



The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.<sup>1</sup> In grades K-5, programs must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts<sup>2</sup> independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: Reading Roots 4th Edition

Grade: 1

Publisher: Success for All Foundation

Copyright: 2012

Overall Rating: Tier III, Not representing quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	1. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	4. Coherence of Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 8 may not apply.)

**Tier 1 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 8.

**Tier 2 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Quality of Texts, Foundational Skills (as applicable), Coherence of Tasks, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

**Tier 3 ratings** receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

<sup>1</sup> A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

<sup>2</sup> A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<b>Section I. Text Selection</b>			
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b></p> <p><b>1. QUALITY OF TEXTS:</b></p> <p>Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to (1) advance students toward independent reading of grade-level texts and (2) build content knowledge (e.g., ELA, social studies, science, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>1a)</b> In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.<sup>3</sup> Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p>	Yes	<p>Each Reading Roots lesson includes an anchor text for the STaR (Story Telling and Retelling) component. The majority of these texts have a higher Lexile level than expected for the grade, making them appropriate for read alouds. These texts are used to develop vocabulary knowledge, oral language, and comprehension skills. Students discuss and respond to story-related questions that focus on comprehension, drawing conclusions, and making predictions. Texts in this curriculum include: Level 1, Lesson 6, Birds by Caroline Arnold, Level 2, Lesson 16, Farmer Duck by Martin Waddell, Level 3, Lesson 26, Dear Mr. Blueberry by Simon James, Level 4, Lesson 38, Living in the Arctic, by Allan Fowler.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>1b)</b> At least 90% of texts are authentic<sup>4</sup> and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines.</p>	Yes	<p>At least 90% of the texts are authentic. The texts are carefully chosen based on topics for each of the lessons. The texts include professionally published literary and informational texts. Some stories are award winning texts, including, Lon Po Po, Mufaro's Beautiful Daughters, and Anansi.</p>

<sup>3</sup> The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5>. More information may be found in the Louisiana Believes Documents: “[Guide for Determining Text Complexity](#)” and “[Creating Text Sets for Whole-Class Instruction](#)”

