking, listening and reading and the language standards.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier III, Not representing quality			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)