

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

**Content:** Students build an understanding of social studies content.

- They examine authentic sources to build knowledge of social studies content.
- They explore meaningful questions about sources and content to build understanding.

**Claims:** Students develop and express claims that demonstrate their understanding of content.

- They make connections among ideas, people, and events across time and place.
- They express understanding of content using evidence from authentic sources and outside knowledge.

Title: Mini-Qs in World History Volumes 1 and 2, and American History Volume 1, and Document Based Questions in American History

Publisher: The DBQ Company dba The DBQ Project

Copyright: 2016

Grade/Course: 6-7

Curriculum Type: Supplemental

Overall Rating: Tier I, Exemplifies quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)	
2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)	
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	
4. Response to Sources	
5. Scaffolding and Support	

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the [standards](#), beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

**Tier 1 ratings** received a “Yes” for all Criteria 1 – 5.

**Tier 2 ratings** received a “Yes” for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one “No” for the remaining criteria.

**Tier 3 ratings** received a “No for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

[Grade 6 \(Tier 1\)](#)

[Grade 7 \(Tier 1\)](#)

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

**Content:** Students build an understanding of social studies content.

- They examine authentic sources to build knowledge of social studies content.
- They explore meaningful questions about sources and content to build understanding.

**Claims:** Students develop and express claims that demonstrate their understanding of content.

- They make connections among ideas, people, and events across time and place.
- They express understanding of content using evidence from authentic sources and outside knowledge.

Title: Mini-Qs in World History Volumes 1 and 2

Grade/Course: 6

Publisher: The DBQ Company dba The DBQ Project

Copyright: 2016

Curriculum Type: Supplemental

Overall Rating: Tier I, Exemplifies quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

<b>STRONG</b>	<b>WEAK</b>
1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)	
2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)	
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	
4. Response to Sources	
5. Scaffolding and Support	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

**Tier 1 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.

**Tier 2 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

**Tier 3 ratings** receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<b>Section I. Content</b>			
<b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b> <b>1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:</b> Materials adequately address the <a href="#">Louisiana’s Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs)</a> at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge.  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<b>REQUIRED (FULL CURRICULUM ONLY)</b> <b>1a)</b> Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	<b>N/A</b>	
	<b>1b)</b> Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	<b>Yes</b>	The volumes provide opportunities to explore questions throughout the document sets, with each individual set of documents exploring a key question. For example, in Volume 2 Unit 1, the guiding question for the activity is "What were the Primary Reasons for the 'Fall' of Rome?"
<b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b> <b>2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:</b> Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources that support students’ understanding of social studies content.  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>2a)</b> The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources <sup>1</sup> to develop content knowledge and express claims; materials may also include text to support students in using the sources.	<b>Yes</b>	The focus of the materials and activities are primary sources that students are to use to develop knowledge and create claims within each set. Each set contains 4-5 sources for students to use, and in some cases, an additional set of background text is provided to provide background knowledge.
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>2b)</b> Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	<b>Yes</b>	While the focus of the sources come in the form of text, individual units include visuals such as images, maps, and graphic organizers as seen in Volume 1 Unit 5's unit on the Great Wall of China.

<sup>1</sup> Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. ([http://www.yale.edu/collections\\_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html](http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html)) For additional definitions and examples, see also: <http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html> and <http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html>.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p><b>2c)</b> Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing<sup>2</sup> and corroboration.<sup>3</sup></p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>The individual units provide students with opportunities to view sources from different perspectives--especially in the form of looking at different sides of an argument. For example, in Volume 1 Unit 7's activity on Asoka, students look at sources that describe Asoka's edicts as establishing peace as a mandate of the empire, and other sources offering a more cynical view of the edicts.</p>
	<p><b>2d)</b> Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.<sup>4</sup></p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>In almost all of the units, students are given sources that come from the original time period discussed in the unit as well as modern secondary sources that offer interpretations of historical events for students to consider.</p>
<p><b>Section II. Claims</b></p>			
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b>  <b>3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:</b>  Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3a)</b> Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>All 11 units in the two volumes offer students opportunities in engaging in problem-solving and drawing conclusions. Because the focus on the questions are open-ended in nature, there is only one opportunity for students to engage in multiple choice questions--save for Volume 1 Unit 8's Hook activity.</p>

<sup>2</sup> Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.

<sup>3</sup> Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.

<sup>4</sup> Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
students are able to understand social studies content.  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>3b)</b> Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions <sup>5</sup> and tasks focus students on building, applying, and synthesizing knowledge and skills through various sources, classroom research, conversations, etc. to develop an understanding of social studies content.	<b>Yes</b>	The units are built with scaffolding student knowledge as well as scaffolding student activities that culminate with an evidence-based essay. For example, in Volume 2 Unit 11, questions on the background essay require students to understand historical knowledge, which is then synthesized with primary source evidence to create an essay that answers the guiding question for the activity.
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>3c)</b> Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to make claims which demonstrate understanding of social studies content (e.g., make connections between ideas, people, and events; explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas; evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments; recognize recurring themes across time and place).	<b>Yes</b>	Each unit culminates with an essay that requires students to make claims that are backed by evidence. In addition to these, there are other activities within the units that require students to make claims that demonstrate understanding of social studies content. For instance, in Volume 1 Unit 4's activity regarding the education of children in Sparta, students are introduced to the concept of the value of education through requiring students to decide on school programs to be eliminated in a fictional school district.  In addition to the written tasks, which serve as the culminating product of the units, there are also oral tasks (discussions, etc.) that are built into the units to support

<sup>5</sup> Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			student understanding as they analyze the sources. Materials also provide options for conducting debates as the learning product in lieu of the essay when the question framing the unit is appropriate for a debate structure.
	<b>FULL CURRICULUM ONLY</b> <b>3d)</b> Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	<b>N/A</b>	
	<b>FULL CURRICULUM ONLY</b> <b>3e)</b> Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	<b>N/A</b>	
<p><b>4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES:</b> Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>4a)</b> Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).</p>	<b>Yes</b>	Students are required to write for all activities in all units in both volumes. For example, in the activity on the Silk Road in Volume 1 Unit 9, students are asked to answer questions as short essays following the background information essay, and after each source, students are required to write short answers to questions relating to the source in order to build information to complete the goal of writing an essay. The scaffolding used by the activity enables students to use their writing when analyzing the sources to write an effective historical essay.
	<p><b>REQUIRED (GRADES 3-12 ONLY)</b> <b>4b)</b> A vast majority of written and speaking tasks require students to present and develop claims with clear explanations and well-chosen information from sources and</p>	<b>Yes</b>	The tasks in the individual units require students to present claims that require evidence from both the supplied sources as well as their background knowledge. For