<sup>4</sup> Authentic texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>1c)</b> Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about topics, themes, and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <p>Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.</p> <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about topics, themes, and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <p><b>1d)</b> Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	<p><b>No</b></p> <p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>A STaR anchor text is used as an interactive read aloud with students for each lesson. Tier 3 vocabulary as well as comprehension questions accompany each STaR anchor text. Each lesson is three days, which includes the STaR text and a paired text for shared reading. This text relates to the anchor text in topic. However, each set of texts is only used for three days, not connected to any other text. Texts do not build themes or knowledge, aside from a common topic. For example, Lesson 10, Level 1 Volume B, the anchor text, "Jamaica Louise James" is an authentic text about an eight-year-old painter. The shared story is, "The Painters", a text that is not authentic, but used for phonics practice. Even though both texts include painters, these topics are not used to build knowledge about a theme. The phonics and phonemic awareness skills are not taught using a collection of connected texts. These skills are isolated before stories are introduced each day. Another level, Level 4, is introduced with "We are beginning a new group of stories about different places in the world." There is no theme related to the broad topic. Texts are loosely connected.</p> <p>The read aloud texts vary in complexity. There is an increase in complexity as the units continue over the course of the program. For example, in Volume 2, "Buster" is a 420 Lexile. In Volume 3, "Three Billy Goats Gruff" is a 500 Lexile and Volume 4 contains "What Lives in the Arctic" with a Lexile of 740. The shared stories and concepts of print stories do increase in complexity as they follow a phonics pattern progression to prepare students to be ready to read.</p>
<p><b>2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS:</b> Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the <a href="#">standards (e.g. RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4,</a></p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>2a)</b> In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the</p>	<p><b>Not Evaluated</b></p>	<p>This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p><a href="#">RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels.</a></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	appropriate balance.)		
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>2b)</b> Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p><b>2c)</b> Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p><b>2d)</b> Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
<b>Section II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)</b>			
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</b>  <b>3. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:</b>  Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only</b>  <b>3a)</b> Materials follow a sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p>	<b>Yes</b>	The Scope and Sequence provided shows that all Louisiana State Standards for Foundational Skills are not only a focus, but continuously practiced throughout the levels. The Fast Track Phonics component at the beginning of each day addresses foundational skills.
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3b)</b> In grades K-2, materials include engaging, content-rich, and phonetically controlled student texts that allow for systematic, explicit, and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>	<b>No</b>	Most of the phonics skills are taught through key cards and practice tests. For example, Lesson 16 in Level 2, the phonemics awareness skills are mostly taught through the use of picture cards, Cami puppet, Reading Reels for Roots DVD, Partner Practice Booklet, word cards, and key cards (see page 2 of the Level 2 manual). Although there are paired texts provided for phonics practice, they are not content rich and provide general information on disconnected topics. Engaging, content-rich texts are not provided for students to frequently practice foundational skills.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No  *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3c)</b> In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words, including high-frequency words, by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English.</p> <p><i>(Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.)</i></p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>	Yes	<p>The Fast Track Phonics component is included all three days for each lesson. These systematic lessons provide instruction and practice in pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes, and sound/spelling patterns. Decoding of grade-level words and high frequency words are also taught through the Fast Track Phonics component. See Level 2 manual for Lesson 16, pages 2-8 (Day 1), 16-18 (Day 2), and 24-25 (Day 3).</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3d)</b> Materials encourage students to self-monitor and to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	Yes	<p>During the Shared Stories component, students partner read and initial each other's books once words have been read correctly. Shared Stories also contain "Readles" to help students clarify word meaning. Strategies for self-monitoring and partner help are taught. Level 3, Lesson 27 on pages 41-43 students are encouraged to write down letter or letter groups they are struggling with. Students are taught to work with their partner.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3e)</b> Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of grade-appropriate prose, poetry, and informational texts with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression. This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness, and accuracy.</p>	Yes	<p>The Shared Stories component allow students to partner read in effort to achieve reading fluency. Also, beginning in Level 4, added Fluency Flyers are included. See page xxvii in the introduction of Level 4.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3f)</b> Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>The Shared Stories allow opportunities for students to read grade-level text and make connections between foundational skills and making meaning from reading. The shared stories share a common topic with the anchor STaR text. The shared stories are dedicated to students practicing phonic skills.</p> <p>In Level 2, Lesson 13, after the Fast Track Phonics component provides instruction on -ed and -ing endings, students use the shared story "The Field Trip" to practice foundational skills. The teacher begins with Word Presentation, students then complete Partner Word and Sentence Read. The students participate in Guided Group/Guided Partner Readers. This is followed by discussion questions for comprehension. The students then listen to a read aloud "The Ant and the Elephant, focusing on the same topic. Students get to make connections between the two texts.</p>
	<p><b>3g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only</b>  Materials provide opportunities for teachers to assess students' mastery of foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students based on ongoing assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>Each teacher's manual for all Levels includes assessment practices. For Level 2, see pages 410-425. There are Fast Track Phonics Assessments, Oral Language Observations, and recording forms.</p>
	<p><b>3h)</b> Materials provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>The beginning of each manual charts exactly what materials teachers will need to complete the daily lessons. All materials are provided for teachers to effectively prepare for all lessons.</p>
<p><b>Section III. Questions and Tasks</b></p>			
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b>  <b>4. COHERENCE OF TASKS:</b>  Materials contain meaningful, connected tasks that build student knowledge and provide opportunities for students to read, understand, and express</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>4a)</b> Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the texts. Questions and tasks are developed so that students build knowledge and</p>	<p><b>No</b></p>	<p>Tasks for each STaR story make connections with its paired text, focusing on the same topic. However, connections are not made among texts in the collection. Questions and tasks demonstrate basic understanding of the anchor and paired texts, but they do not build knowledge or understanding of themes across the unit. For example, in Level 3, there is no</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>understanding of complex texts through speaking and listening, and writing. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, so that students can gain meaning from text.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>skill over the course of the unit.</p>		<p>theme or major topic introduced. The lesson titles move from Dear Mr. Blueberry, The Three Billy Goats Gruff, Trosclair and the Alligator, Trees Around the World, and Baking a Wonderful Wacky Cake, etc. These are unrelated topics. Each topic and its vocabulary are only used for three days. In Level 4, it is noted that the STaR stories for this unit will all cover different parts of the world. Stories include, Living in the Arctic, Rehema's Journey, We're from Brazil, Country Kid, City Kid, and What is in the Ocean? Even these titles move from Countries to Ocean life, not staying on the same topic. In Lesson 38 for Level 4, "Living in the Arctic," is used as an expository text. On Day 1, students preview the book, discuss text features, and reference the shared story. An interactive read aloud with comprehension questions follow. Students write a sentence using STaR vocabulary words. On Day 2, there is a review of the story using discussion questions. Students focus on the main idea and key details from the text. Students compare and contrast The Arctic to their hometown. Day 2 ends with students writing about their favorite parts of the book. On Day 3, students use both texts to write about the Arctic. These questions and tasks do not build on question and tasks from other text lessons to build knowledge of the Arctic or a theme.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>4b)</b> Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>Although questions and tasks do not build knowledge over the course of the unit, students are expected to express understanding through reading, writing, speaking and listening, and language. The STaR grade level texts are designed for students to build and apply knowledge in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language. Reading Roots focuses on oral language and vocabulary during the STaR and Shared Story components. Students discuss stories through Think Pair Share. Students also participate in partner reads during Day 1 and 2 with the Shared Story. Students</p>



CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>4c)</b> Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2; questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.) and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>	<p><b>No</b></p>	<p>complete writing tasks using both stories on Day 3.</p> <p>Although questions and tasks include STaR vocabulary, these words are only used for each 3-day lesson. There is no opportunity to see multiple repetitions of words in varied context. Vocabulary words are a large focus. However, word families and other relationships among words are not evident through the STaR tasks. For example, in Level 2 Lesson 20 of the manual, the teacher introduces "STaR words." Students are asked to repeat the words after the teacher and listen to the definitions of the words. The teacher asked comprehension questions, some connected to vocabulary and text, some disconnected, such as "Who has a brother or sister?" The STaR vocabulary words are only discussed on Day 1. Students are encouraged on Day 2 and Day 3 to use the words in their writing; However, after the 3-day lesson, these words are not reintroduced using other texts.</p>
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b>  <b>5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</b>  Text-dependent and text-specific questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>5a)</b> A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>During the STaR component in the lesson, several comprehension questions are asked. For example, in Level 3, Lesson 26 for "Dear Mr. Blueberry," the following questions are asked:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr. Blueberry wrote a letter to answer Emily's question. What does Mr. Blueberry tell Emily in his letter?</li> <li>- Emily wrote another letter to Mr. Blueberry telling him that she put salt in the pond every day. Why did Emily put salt in the pond? Why do you think Emily asks Mr. Blueberry if he thinks the whale is lost?</li> <li>- Why did Mr. Blueberry tell Emily that the whale couldn't be lost?</li> <li>- Emily writes to Mr. Blueberry that she saw her whale jump and spurt water. Is this something that could be real, or is this a fantasy that Emily imagines?</li> <li>- Mr. Blueberry answered Emily's questions about blue whales and what whales eat. He told her again that she couldn't have a whale in her pond. Why did he tell her</li> </ul>



CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			that? After the STaR comprehension discussion there is a STaR writing, asking students to use two of the tier 3 vocabularies from the story to write their own sentence.
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>5b)</b> Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. <i>(Note: not every standard must be addressed with every text.)</i></p>	<b>Yes</b>	<p>Questions and tasks include the language of the Louisiana State Standards. For example, students are asked about the main idea of texts. Students are also encouraged to ask and answer questions using who, what, when, where, and why using text evidence. Examples from Level 3, Lesson 16 include:  Page 5: "Let's preview the story." (RI.1.7)  "The title of the story is ..."  Page 7: "That dot is called a period." (L.1.2b)  Page 14: "Answer a question about our story with a complete sentence." (RL.1.1, SL.1.2)  Page 17: The use and introduction of "fluency flyers" (RF.1.4)  Page 22: "I want to include three kinds of information in my message." (W.1.2)  Each lesson follows the same order allowing for several repetitions of the standards throughout the program.</p>
<p><b>6. WRITING TO SOURCES, SPEAKING AND LISTENING, AND LANGUAGE:</b>  The majority of tasks are text-dependent or text-specific, reflect the writing genres named in the standards, require communication skills for college and career readiness, and help students meet the language standards for the grade.</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>6a)</b> Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to listen, speak, and write about their understanding of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2; those opportunities are prominent, varied in length and time demands (e.g., informal peer conversations, note taking, summary writing, discussing and writing short-answer responses, whole-class formal discussions, shared writing, formal essays in different genres, on-demand and process writing, etc.), and require students to engage effectively, as determined by the grade-level standards.</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p><b>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only</b>  <b>6b)</b> A vast majority of oral and written tasks at all grade levels</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<p>require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well-defended claims and clear information, using grade-level language and conventions and drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.</p>		
	<p><b>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only</b>  <b>6c)</b> Materials address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>6d)</b> Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. For example, as students progress through the grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s).</p> <p>In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing). For example, materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p><b>6e)</b> Materials provide models for writing and student exemplars to support writing development in English language arts.</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<p><b>6f)</b> Materials explicitly address the grammar and language conventions specified by the language standards at each grade level and build on those standards from previous grade levels through application and practice of those skills in the context of reading and writing about unit texts. For example, materials create opportunities for students to analyze the syntax of a quality text to determine the text’s meaning and model their own sentence construction and writing after texts as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and usage.</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p><b>7. ASSESSMENTS:</b> Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>7a)</b> Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.</p>	<p><b>Not Evaluated</b></p>	<p>This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>7b)</b> Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	<p><b>Not Evaluated</b></p>	<p>This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>7c)</b> Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.</p>	<p><b>Not Evaluated</b></p>	<p>This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
	<p><b>7d)</b> Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.</p>	<p><b>Not Evaluated</b></p>	<p>This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
<p><b>Section IV. Scaffolding and Support</b></p>			
<p><b>8. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT:</b> Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>8a)</b> Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.</p>	<p><b>Not Evaluated</b></p>	<p>This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>8b)</b> Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p>	<p><b>Not Evaluated</b></p>	<p>This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>8c)</b> Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p>	<p><b>Not Evaluated</b></p>	<p>This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>8d)</b> The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<b>8e)</b> Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, reteaching strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	<b>8f)</b> The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

#### FINAL EVALUATION

**Tier 1 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 8.

**Tier 2 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Quality of Texts, Foundational Skills (as applicable), Coherence of Tasks, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

**Tier 3 ratings** receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

**Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.**

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I. Text Selection	1. Quality of Texts ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>No</b>	Although each Level or Unit contains books relating to the same topic, themes are not evident. Also, there are not enough opportunities to read their own related texts frequently.
	2. Range and Volume of Texts	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)	3. Foundational Skills ( <b>Non-Negotiable*</b> )	<b>No</b>	Engaging, content-rich texts are not presented for students to practice foundational skills.
III: Questions and Tasks	4. Coherence of Tasks ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>No</b>	Aside from the Shared Stories students use with partners, there are not enough other opportunities for students to examine language and vocabulary.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	5. Text-Dependent Questions ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>Yes</b>	Questions used for comprehension are text-dependent, encouraging students to site evidence from the text. The STaR story relates to the Shared story in topic.
	6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7. Assessments	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	8. Scaffolding and Support	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <b>Tier III, Not representing quality</b>			

\*As applicable

Appendix I.

Publisher Response

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, programs must build students’ knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.<sup>1</sup> In grades K-5, programs must also build students’ foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts<sup>2</sup> independently. Thus, a strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.



Title: **Reading Roots 4th Edition**

Grade: **1**

Publisher: **Success for All Foundation**

Copyright: **2012**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

**Tier I, Tier II, Tier III** Elements of this review:

<b>STRONG</b>	<b>WEAK</b>
5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	1. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	4. Coherence of Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 8 may not apply.)

**Tier 1 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 8.

**Tier 2 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Quality of Texts, Foundational Skills (as applicable), Coherence of Tasks, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

**Tier 3 ratings** receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

<sup>1</sup> A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

<sup>2</sup> A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.



CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
<b>Section I. Text Selection</b>				
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b></p> <p><b>1. QUALITY OF TEXTS:</b></p> <p>Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to (1) advance students toward independent reading of grade-level texts and (2) build content knowledge (e.g., ELA, social studies, science, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>1a)</b> In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.<sup>3</sup> Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p>	Yes	<p>Each Reading Roots lesson includes an anchor text for the STaR (Story Telling and Retelling) component. The majority of these texts have a higher Lexile level than expected for the grade, making them appropriate for read alouds. These texts are used to develop vocabulary knowledge, oral language, and comprehension skills. Students discuss and respond to story-related questions that focus on comprehension, drawing conclusions, and making predictions. Texts in this curriculum include: Level 1, Lesson 6, Birds by Caroline Arnold, Level 2, Lesson 16, Farmer Duck by Martin Waddell, Level 3, Lesson 26, Dear Mr. Blueberry by Simon James, Level 4, Lesson 38, Living in the Arctic, by Allan Fowler.</p>	
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>1b)</b> At least 90% of texts are authentic<sup>4</sup> and offer rich opportunities for students to meet the grade-level ELA standards; the texts are well-crafted, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines.</p>	Yes	<p>At least 90% of the texts are authentic. The texts are carefully chosen based on topics for each of the lessons. The texts include professionally published literary and informational texts. Some stories are award winning texts, including, Lon Po Po, Mufaro's Beautiful Daughters, and Anansi.</p>	

<sup>3</sup> The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5>. More information may be found in the Louisiana Believes Documents: “[Guide for Determining Text Complexity](#)” and “[Creating Text Sets for Whole-Class Instruction](#)”