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	outside knowledge.		example, in Volume 1 Unit 5, students are asked to evaluate the value of the Great Wall of China, and in the process they are asked to make claims considering military, economic, environmental, and social factors involved in its creation.
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>4c)</b> Materials provide regular opportunities to develop students' skill in organizing and supporting their thinking in speaking and writing, including using evidence from sources and outside knowledge.	<b>Yes</b>	Each of the individual units requires students to organize their learning and answers through the use of organizers. For each chapter, students are supplied with organizers consisting of buckets that students can label with the themes discussed in the essay, as well as a bird foot organizer that allows the student to connect the themes with the thesis statements that they create.
	<b>FULL CURRICULUM ONLY</b> <b>4d)</b> Materials provide regular opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	<b>N/A</b>	
	<b>4e)</b> Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	<b>Yes</b>	<p>The activities provide many opportunities for students to take notes and answer relevant social studies questions. The Hook activities at the beginning of each unit ask students to discuss thoughts with a partner.</p> <p>The materials also include literacy strategies such as think aloud, say something, funnel protocol, and save the last word that can be used within the units to support the</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>development of students' active listening skills. There are also opportunities for students to engage in debates instead of written products to further develop their speaking and listening skills.</p>
	<p><b>4f)</b> Materials provide models for writing and student exemplars to support writing development in social studies.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>In the teacher documents and the literacy toolbox, there are printable materials such as the rubric and bucketing examples as well as document analysis sheets for use. In addition, in the teacher's edition there are answer keys provided that give some sample answers. Student essay samples are available to delineate different levels of proficiency in the Mini-Qs.</p>
<b>Section III. Scaffolding and Support</b>			
<p><b>5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT:</b> Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>5a)</b> Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>The materials come in two versions to give teachers two basic options. The Enhanced Version (EV) is heavily scaffolded with questions for the Background Essay and the documents built directly into the Mini-Q. The Enhanced Version also includes essay organizational tools including pre-writing organizers such as buckets for organizing notes into themes, chicken foot organizers for connecting themes to a central thesis, an essay outline, and even a guided essay creation organizer for students not familiar with writing essays. The Clean Version (CV) includes all of the documents, but none of the scaffolding options.</p>



CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>5b)</b> The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	<b>Yes</b>	The website divides each unit into a "Student Side" with the documents and activities, and a "Teacher Side" that includes teacher notes that breaks the Minis into 6 steps with very clear instructions for completing each step of completing the unit.
	<b>5c)</b> Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	<b>Yes</b>	Teachers can determine how to teach each "unit" based on their students. (Mini-Qs come in 2 versions. The Enhanced Version (EV) is highly scaffolded. The Clean Version (CV) includes the same documents, but no support. DBQ units come in a Long Version (LV) and a Short Version (SV). The Short Version has 8-12 documents while the Long Version has 14-18.) These options provide teachers with the ability to customize learning based on student need. In addition, they also include strategies and audio of the text.
	<b>5d)</b> The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	<b>Yes</b>	If teachers follow the provided pacing guides, the activities for each individual unit can be completed within one week of instructional time.

**FINAL EVALUATION**

*Tier 1 ratings* receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.

*Tier 2 ratings* receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

*Tier 3 ratings* receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

**Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.**

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>Yes</b>	The materials cover relevant content for sixth grade world history, and the activities

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			require students to explore key questions and content in the subject.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources <b>(Non-Negotiable)</b>	<b>Yes</b>	The activities include a plethora of primary sources of various types that have students look at historical concepts from a variety of viewpoints that require students to use historical thinking skills in order to understand them thoroughly.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks <b>(Non-Negotiable)</b>	<b>Yes</b>	The questions and tasks for each unit are rigorous and require students to not just show content knowledge, but also make claims about historical events using primary sources as evidence for support.
	4. Response to Sources	<b>Yes</b>	Each unit has a culminating task where students write an essay about the topic. The process for writing these essays is well scaffolded, and utilizes all activities within the unit for support. While there are a variety of rubrics and an answer key, there are no student exemplars for use.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	<b>Yes</b>	The scaffolding process in writing the essay is flexible enough for the teacher to adapt to their own students' needs through the Enhanced and Clean Versions, but the units themselves do not provide information on adjusting for student needs and relies on the teacher's knowledge of their students to do so.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <b>Tier I, Exemplifies quality</b>			

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

**Content:** Students build an understanding of social studies content.

- They examine authentic sources to build knowledge of social studies content.
- They explore meaningful questions about sources and content to build understanding.

**Claims:** Students develop and express claims that demonstrate their understanding of content.

- They make connections among ideas, people, and events across time and place.
- They express understanding of content using evidence from authentic sources and outside knowledge.

Title: Document Based Questions in American History and Mini-Qs in American History Volume 1

Grade/Course: 7

Publisher: The DBQ Company dba The DBQ Project

Copyright: 2016

Curriculum Type: Supplemental

Overall Rating: Tier I, Exemplifies quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)	
2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)	
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	
4. Response to Sources	
5. Scaffolding and Support	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the [standards](#), begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a “Yes” for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “Yes” in Column 1. If there is a “No” for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a “No” in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

**Tier 1 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.

**Tier 2 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

**Tier 3 ratings** receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<b>Section I. Content</b>			
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b>  <b>1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:</b>            Materials adequately address the <a href="#">Louisiana’s Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs)</a> at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED (FULL CURRICULUM ONLY)</b>  <b>1a)</b> Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.</p> <p><b>1b)</b> Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.</p>	<p><b>N/A</b></p> <p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>Each topic includes a key question that encompasses the relevant social studies concepts that are explored in an individual unit, and through the units, students learn about a wide variety of social studies concepts. For example, in Document-Based Questions in American History’s Unit 2, students explore the question “How revolutionary was the American Revolution?”</p>
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b>  <b>2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:</b>            Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources that support students’ understanding of social studies content.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>2a)</b> The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources<sup>6</sup> to develop content knowledge and express claims; materials may also include text to support students in using the sources.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>Both sets of materials include a wealth of primary and secondary sources for students to explore and learn about social studies content. The number of documents varies between Document-Based Questions in American History (More than 12 per unit) and Mini-Q’s in American History (Four or more per unit). In addition, each unit includes a background essay that gives relevant background knowledge on the topic</p>

<sup>6</sup> Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. ([http://www.yale.edu/collections\\_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html](http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html)) For additional definitions and examples, see also: <http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html> and <http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html>.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			discussed.
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>2b)</b> Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.</p>	<b>Yes</b>	There are a variety of source types used in both sets of materials. Many sources are text-based, but there are also plenty of maps, images, and graphic organizers for students to explore. For example, in Unit 5 of the Document Based Questions in American History “What Caused the Civil War?” the supporting documents include pictures, a lengthy background essay with a timeline, two maps, graphs, and several printed documents of varying lengths.
	<p><b>2c)</b> Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing<sup>7</sup> and corroboration.<sup>8</sup></p>	<b>Yes</b>	The sources provided in almost all of the units in both sets of materials allow for sourcing and corroboration through the use of sources from different perspectives. For instance, in Unit 12 of Mini-Q’s in American History (“North or South: Who Killed Reconstruction?”), students view sources from both the North and South in order to determine the causes behind the end of Reconstruction.
	<p><b>2d)</b> Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.<sup>9</sup></p>	<b>Yes</b>	The sets of materials, in most cases, provide students with modern interpretations of historical events for students to use in contextualizing information found in primary

<sup>7</sup> Sourcing asks students to consider a document’s author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.