<sup>4</sup> Authentic texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
<p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>1c)</b> Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about topics, themes, and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p> <p>Within a sequence or collection, quality texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.</p> <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about topics, themes, and ideas through tasks in reading, writing, listening, speaking, and language.</p>	<p><b>No</b></p>	<p>A STaR anchor text is used as an interactive read aloud with students for each lesson. Tier 3 vocabulary as well as comprehension questions accompany each STaR anchor text. Each lesson is three days, which includes the STaR text and a paired text for shared reading. This text relates to the anchor text in topic. However, each set of texts is only used for three days, not connected to any other text. Texts do not build themes or knowledge, aside from a common topic. For example, Lesson 10, Level 1 Volume B, the anchor text, "Jamaica Louise James" is an authentic text about an eight-year-old painter. The shared story is, "The Painters", a text that is not authentic, but used for phonics practice. Even though both texts include painters, these topics are not used to build knowledge about a theme. The phonics and phonemic awareness skills are not taught using a collection of connected texts. These skills are isolated before stories are introduced each day. Another level, Level 4, is introduced with "We are beginning a new group of stories about different places in the world." There is no theme related to the broad topic. Texts are loosely connected.</p>	<p>In Reading Roots, Shared Stories and STaR stories share an equally important role in the lesson, but it is important to think about the Shared Story as the main student text in the lesson, while the STaR story is the listening comprehension text. Shared Stories are not just meant for phonics practice, but are the means by which beginning readers learn to read. They present students with stories they can easily decode through the letters they have learned, sight words, and readles. The STaR texts accompany the Shared Stories to build off the theme of the Shared Story and provide students opportunities to listen to more complex vocabulary and fluent oral reading.</p> <p>Reading Roots creates broad themes through the Shared Stories and STaR stories across all levels to build background knowledge on a variety of topics. These themes are nature, culture and community, exploration and discovery, personal accomplishment, and our nation. For example, nature as a theme can be seen in Level 1 Lesson 6 Miss Sid Meets Sad Sam/Birds, Level 2 Lesson 17 Bug Alert!/Head Louse, and Level 3 Lesson 37 Planting Seeds in May/Camille and the Sunflowers. The theme of exploration and discovery is seen in Level 1 Lesson 13 The Field Trip/The Ant and the Elephant, Level 2 Lesson 16 The Class Trip/Farmer Duck, Level 3 Lesson 30 Cupcakes/Baking a Wonderful Wacky Cake, and Level 4 Lesson 38 The Land of the Midnight Sun/Living in the Arctic.*</p> <p>In order to prepare students for reading at the second grade level, Reading Roots Level 4 Shared Stories serve as a bridge between the simpler texts of levels 1–3 and the more complex texts students will read in grade 2. Level 4 texts build themes across lessons through the Shared Stories. For example, Lesson 38 The Land of the Midnight Sun tells about what a boy learns at his grandparents' home in the Arctic region of Sweden. This is followed by Lesson 39 The Three Wishes, which</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
				<p>is a folktale from Sweden. Lesson 46 Pen Pals in the U.S.A. tells about the different experiences of two American children, while lessons 47 and 48 provide two folktales from American culture. Lesson 47 How Turtle Flew South for the Winter is a Native American folktale and Lesson 48 Paul Bunyan's Pancakes is an American folktale.*</p> <p>The phonics and phonemic awareness lessons from FastTrack Phonics and the Shared Stories build throughout the year. Shared Stories are designed to be decodable, mostly using words containing phonemes that students have already learned through FastTrack Phonics. As students progress through each Shared Story, the number of phonemes that can appear in those stories increases, so that students are constantly reviewing the sounds and letters they have already learned while decoding words with the new focus letter for each story. For example, the focus letters for Lesson 4 Show and Tell is "d," Lesson 5 A Card for Dad is "t," Lesson 6 Miss Sid Meets Sad Sam is "i," and Lesson 7 The Ice Cream Man is "n." The story text for The Ice Cream Man contains all of the previously learned letters for review, and focuses on words containing the letter "n."*</p> <p>*See the RR4 Dropbox Publisher Response-Appeal 3-17-17 for titles.</p>
	<p><b>1d)</b> Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>The read aloud texts vary in complexity. There is an increase in complexity as the units continue over the course of the program. For example, in Volume 2, "Buster" is a 420 Lexile. In Volume 3, "Three Billy Goats Gruff" is a 500 Lexile and Volume 4 contains "What Lives in the Arctic" with a Lexile of 740.</p> <p>The shared stories and concepts of print stories do increase in complexity as they follow a phonics pattern progression to prepare students to be ready to read.</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
<p><b>2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS:</b> Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the <a href="#">standards (e.g. RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4, RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels.)</a></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>2a)</b> In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the appropriate balance.)</p>	Not Evaluated	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>2b)</b> Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).</p>	Not Evaluated	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p><b>2c)</b> Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p>	Not Evaluated	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<p><b>2d)</b> Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.</p>	Not Evaluated	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
<b>Section II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)</b>				
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</b> <b>3. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:</b> Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only</b> <b>3a)</b> Materials follow a sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p>	Yes	The Scope and Sequence provided shows that all Louisiana State Standards for Foundational Skills are not only a focus, but continuously practiced throughout the levels. The Fast Track Phonics component at the beginning of each day addresses foundational skills.	
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>3b)</b> In grades K-2, materials include engaging, content-rich, and phonetically controlled student texts that allow for systematic, explicit, and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced.  In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level</p>	No	Most of the phonics skills are taught through key cards and practice tests. For example, Lesson 16 in Level 2, the phonemics awareness skills are mostly taught through the use of picture cards, Cami puppet, Reading Reels for Roots DVD, Partner Practice Booklet, word cards, and key cards (see page 2 of the Level 2 manual). Although there are paired texts provided for	Reading Roots focuses on beginning reading skills, since many students enter first grade with limited reading ability. As students practice making sound-letter-word correspondence between the FastTrack Phonics and Shared Story activities, they listen to content-rich and engaging texts during STaR. Shared Stories are designed to review and use information

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
<p>designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p>	<p>phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p>		<p>phonics practice, they are not content rich and provide general information on disconnected topics. Engaging, content-rich texts are not provided for students to frequently practice foundational skills.</p>	<p>learned during FastTrack Phonics, and each story has a focus letter. During Shared Story, students engage in the texts through Guided Partner Reading, where the teacher provides context and background for students as they read. The Shared Story texts are simple and focused on the letters and words students have already learned to help students gain confidence in reading and help them accelerate quickly. Reading more complex texts can be too challenging and daunting for many beginning readers, and they get frustrated by words they cannot read or sound out. The Shared Stories provide that controlled environment for students to practice reading. In Level 4, students begin to have Read and Respond homework, where they read books of their own choosing at home and share their thoughts about the book at school. This gives students who are becoming stronger and more independent readers opportunities to select content-rich texts to read on their own. Success for All uses aggressive placement to make sure students are placed at reading levels that will challenge them appropriately. First grade students who are assessed at a second grade reading level can be ready to move onto Success for All's elementary reading program, Reading Wings 4th Edition, by the 3rd or 4th quarter of the school year. This ensures that students who are ready to independently read more challenging texts will be placed appropriately and have those opportunities.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3c)</b> In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words, including high-frequency words, by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>The Fast Track Phonics component is included all three days for each lesson. These systematic lessons provide instruction and practice in pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes, and sound/spelling patterns. Decoding of grade-level words and high frequency words are also taught through the Fast Track Phonics component. See Level 2 manual for Lesson 16, pages 2-8 (Day 1), 16-18 (Day 2), and 24-25 (Day 3).</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
	<p><i>(Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.)</i></p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p>			
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3d)</b> Materials encourage students to self-monitor and to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.</p>	Yes	<p>During the Shared Stories component, students partner read and initial each other's books once words have been read correctly. Shared Stories also contain "Readles" to help students clarify word meaning. Strategies for self-monitoring and partner help are taught. Level 3, Lesson 27 on pages 41-43 students are encouraged to write down letter or letter groups they are struggling with. Students are taught to work with their partner.</p>	
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3e)</b> Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of grade-appropriate prose, poetry, and informational texts with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression. This should include monitoring that will allow students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness, and accuracy.</p>	Yes	<p>The Shared Stories component allow students to partner read in effort to achieve reading fluency. Also, beginning in Level 4, added Fluency Flyers are included. See page xxvii in the introduction of Level 4.</p>	
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3f)</b> Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.</p>	Yes	<p>The Shared Stories allow opportunities for students to read grade-level text and make connections between foundational skills and making meaning from reading. The shared stories share a common topic with the anchor STaR text. The shared stories are dedicated to students practicing phonic skills.</p> <p>In Level 2, Lesson 13, after the Fast Track Phonics component provides instruction on -ed and -ing endings, students use the shared story "The Field Trip"</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
			to practice foundational skills. The teacher begins with Word Presentation, students then complete Partner Word and Sentence Read. The students participate in Guided Group/Guided Partner Readers. This is followed by discussion questions for comprehension. The students then listen to a read aloud "The Ant and the Elephant, focusing on the same topic. Students get to make connections between the two texts.	
	<p><b>3g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only</b> Materials provide opportunities for teachers to assess students' mastery of foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students based on ongoing assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.</p>	Yes	Each teacher's manual for all Levels includes assessment practices. For Level 2, see pages 410-425. There are Fast Track Phonics Assessments, Oral Language Observations, and recording forms.	
	<p><b>3h)</b> Materials provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.</p>	Yes	The beginning of each manual charts exactly what materials teachers will need to complete the daily lessons. All materials are provided for teachers to effectively prepare for all lessons.	
<b>Section III. Questions and Tasks</b>				
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b> <b>4. COHERENCE OF TASKS:</b> Materials contain meaningful, connected tasks that build student knowledge and provide opportunities for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts through speaking and listening, and writing. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, so that students can gain</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>4a)</b> Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the texts. Questions and tasks are developed so that students build knowledge and skill over the course of the unit.</p>	No	Tasks for each STaR story make connections with its paired text, focusing on the same topic. However, connections are not made among texts in the collection. Questions and tasks demonstrate basic understanding of the anchor and paired texts, but they do not build knowledge or understanding of themes across the unit. For example, in Level 3, there is no theme or major topic introduced. The lesson titles move from Dear Mr. Blueberry, The Three Billy Goats Gruff, Trosclair and the Alligator, Trees Around the World, and Baking a Wonderful Wacky Cake, etc. These are unrelated topics. Each topic and its vocabulary are only used for three days. In Level 4, it is noted that the STaR stories for this unit will all cover different parts of the world. Stories include, Living in the Arctic, Rehema's Journey, We're from Brazil,	Reading Roots instruction concentrates more on the connections between Shared Stories than the connections between STaR stories. The Shared Stories are the main student reading text while STaR stories are for listening comprehension. STaR story connections are to the Shared Stories they are paired with, and the broad themes across all of the levels. Reading Roots instruction builds broad themes, such as nature, culture and community, exploration and discovery, personal accomplishment, and our nation. Students receive repeated practice in reading about and experiencing these themes through each level of Reading Roots. In each level of instruction, the Shared Stories introduce a new group of characters who share experiences through the stories. Their experiences connect their stories throughout the level. Although



CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
<p>meaning from text.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p>			<p>Country Kid, City Kid, and What is in the Ocean? Even these titles move from Countries to Ocean life, not staying on the same topic. In Lesson 38 for Level 4, "Living in the Arctic," is used as an expository text. On Day 1, students preview the book, discuss text features, and reference the shared story. An interactive read aloud with comprehension questions follow. Students write a sentence using STaR vocabulary words. On Day 2, there is a review of the story using discussion questions. Students focus on the main idea and key details from the text. Students compare and contrast The Arctic to their hometown. Day 2 ends with students writing about their favorite parts of the book. On Day 3, students use both texts to write about the Arctic. These questions and tasks do not build on question and tasks from other text lessons to build knowledge of the Arctic or a theme.</p>	<p>Reading Roots instruction does not explicitly tell teachers to make connections between the Shared Stories in each level, a teacher should do this as an intuitive part of his or her instruction.</p> <p>In Level 4, where the Shared Stories are linked with the theme of different parts of the world, students gain background knowledge about places around the world. Then they read a folk or fairytale from that place or region.</p> <p>In levels 1–3, students complete graphic organizers (story stars, story maps, and idea trees) while listening to and answering questions about the STaR story. In Level 4, when the Shared Stories become richer in content to prepare students for reading in second grade, they also use graphic organizers with these texts, in addition to the STaR stories.</p> <p>Vocabulary words from Shared Stories, such as sight words, are placed on a word wall during each lesson. This way students are reminded of the word and can review the word in class. Teachers can keep words on the word wall as long as necessary to make sure students understand and become familiar with the word. STaR vocabulary is introduced on the first day of the lesson, and is reviewed during STaR on the following days. Then, about every three lessons, teachers review STaR vocabulary from the previous texts through the Vocabulary Review: Silly or Sensible? activity (for example, see the Level 1 Volume A Teacher's Manual, page 81 and pages 195 and 196. Here, students are given the words in sentences, and they have to signal whether a word is used correctly in the sentence. This ensures that students receive review in the words and understand their meaning. Teachers should evaluate students during this activity, and provide additional review for words as needed based on students' responses.</p>
	<b>REQUIRED</b>	<b>Yes</b>	Although questions and tasks do not build knowledge	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
	<p><b>4b)</b> Questions and tasks are designed so that students build and apply knowledge and skills in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language through quality, grade-level complex texts. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.</p>		<p>over the course of the unit, students are expected to express understanding through reading, writing, speaking and listening, and language. The STaR grade level texts are designed for students to build and apply knowledge in reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language. Reading Roots focuses on oral language and vocabulary during the STaR and Shared Story components. Students discuss stories through Think Pair Share. Students also participate in partner reads during Day 1 and 2 with the Shared Story. Students complete writing tasks using both stories on Day 3.</p>	
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>4c)</b> Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) critical to the meaning of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2; questions and tasks also focus on advancing depth of word knowledge through emphasizing word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.) and engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>	<p><b>No</b></p>	<p>Although questions and tasks include STaR vocabulary, these words are only used for each 3-day lesson. There is no opportunity to see multiple repetitions of words in varied context. Vocabulary words are a large focus. However, word families and other relationships among words are not evident through the STaR tasks. For example, in Level 2 Lesson 20 of the manual, the teacher introduces "STaR words." Students are asked to repeat the words after the teacher and listen to the definitions of the words. The teacher asked comprehension questions, some connected to vocabulary and text, some disconnected, such as "Who has a brother or sister?" The STaR vocabulary words are only discussed on Day 1. Students are encouraged on Day 2 and Day 3 to use the words in their writing; However, after the 3-day lesson, these words are not reintroduced using other texts.</p>	<p>The purpose of Reading Roots Shared Stories and STaR stories is to develop vocabulary and oral language and listening comprehension skills. The first three levels of the program focus on the basic skills students need to become successful, independent readers by Level 4 and Grade 2.</p> <p>On day 1 of each lesson, students are introduced to vocabulary from the STaR story. After learning the words and their meanings, the teacher reads the text and asks students questions while reading, including questions about the STaR vocabulary. On day 2, teachers lead students through STaR Review (for example, Level 1 Volume A Teacher's Manual page 17, where STaR vocabulary and background words should be emphasized as a part of review. Teachers should continue emphasizing these words when they reread the text. On day 3, during Adventures in Writing, students should think about their vocabulary words when writing based on their task for the lesson.</p> <p>In Level 4, the Adventures in Writing sections of the lesson add the Scoring Guide to help students guide their writing as it becomes more detailed and complex. The Scoring Guide tells students that they will earn points for using STaR words, Green Words, Red Words, and challenge words from Shared Stories. This encourages students to recall vocabulary that is</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
				<p>appropriate to the writing objective for that lesson. After completing each lesson, a refined level of use of STaR vocabulary would mean that teachers are consistently recalling past vocabulary words when possible, especially when they are applicable to the new text, based on results from students' SOLO assessments.</p> <p>Structured Oral-Language Observation (SOLO), measures the level to which each student has acquired vocabulary words taught during STaR. These assessments measure students' expressive vocabulary (words they can use in sentences and context) and receptive vocabulary (words they understand, but cannot consistently use). There are 10 SOLO assessments that appear every four lessons (Lesson 4, Lesson 8, Lesson 12, Lesson 16, Lesson 20, Lesson 24, Lesson 28, Lesson 32, Lesson 36, and Lesson 39).</p>
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b>  <b>5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:</b>  Text-dependent and text-specific questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>5a)</b> A majority of questions in the materials are text dependent and text specific; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>During the STaR component in the lesson, several comprehension questions are asked. For example, in Level 3, Lesson 26 for "Dear Mr. Blueberry," the following questions are asked:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr. Blueberry wrote a letter to answer Emily's question. What does Mr. Blueberry tell Emily in his letter?</li> <li>- Emily wrote another letter to Mr. Blueberry telling him that she put salt in the pond every day. Why did Emily put salt in the pond? Why do you think Emily asks Mr. Blueberry if he thinks the whale is lost?</li> <li>- Why did Mr. Blueberry tell Emily that the whale couldn't be lost?</li> <li>- Emily writes to Mr. Blueberry that she saw her whale jump and spurt water. Is this something that could be real, or is this a fantasy that Emily imagines?</li> <li>- Mr. Blueberry answered Emily's questions about blue whales and what whales eat. He told her again that she couldn't have a whale in her pond. Why did he tell her that?</li> </ul>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