<sup>8</sup> Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.

<sup>9</sup> Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			sources, as seen in Unit 1 of Document Based Questions in American History (“What Caused the Salem Witch Trial Hysteria of 1692?”), modern historical articles and scientific journal reports are used to help students look at alternative interpretations of the sources.
<b>Section II. Claims</b>			
<p><b>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable</b></p> <p><b>3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:</b> Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to understand social studies content.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>3a)</b> Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>All units in both sets of materials have students respond to questions in various methods, though the preponderance of questions is short answer in response to the sources. However, these questions are quite varied, as seen in Mini-Qs in American History Volume 1, where students are given four varied context documents and a data analysis sheet in order to answer the key question “How Free Were Free Blacks in the North?”</p>
<p><b>REQUIRED</b></p> <p><b>3b)</b> Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions<sup>10</sup> and tasks focus students on building, applying, and synthesizing knowledge and skills through various sources, classroom research, conversations, etc. to develop an understanding of social studies content.</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>All units in both sets of materials are designed with a workflow that engages students in content with the purpose of creating a coherent historical essay. This is seen in Unit 11 of Mini-Qs in American History Volume 1 (“The Battle of Gettysburg: Why Was It a Turning Point?”) where students are given a thought-provoking</p>	

<sup>10</sup> Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students’ responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>activity, then explore the sources in the unit through various source-related questions. The answers to the questions are then synthesized into a historical essay as the capstone to the unit.</p>
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b>  <b>3c)</b> Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to make claims which demonstrate understanding of social studies content (e.g., make connections between ideas, people, and events; explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas; evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments; recognize recurring themes across time and place).</p>	<p><b>Yes</b></p>	<p>The essay prompts and guiding questions for all units in both sets of materials require students to make valid historical claims backed by evidence that demonstrates knowledge of the content discussed. In addition, some activities—especially the opening hook activities in the Mini-Q’s in American History Volume 1—require students to begin looking at the unit by having students make real-world claims based on historical events. For instance, in the unit “Valley Forge: Would You Have Quit?” the opening activity asks students to choose a side in the American Revolution to sell food and supplies based on historical pricelists.</p> <p>In addition to the written tasks, which serve as the culminating product of the units, there are also oral tasks (discussions, etc.) that are built into the units to support student understanding as they analyze the sources. Materials also provide options for conducting debates as the learning product in lieu of the essay when the question framing the unit is appropriate for a debate</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			structure.
	<b>FULL CURRICULUM ONLY</b> <b>3d)</b> Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	N/A	
	<b>FULL CURRICULUM ONLY</b> <b>3e)</b> Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	N/A	
<b>4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES:</b> Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing.  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>4a)</b> Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	Yes	The primary purpose of the activities in both sets is for students to respond to sources and prompts through writing. For example, in Unit 4 of Document-Based Questions in American History (“The California Gold Rush: A Personal Journal”), students are asked to answer short answer questions, short essays, then write a fully-developed essay at the end of the unit.
	<b>REQUIRED (GRADES 3-12 ONLY)</b> <b>4b)</b> A vast majority of written and speaking tasks require students to present and develop claims with clear explanations and well-chosen information from sources and outside knowledge.	Yes	All units in both sets of materials provide students with the opportunity to write a historical essay that requires the students to utilize provided sources as evidence to make claims about varying social studies content. Supplied rubrics require student performance at both claims and evidence to show mastery of content.
	<b>REQUIRED</b> <b>4c)</b> Materials provide regular opportunities to develop students' skill in organizing and supporting their thinking in speaking and writing, including using evidence from sources and outside knowledge.	Yes	The item sets have varying methods of requiring students to organize their information. While the sources are arranged in an order that builds toward the essay, the two item sets differ in how it requires



CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			students to build their evidence. Mini-Q's in American History requires students to utilize an organizer (Unit 7, "Remembering the Alamo: A Personal Journal") to build their writing, while Document Based Questions in American History only rely on the structure of the unit and the supplied literacy strategies to help students structure their writing.
	<p><b>FULL CURRICULUM ONLY</b></p> <p><b>4d)</b> Materials provide regular opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.</p>	<b>N/A</b>	
	<p><b>4e)</b> Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.</p>	<b>Yes</b>	Hook activities in the item sets ask students to share their opinions with a partner or with the entire class (See: Mini-Qs in American History - Volume 1 Unit 4 "Valley Forge: Would You Have Quit?"). The materials also include literacy strategies such as think aloud, say something, funnel protocol, and save the last word that can be used within the units to support the development of students' active listening skills. There are also opportunities for students to engage in debates instead of written products to further develop their speaking and listening skills.
	<p><b>4f)</b> Materials provide models for writing and student exemplars to support writing development in social studies.</p>	<b>Yes</b>	In both sets, the teacher is provided with literacy strategies as well as learning tools for writing, such as scoring rubrics and

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			graphic organizers. Student essay samples are available to delineate different levels of proficiency in the Mini-Qs.
<b>Section III. Scaffolding and Support</b>			
<p><b>5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT:</b> Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes      <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>5a)</b> Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.</p>	<b>Yes</b>	Both item sets provide a teacher toolkit that provides strategies and organizers for teachers to use. However, the Mini-Q's in American History provide more integrated scaffolding than Document Based Questions in American History due to the fact that in the Enhanced Edition of the Mini-Q's, students are given prewriting activities such as bucketing in each unit to assist in writing the final essay.
	<p><b>REQUIRED</b> <b>5b)</b> The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.</p>	<b>Yes</b>	Both the print and web editions are easy to use, including the annotation tools on the online edition. The text and images are clear and are easily reproduced for in-class usage. The headings for each document and source are clear as well.
	<p><b>5c)</b> Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).</p>	<b>Yes</b>	Teachers can determine how to teach each "unit" based on their students. (Mini-Qs come in 2 versions. The Enhanced Version (EV) is highly scaffolded. The Clean Version (CV) includes the same documents, but no support. DBQ units come in a Long Version (LV) and a Short Version (SV). The Short Version has 8-12 documents while the Long Version has 14-18.) These options provide teachers with the ability to customize learning based on student need. In addition,

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			they also include strategies and audio of the text.
	<b>5d)</b> The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	<b>Yes</b>	If teachers follow the provided pacing guides, the activities for each individual unit can be completed within one week of instructional time. The pacing guide also offers a shortened timeline for teachers with less instructional time, and there are enough units and topics to use the sets throughout the school to cover relevant social studies content.

#### FINAL EVALUATION

**Tier 1 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.

**Tier 2 ratings** receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

**Tier 3 ratings** receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

**Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.**

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>Yes</b>	The materials cover relevant content in 7 <sup>th</sup> grade social studies and explore key questions and concepts of the subject topics.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>Yes</b>	Sources are plentiful, well chosen, and cover a wide range of points of view and time periods. The focus is on text sources, but graphic organizers, images, maps, and photos are also included where necessary.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks ( <b>Non-Negotiable</b> )	<b>Yes</b>	Units are designed for the student to write an essay that is backed by evidence, and all questions and activities are designed for students to gather information to write the essay.
	4. Response to Sources	<b>Yes</b>	Students are required to respond to every source in order to gather relevant

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			information to construct valid claims in order to answer a prompt in an essay format.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	<b>Yes</b>	DBQs in US History provides less support for the teacher in assisting struggling students, but mini-DBQs offer a variety of scaffolding options to assist students in answering questions as well as developing a well-written historical essay.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <b><u>Tier I, Exemplifies quality</u></b>			

Appendix I.

Publisher Response

The publisher had no response.

Appendix II.

Public Comments

March 21, 2017

Dr. Jackie Bobbett, Ph.D. K-12 Administration and Supervision  
Supervisor, Instructional Material Reviews  
Office of Academic Content  
Louisiana Department of Education  
<http://www.louisianabelieves.com>

Dear Dr. Bobbett and the Louisiana Department of Education,

The Jewish Federation of Greater New Orleans, North Louisiana Jewish Federation and the Jewish Federation of Baton Rouge are partnering with the Institute for Curriculum Services (ICS) to ensure accurate social studies content standards on Jews, Judaism, and Israel in the instructional materials being evaluated for the students and educators in the state of Louisiana. The Institute for Curriculum Services promotes accurate instructional materials and instruction on Jews, Judaism, and Israel for American K-12 students. We greatly appreciate the opportunity to give input on the proposed the textbooks so Louisiana educators can provide more accurate and pedagogically sound instruction to their students.

Attached please find six reviews (three reviews of each) for two texts (#17036 and #17037) submitted by DBQ. We provide some corrections of inaccuracies and offer suggestions for improvement. We hope you will give these recommendations your careful consideration and look forward to working with you to ensure accurate and pedagogically sound instructional materials. We share your goals of accuracy and excellence in educational materials for the educators and students of Louisiana. This online review process of social studies instructional review is an important step in furthering this aim. ICS sincerely appreciates your leadership and the excellent work of your staff.

For additional information or questions on the review, please contact Dr. Lisa Wurtele at

████████████████████ .

We look forward to working with you on this very meaningful task. If you have any questions, please contact me at ██████████ or ██████████

Thank you very much for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

Peter Haas



**Institute for Curriculum Services (ICS) Review on behalf of  
the Jewish Federation of Greater New Orleans,  
the Jewish Federation of Baton Rouge,  
and the North Louisiana Jewish Federation  
The DBQ Project #17036  
*DBQs and Mini-Qs, Social Studies, Grades 6-8*  
*DBQ Mini-Qs in World History – Volumes 1 and 2;*  
*Document Based Questions in World History***

**General Comments:** This DBQ Project text includes a number of resources contained in collections of documents assembled for teaching different subjects. This review focuses on three lessons:

- a) **“Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World?”** (in *DBQs and Mini-Qs, Social Studies, Grades 6-8 for 6th World History to the 1500s, Mini-Qs in World History - Volume 1, 8.*);
- b) **“Why Did Islam Spread so Quickly?”** (in *DBQs and Mini-Qs, Social Studies, Grades 6-8 for 6th World History to the 1500s, Mini-Qs in World History – Volume 2, 3.*); and
- c) **“The Black Death: How Different Were Christian and Muslim Responses?”** (in *DBQs and Mini-Qs, Social Studies, Grades 6-8 for 6th World History to the 1500s, Document Based Questions in World History, 3.*).

Each of the collections above contains multiple documents, which are presented as part of multi-part lessons based on them; the lessons contain classroom-ready materials with directions for teachers and students. All parts of the lessons have sections geared to students and teachers (Teacher Side and Student Side) and the Teacher Side includes a Document List, a hook exercise with questions and answers, a Background Essay (with related questions and answers), and all or most of the following elements: Establishing the Context (General Instructions and Specific Considerations), Understanding the Question and Pre-Bucketing, Document Content Notes, Teaching Tips, Skill Builders, and Extension Ideas, and Teachers Toolkits. Suggestions are provided about use of maps, etc., guidance is given about discussion of document analysis (both questions and answers). Teachers are also provided with Mini-Q Essay Outline Guides, and Mini-Q Sample Essays (with examples given of essays at non-proficient, basic proficiency, and higher proficiency levels).

The lessons reviewed provide generally good, ready-to-use materials for teachers interested in presenting history through analysis of primary (and some secondary) documents. They are engaging presentations and, on the whole, are reliable, though there are some inaccuracies that should be addressed. The comments below relate to the three lessons reviewed here.

- a) **“Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World?”** (in *DBQs and Mini-Qs, Social Studies, Grades 6-8 for 6th World History to the 1500s, Mini-Qs in World History - Volume 1, 8.*)

**General Comments:** This is the eighth of 11 lessons presented in the DBQ collection entitled *Mini-Qs in World History - Volume 1*. The subject matter itself is of interest, and the presentation is engaging and is generally sound. However, this lesson requires some revision because not all of the information provided is of equal significance or utility; it is not obvious how students will be able to analyze the documents without having access to the background notes. Likewise, it is not obvious how students will be able to use some of the documentation in answering the lesson’s key question. Specific recommendations are offered below.