			After the STaR comprehension discussion there is a STaR writing, asking students to use two of the tier 3 vocabularies from the story to write their own sentence.	
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>5b)</b> Questions and tasks include the language of the standards and require students to engage in thinking at the depth and complexity required by the grade-level standards to advance and deepen student learning over time. <i>(Note: not every standard must be addressed with every text.)</i></p>	<b>Yes</b>	<p>Questions and tasks include the language of the Louisiana State Standards. For example, students are asked about the main idea of texts. Students are also encouraged to ask and answer questions using who, what, when, where, and why using text evidence. Examples from Level 3, Lesson 16 include:  Page 5: "Let's preview the story." (RI.1.7)  "The title of the story is ..."  Page 7: "That dot is called a period." (L.1.2b)  Page 14: "Answer a question about our story with a complete sentence." (RL.1.1, SL.1.2)  Page 17: The use and introduction of "fluency flyers" (RF.1.4)  Page 22: "I want to include three kinds of information in my message." (W.1.2)  Each lesson follows the same order allowing for several repetitions of the standards throughout the program.</p>	
<p><b>6. WRITING TO SOURCES, SPEAKING AND LISTENING, AND LANGUAGE:</b>  The majority of tasks are text-dependent or text-specific, reflect the writing genres named in the standards, require communication skills for college and career readiness, and help students meet the language standards for the grade.</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>6a)</b> Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to listen, speak, and write about their understanding of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 2; those opportunities are prominent, varied in length and time demands (e.g., informal peer conversations, note taking, summary writing, discussing and writing short-answer responses, whole-class formal discussions, shared writing, formal essays in different genres, on-demand and process writing, etc.), and require students to engage effectively, as determined by the grade-level standards.</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
<p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only</b>  <b>6b)</b> A vast majority of oral and written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built</p>	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
	through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well-defended claims and clear information, using grade-level language and conventions and drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.			
	<b>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only</b> <b>6c)</b> Materials address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>6d)</b> Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. For example, as students progress through the grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s).  In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing). For example, materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>6e)</b> Materials provide models for writing and student exemplars to support writing development in English language arts.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>6f)</b> Materials explicitly address the grammar and language conventions specified by the language standards at each grade level and build on those standards from previous grade levels through application and practice of those skills in the context of reading and writing about unit texts. For example, materials create opportunities for students to analyze the syntax of a quality text to determine the text’s meaning and model their own sentence construction and writing after texts as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and usage.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
<b>7. ASSESSMENTS:</b> Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).  <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>7a)</b> Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>7b)</b> Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>7c)</b> Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>7d)</b> Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
<b>Section IV. Scaffolding and Support</b>				
<b>8. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT:</b> Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.  <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>8a)</b> Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>8b)</b> Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>8c)</b> Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>8d)</b> The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>8e)</b> Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, reteaching strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	<b>8f)</b> The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
<b>FINAL EVALUATION</b>				
<i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 8.				
<i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Quality of Texts, Foundational Skills (as applicable), Coherence of Tasks, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.				
<i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.				
<b>Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.</b>				
Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments	
I. Text Selection	1. Quality of Texts ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>No</b>	Although each Level or Unit contains books relating to the same topic, themes are not evident. Also, there are not enough opportunities to read their own related texts frequently.	Reading Roots Shared Stories cover broad themes across each level, with Level 4 specifically covering locations and their cultures. Students read texts over 3 days in Levels 1–3, and 4 days in Level 4.
	2. Range and Volume of Texts	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
II: Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)	3. Foundational Skills ( <b>Non-Negotiable*</b> )	<b>No</b>	Engaging, content-rich texts are not presented for students to practice foundational skills.	Decodable Shared Stories are the main reading focus for students in Reading Roots. Students who complete Level 4 before the end of first grade can be placed in a second grade reading level in Reading Wings, Success for All's grades 2–6 reading program. Students also read content-rich text for homework in Level 4.



CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES	PUBLISHER RESPONSE
III: Questions and Tasks	4. Coherence of Tasks ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>No</b>	Aside from the Shared Stories students use with partners, there are not enough other opportunities for students to examine language and vocabulary.	Students revisit their STaR vocabulary words each day as teachers reread the text aloud, and review them in later lessons. Students are assessed on mastery and understanding of STaR vocabulary via SOLO assessments every four lessons.
	5. Text-Dependent Questions ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>Yes</b>	Questions used for comprehension are text-dependent, encouraging students to site evidence from the text. The STaR story relates to the Shared story in topic.	
	6. Writing to Sources, Speaking and Listening, and Language	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
	7. Assessments	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
IV: Scaffolding and Support	8. Scaffolding and Support	<b>Not Evaluated</b>	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.	
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <b><u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u></b>				

\*As applicable

Appendix II.

Public Comments

There were no public comments submitted.