Hook Exercise: The Roots of Christianity, p. 343, **Change:** “2. In which empire was Jesus born? a. Roman Empire b. Persian Empire c. ~~Israeli Empire~~ Kingdom of Israel d. Egyptian Empire”

**Comments:** This answer confuses Israeli and Israelite. “Israeli” is a 20th century term, while “Israelite” was the name of Jews in the ancient Kingdom of Israel. “Israeli Empire” is not an accurate term. The area was called Judea at the time of Jesus, as part of the Roman Empire. The replacement suggested above is just one possible chronologically appropriate option.

Background Essay, Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World, p. 345, para. 1, **Change:** “The eastern Mediterranean region where Jesus grew up was multi-cultural. Although ~~Israel~~ Judea was ruled by Rome at the time, Greek influences were strong. In fact, along with **Aramaic**, his native language, it is quite possible that Jesus spoke Greek. We know from reading the ~~Old Testament~~ Christian Bible that Jesus ~~lived among Jewish people~~ was a Jew and followed Jewish laws. What made Jesus controversial in his Jewish community was his belief claim that he was the **messiah**, and that he did not dissuade his followers from describing him as the Son of God. The Greek word for messiah is “Christo.” ‡ Messiah means the savior whom Jewish prophets promised would one day bring peace and harmony to the ~~people of Israel~~ world.”

**Comments:** Use of the name Israel in this context is anachronistic. The accurate name for that period was Judea.

The term Old Testament is Christian-centric, used to signify that it was replaced and surpassed by a newer version; the more neutral term Christian Bible (or Gospels) should be used here.

Jesus did not merely live among Jews; he was a Jew himself. The current wording is misleading, allowing students to infer that he was a non-Jew living among Jews.

The text cannot present Jesus’s belief; it should only report on statements attributed to him, or statements made in his presence which he reportedly did not contest.

Jesus’s acceptance of his followers’ description of him as the Son of God was (and remains) counter to Jewish belief. Any interpretation of God as being other than

the unique, solitary, divine being, who has no intermediaries, is incompatible with Judaism, and considered heretical.

The word “Messiah” replaces “it” to clarify that the definition of “Messiah” means the savior who would bring about certain changes to the world (rather than Christos, which is the Greek translation).

Jews believe that the messiah will bring peace to the entire world, not only to the people of Israel.

Background Essay, Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World, p. 345,

**Change:** “Because he claimed to be the messiah and did not repudiate the claims that he was the Son of God, Jesus was considered to have transgressed the bounds of Jewish law, a threat to the old Jewish leadership in Jerusalem. He also made some Romans uncomfortable; they worried that someone who called himself the Son of God could eventually obtain too much power. ~~Local leaders put pressure on Roman officials to have this gentle but outspoken radical killed by nailing him to a cross, a form of execution usually reserved for the worst criminals.”~~

**Comments:** The first sentence presents an unsupported assertion that elaborates on the statement that Jesus claimed to be the messiah. There is no basis presented for the charge that the Jewish leaders would have considered Jesus more of a threat than any of the leaders of the many rival sects who were then vying for control of, and influence in, the Jewish community (including the Pharisees, the Sadducees, the Essenes, the Zealots, and the early Jewish followers of Jesus). Jewish religious life in that period and place was not monolithic, and the various groups had very different views related to religious practice, the Oral Torah and legal interpretation, the afterlife, political authority, and more. Likewise, the statement about the Jewish leaders’ perception of Jesus should be changed because the first two sentences here are inappropriately linked (with “also”), making the statement that he made the Jewish leaders uncomfortable seem to be a given, since it was linked with the supportable statement that he made the Romans uncomfortable. Jesus’s claim to be the messiah engendered a rejection by Jewish leaders, since (at least as has been described in Jewish sources—which are at least as accurate historically as the contemporary Christian ones) because he was going beyond the bounds of that religious community. See also comments above, and comments below on both Background Essay Questions, p. 347, Question 3, and Answers to Background Essay Questions, p. 346.

Background Essay, Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World, p. 345, **Add:** “Four other individuals known as Matthew, Mark, Luke, and John wrote accounts of Jesus’s life, death, and, according to the details they presented, resurrection.”

**Comments:** Jesus’ Resurrection is presented here as an historical event; the contents of the Gospels should be presented, instead, in a way that differentiates between historical events and religious belief.

Background Essay Questions, p. 347, Question 3, **Change:** “Why might would Jewish elders in Jerusalem have been uncomfortable with Jesus’s claim that he was the Son of God?”

**Comments:** Although students can expect to find the answers to these questions in the Background Essay itself, that essay provides misleading and inaccurate information in this regard. The way the question is posed, students might assume that Jewish doctrine includes the idea that a messiah could be viewed as the Son of God or that God has a son. Jews view (and would have then also considered) expressions of such ideas as blasphemous. Jewish leaders would not have needed another reason to be uncomfortable with Jesus's claim. Incorporating a reason supplied in the Christian Bible inappropriately uses religious belief to explain historical events. See also the comments on Answers to Background Essay Questions, p. 346, Question 3.

Teacher's Toolkit, Answers to Background Essay Questions, p. 346, **Delete:** "3. Why might Jewish elders in Jerusalem have been uncomfortable with Jesus's claim that he was the Son of God? ~~If people accepted Jesus as the messiah, the elders could well lose their following, and their financial support.~~"

**Comments:** See comment above.

Teacher's Toolkit, Answers to Background Essay Questions, p. 346, "5. Define these terms, **Change:** "messiah: Hebrew for "the deliverer anointed one," one who will bring peace to the kingdom of Israel unify the twelve tribes of Israel, will rebuild the Temple, and will usher in a period of peace in the world."

**Comments:** The word "anointed" is the accurate translation of "messiah;" the further description provided should include the actions expected of the messiah. The messiah is described in Jewish tradition as unifying the twelve tribes and bringing peace to the entire world; rebuilding the Temple is also mentioned in describing the messiah.

Teacher's Toolkit, Answers to Background Essay Questions, p. 346, "3.5. Define these terms, **Change:** "New Testament: the second "half" of the Christian Bible, which deals with the life and teachings of Christ Jesus. This separates it from the Old Testament, which the part that contains books from the old Hebrew scriptures Bible.

**Comments:** "Christ" is a religious title that asserts a religious belief and should not be used without clarification in a public school textbook; it is appropriate to describe the historic figure as "Jesus." Unlike the titles of religious offices (e.g. pope, rabbi, imam, etc.), religious titles that are primarily theological statements about the individual's relationship to the divine (e.g. Jesus Christ, Saint Paul, Prophet Muhammad) are not appropriate for public school textbooks. Texts need to clarify that these are religious titles used by believers of a certain faith, as in "Muhammad, believed to be a prophet by Muslims..." In the case of Jesus of Nazareth, "Christ" is a religious title.

The edits above clarify that what is called the Old Testament within the Christian Bible refers to the books of the Hebrew Bible.

Calling the Hebrew Bible the "old Hebrew Scriptures" implies that the Hebrew Bible was replaced with the Christian one and, by implication, that Christianity superseded Judaism. Such a description is characteristic of Replacement Theology, which views Judaism as an imperfect prelude to Christianity and focuses on negative aspects of Judaism. This problematic concept, also called Triumphalism or Supersessionism, has been repudiated by scholars of religion and by most Christian denominations.

Document A, (The Gospel of Luke, chapter 10, verses 25-37, *The Bible*), p. 351,

**Delete:** Delete this document containing the parable of the Good Samaritan, as well as the related Document Analysis, and inclusion of it in “From Thesis to Essay Writing, Teacher’s Toolkit, Paragraph #2, and in all three Mini-Q Sample Essays.

**Comments:** This text employs as its first document (out of seven), the Good Samaritan parable, a parable that the State of California has deleted from its History-Social Science Framework specifically because it describes Jews as biased and heartless; it should not be used. Parables that demean one religion are not appropriate for public school students. Unfortunately, the parable of the Good Samaritan is often used to promote anti-Semitism by focusing on the priest and the Levite as examples of bad Jews rather than focusing on the universal message of kindness to others. See also comments on Mini-Q Sample Essay: Higher Proficiency, Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World?, para. 2, lines 3-4.

Document C (Source: Religious historian Elaine Pagels, as quoted in the 2009 PBS documentary *From Jesus to Christ*), p. 355, Document Analysis, Question 3, **Add:** “How can this document be used to explain why a religion like Christianity, that taught that all people are made in God’s image and all are dear to God, took hold in the ancient world?”

**Comments:** Document C explains, “But this religion is saying that every person, man, woman, child, slave, barbarian, no matter who, is made in the image of God and is therefore of enormous value in the eyes of God....” The change above was made to clarify that Christianity was not unique in this view; indeed, Judaism contains the same teaching.

Document D (Source: Helmut Koester, as quoted in the 2009 PBS documentary *From Jesus to Christ*), p. 355, Document Analysis, Question 4, **Change:** “How can you use this document to explain why people would have joined an a Jewish or early Christian community?”

**Comments:** Document D explains that, “Here is a community that invites you, which makes you an equal with all other members of that community. Which does not give you any disadvantages. On the contrary, it gives even the lowliest slave personal dignity and status. Moreover ... the care for each other becomes very important....If they are hungry, they know where to go. If they are sick, there is an elder who will lay on hands to them to heal them.” However, the same description (with the exception of the “elder who will lay hands on them to heal them”) applies to what Judaism offered. What is striking is that none of the Documents presented include one of the most obvious reasons why Christianity took hold in the ancient world, namely that (in contrast to, for example, Judaism) its adherents and leaders took many active steps to proselytize. If the document cited had included reference to elements of Christianity that that appealed to Romans which were unique to that religion, then the question could remain as originally posed.

Document E (Source: Adapted from Marcus J. Borg and John Dominic Crossan, *The First Paul*, 2009), Roman Ideology and Christianity Compared, I. 1, **Change:** “A crucial difference between the program of Caesar and the program of [Jesus “] Christ [”] is...”

**Comments:** Unlike the titles of religious offices (e.g. pope, rabbi, imam, etc.), religious titles that are primarily theological statements about the individual's relationship to the divine (e.g. Jesus Christ, Saint Paul, Prophet Muhammad) are not appropriate for public school textbooks. Texts need to clarify that these are religious titles used by believers of a certain faith, as in "Muhammad, believed to be a prophet by Muslims..." In the case of Jesus of Nazareth, "Christ" is a religious title. Since the title "Christ" (used without Jesus) appears in an excerpted document and can't, therefore, be deleted, the suggested changes are presented in brackets.

Document F: The Journeys of Paul, Teacher's Toolkit, Teaching Tips, **Change:** "3. According to the background note, who were the people Paul visited on his travels? Paul spent time with two groups, ~~Jewish Christians and gentile Christians.~~ of early Christians: those who had been Jews, and those who were non-Jews (Gentiles), both of whom accepted Christian teachings To be clear, however, neither group would have called themselves Christian at this time. They were Jews or ~~g~~Gentiles who followed the teachings of ~~Christ~~ Jesus, many believing he was the messiah come to bring peace to the world."

**Comments:** The distinction should be made more clearly for students, so that they understand the difference between the two groups and realize that early Christians numbered both Jewish and non-Jewish "converts" to Christian teaching. As noted in the text, Gentile is capitalized when used to refer specifically to a group of non-Jewish people.

See above regarding the use of the religious title "Christ."

Document G (Source: From a letter written by Pliny the Younger, a Roman judge, circa 112 CE.), Document Analysis, Question 5, **Change:** "5. How can this document be used to explain ~~why~~ how firmly Christianity ~~took~~ had taken hold in ~~the ancient world~~ what is now modern western Turkey by 112 C.E.?"

**Comments:** Document G does not provide the information necessary to answer the question as posed. Question 5 should be changed so that it asks students to respond with information they can find in the document; the document does contain information that that Christians were a recognizable community in that time and place, and indicates the lengths Christians were willing to go to in order to maintain their observance of their faith.

Teacher's Toolkit, **Delete:** Mini-Q Sample Essay, Non-Proficient, ~~Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World?~~

**Comments:** As indicated by the title, this example of a "non-proficient" essay is unacceptable. Teachers will not benefit from such an example, since there are innumerable forms of such an essay. Also, they cannot benefit from this example, which expresses a student's inaccurate reading of the information provided. Instead, this example should be replaced by an additional example of an essay at the basic proficiency level, so teachers can better assess if their students' essays demonstrate a basic proficiency.

Mini-Q Sample Essay: Basic Proficiency, Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World?, lines 1-2, **Change:** “Christianity’s baby steps weren’t easy, but the religion didn’t fall down. A few Roman and Jewish leaders had Jesus crucified outside of Jerusalem around 33 CE.”

**Comments:** There is no information presented that Jewish leaders had Jesus crucified; this should not be stated as historical fact. Inclusion of that claim in what is identified as an essay at the “basic proficiency” level is both inaccurate and inappropriate. Most historians write that crucifixion was a customary punishment among Romans, and not the Jews, and also that the Jews then had many different factions who were in disagreement. Thus, Jesus’ teachings would not likely have elicited such a response. Further, use of this statement has historically led to violence against Jews and textbooks that blame or implicate Jews in the crucifixion have been categorically rejected in many states.

Mini-Q Sample Essay: Higher Proficiency, Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World?, lines 2-4, **Change:** “These ideas were strongly resisted not only by Roman officials but also by leaders of the local Jewish population from which Jesus came.”

**Comments:** This line should be deleted for the reasons given above. Although this doesn’t blame the Jews in as stark a way as that seen in the Basic Proficiency level essay example, the subtle message imparted here is the same, namely that the Jewish leaders were major opponents (and presumably were to blame for his arrest and crucifixion).

Mini-Q Sample Essay: Higher Proficiency, Why Did Christianity Take Hold in the Ancient World?, para. 2, lines 3-4, **Delete:** “This is at the heart of the Parable of the Good Samaritan, in which Jesus tells the law scholar, “Love your neighbor as yourself.” (Doc A).”

**Comments:** The example of the Good Samaritan should not be included here (see comments on Document A above). Also, this particular teaching does not explain why Christianity took hold, since when Jesus said, “Love your neighbor as yourself,” he was quoting the *Torah*: These words first appeared as a Jewish teaching, in the Hebrew Bible, in the third book of the Torah. (*Lev. 19:18*).

- b) **“Why Did Islam Spread so Quickly?”** (in *DBQs and Mini-Qs, Social Studies, Grades 6-8 for 6th World History to the 1500s, Mini-Qs in World History – Volume 2, 3.*)

**General Comments:** This is the third of 11 lessons presented in the DBQ collection entitled *Mini-Qs in World History - Volume 2*. The question presented is of current interest given the contemporary successes of Islam in many areas. The lesson explains the different categories of cultural diffusion by which religious ideas and cultures have spread (including technology, trade, conquest, foreign study, and migration), then poses the key question about Islam’s spread. The Background Essay describes the beginnings of Islam, and then the lesson presents documents that one expects to answer the key question. Unfortunately, not all of the documents offered are equally useful in providing material for a response to the lesson’s question. Students can look at a trade route map, and a map of Islam’s spread, read excerpted verses from the Qur’an, a description of early military campaigns, the duties of the caliph (with reference to “the Pact” [of Umar]) as described by an early Muslim legal scholar, and an early Muslim historian’s account of a battle waged against non-Muslim Syrians. Students are asked to look at each document and answer “How does this document help explain why Islam spread so quickly?” but they will have difficulty doing so without the additional information that is presented to teachers. For example, the Content Notes add much in the way of explanation (describing, for example, the purpose behind early raids, the rules governing Muslim armies, and the several meanings of the term “jihad”), and the strong connections between government and religion in early Islam. But without a more thorough explanation and, in effect, interpretation, students will not easily be able to show how each document explains the spread of Islam. Specific recommendations are offered below.

Background Essay, Why Did Islam Spread So Quickly, p. 99, para. 1, lines 6-9,

**Change:** “According to Muhammad, ~~it was on this a~~ visit to Mt. Hira ~~that~~ the archangel Gabriel squeezed him hard and caused words to flow from his mouth. The words said that Allah was the one God. ~~No doubt a bit shaken,~~ Muhammad reported the event to his wife and her cousin ~~but otherwise stayed silent.~~ The words continued to come.”

**Comments:** This change deletes the part of the narrative which are either not in the Qur’an, or that are clearly written from the modern author’s viewpoint (i.e., that he was shaken, and was silent apart from reporting the event to his wife and cousin); this ensures that the background essay is written in a way that clearly indicates that the details of the narrative are per Muhammad.

Background Essay, Why Did Islam Spread So Quickly?, p. 99, para. 1, lines 9-10,

**Change:** “The words said that Allah ~~was the one God~~ (Allah, in Arabic) is one (unique; i.e. there is one God).”

**Comments:** “Allah” is the Arabic term for God; its use does not imply a uniquely Muslim conception of God.

The change above provides a more accurate rendering of the Qur’anic text. The Qur’an (Sura 96:1) says “God is one.” Qur’anic translations and interpretations have rendered the verse as “God is one,” “God is unique,” etc.



Background Essay, Why Did Islam Spread So Quickly?, p. 99, para. 3, lines 1-2, **Add:** “According to Muslim sources, after ~~After~~ receiving Allah God’s words for ~~two~~ several years, Muhammad ~~decided it was time to talk~~ made his revelation more public.”

**Comments:** See above regarding use of Allah in English.

The changes above make a distinction between historic fact and religious belief. Muslim sources differ about the length of time they believe to have elapsed between the first revelation, shared with just a few, and a second revelation.

Background Essay, Why Did Islam Spread So Quickly?, p. 99, para. 3, lines 9-11,

**Change:** “A follower of Islam ~~was to be~~ is called a Muslim, meaning one “who submits to the will of Allah God.”

**Comments:** The change above corrects the phrasing of the text, which implies that a ruling was issued about the correct terminology to be used. The text of the Qur’an uses the term “Muslims” throughout.

See above regarding use of Allah in English.

Background Essay, Why Did Islam Spread So Quickly, Teacher’s Toolkit, p. 100, Step Two: Establishing the Context, Specific Considerations, Time, **Add:** “Be sure students review the timeline. Ask them to identify the main events of Muhammad’s life. (He was born in 570, is said to have received his first revelation in 610, moved to Medina in 622...”

**Comments:** The addition above makes the distinction between historic fact and religious belief.

Background Essay Questions, p. 101, **Change:** “1. When and where ~~did~~ is Muhammad said to have first received words from Allah?”

**Comments:** See above.

Background Essay Questions, p. 101, **Change:** “3. What were the three religious practices one could find in Mecca before Muhammad’s is said to have received revelations?”

**Comments:** See above.

Teacher’s Toolkit, Answers to Background Essay Questions, p. 100, **Change:** “2. What were the two main ideas expressed by these words? Allah God ~~is the one god~~ (unique); society’s wealth must be shared with the poor and the weak.”

**Comments:** See comments for Background Essay, Why Did Islam Spread So Quickly?, p. 99, para. 1, lines 9-10, above.

Teacher’s Toolkit, Answers to Background Essay Questions, p. 100, **Add:** “5. Can you explain why Muhammad’s turning from Jerusalem and facing Mecca is called a symbolic break with the past? Jerusalem was the spiritual center of Judaism and a spiritual center of Christianity. By turning to Mecca, Muhammad was saying that Islam was a separate teaching from Judaism and Christianity.”

**Comments:** This addition makes the distinction between Jerusalem’s being the one and only spiritual center of Judaism, and its being a key (i.e., one) spiritual center of

Christianity, but not the only such center. Indeed, the significance of Jerusalem to Christians declined during the period of their persecution by the Romans, and in Muhammad's time Constantinople had eclipsed Jerusalem as Christianity's center in the East. The answer provided here is more inclusive, yet does not have much in the way of historic backing. The change in the direction of prayer (*qiblah*) is customarily interpreted as being a rejection of Jewish (not Jewish and Christian) practice, which came after the Jewish community in Medina made clear its rejection of Muhammad as a prophet.

Document E: The Duties of the Caliph, Content Notes, bullet point 4, **Change:** "Prior to reading the document, discuss with the students the meaning of jihad. Often, it is translated as "holy war." This is only partly accurate, as the literal translation of the word is "strive," "struggle," or "effort." This means striving or struggling to fulfill the will of Allāh God, as Islam means "submission to the will of Allāh God." Muhammad advocated for both a "greater jihad" and a "lesser jihad." The greater jihad involved the internal struggle to be an ideal Muslim and live up to the requirements of the Five Pillars and the religion in general. Lesser jihad is the fight against an outer enemy, waging war according to the rules that Muslims believe are set out by Allāh God in the Qur'an and by Muhammad's example in this lifetime. This form of jihad was a duty of the caliph."

**Comments:** "Allah" is the Arabic term for God; it is used in the Qur'an, but need not be used in English. The name "Allah" is a contraction of the Arab definite noun "al-ilah;" it consists of the Arabic definite article "al" preceding the noun "ilah," (the common noun meaning "god"). Thus, "al-Ilah," or "**the** god," became "Allah," or simply, "God."

Care should be taken to distinguish between historical fact and religious belief; use of "Muslims believe" will accomplish this.

The term "jihad," while having several meanings, has a clear meaning in the text by the medieval Muslim legal scholar al-Mawardi. There, it is included in The Ordinances of Government among the duties of the caliph as "To wage . . . jihad [holy war] against those who, after having been invited to accept Islam, persist in rejecting it, until they either become Muslims or enter the Pact\* so that God's truth may prevail over every religion." In that instance it is not an external struggle but, clearly, is an external action. It should be made clear, once distinctions in the meaning of the term are introduced, which form of jihad is referred to in the text.

**c) The Black Death: How Different Were Christian and Muslim Responses?** (in *DBQs and Mini-Qs, Social Studies, Grades 6-8 for 6th World History to the 1500s, Document Based Questions in World History, 3.*)

**General Comments:** This is the third of 11 lessons presented in the DBQ collection entitled *Document Based Questions in World History*. The question presented is clear and interesting, but the documents offered in the lesson are not all equally useful in helping students arrive at useful conclusions which they can be used to answer the key question. Specific recommendations are offered below.

Background Essay, *The Black Death: How Different Were Christian and Muslim Responses?*, p. 153, Christianity, para. 1, lines 1-23, **Change:** “Christianity had its origins with Jesus Christ in the first century of the Common Era. Christ Jesus was a Jew from Judea in what is today’s Israel. A charismatic leader who connected with the downtrodden, Christ Jesus preached about brotherly love and the “golden rule,” to “do unto others as you would have done unto you.” He established a following of disciples who came to view him as the son of the one and only God. The Romans who ruled Judea were threatened by Christ Jesus’s popularity and had him crucified on a cross, thus martyring Christ Jesus in the minds of his disciples. The cross became the symbol of Christ Jesus, and his disciples began spreading his teachings around the region. The disciples, who were also Jewish, added writings to the Jewish Hebrew Bible (or Old Testament) that came to be known as the New Testament. ”

**Comments:** The addition above clarifies that Judea is a term that was used in Jesus’s time, and that area was located in what is now called Israel.

“Christ” is a religious title that asserts a religious belief and should not be used without clarification in a public school textbook; it is appropriate to describe the historic figure as “Jesus.” Unlike the titles of religious offices (e.g. pope, rabbi, imam, etc.), religious titles that are primarily theological statements about the individual’s relationship to the divine (e.g. Jesus Christ, Saint Paul, Prophet Muhammad) are not appropriate for public school textbooks. In the case of Jesus of Nazareth, “Christ” is a religious title.

The more standard term is Hebrew (rather than the Jewish) Bible.

Background Essay, *The Black Death: How Different Were Christian and Muslim Responses?*, pp. 153-154, Islam, para. 1, lines 1-13, **Change:** “In the early 7th century in Mecca, a city in today’s Saudi Arabia, a man named ~~Mohammed~~ Muhammad ~~claimed~~ reported that he had received the word of God (Allah in Arabic) and called on the people to submit to Him (the word “Islam” means “submission to God” in Arabic). ~~Mohammed~~ Muhammad’s teachings about how people should treat each other were similar to Christ Jesus’s, but the underlying duty of all Muslims (followers of Islam) was the submission to Allah God. These teachings appealed to poorer people and angered the wealthy. By 622 ~~Mohammed~~ Muhammad and his followers were forced to flee to nearby Medina. He continued his teachings and ~~reported that~~ felt he was directed by God to ~~write~~ recite the ~~Koran~~ Qur’an, the book that contains Islam’s fundamental beliefs. These beliefs rest on five pillars: the profession of faith to Allah God, daily prayer, charity, fasting, and a pilgrimage to Mecca. By 630 ~~Mohammed~~ Muhammad had gained a huge following and

was able to return to Mecca to convert the city. He died in 632, but his followers spread Islam quickly. Within two decades of ~~Mohammed~~ Muhammad's death most of Arabia was converted, and by the fourteenth century, Islam stretched from North Africa to India."

**Comments:** The preferred spelling of the name is currently Muhammad (rather than Mohammed). (See *New Directions in Diversity: A New Approach to Covering America's Multicultural Communities*, by George Padgett (Marion Street Press, 2006), p. 109; "Quran or Koran? Newsrooms grapple with style standards for Arabic words," by Andy Zieminski (<http://ajrarchive.org/Article.asp?id=4239>.)

It is more accurate to describe Muhammad as having reported (rather than that he claimed) to have received the word of God. The source of these events is, in any case, religious Muslim texts, which do not use the term "claim" in this regard; such usage is disrespectful.

Regarding the use of "Christ," see comments above.

The current usage Qur'an is more common.

"Allah" is the Arabic term for God; its use does not imply a uniquely Muslim conception of God.

Document N: ~~Antisemitism~~ Anti-Jewish Behavior and Sentiment (Source: Michael Kleinlawl, as reported in the *Strasbourg Chronicle* (Alsace, France), 1348), p. 179, Note,

**Change:** "Note: This selection is included here to document an example of anti-Jewish sentiment and also as a source that verifies the events known as the 1348 Strasbourg Massacre, in which the Jewish community of that city was destroyed. The massacre appears to have been driven by anti-Jewish attitudes and economic interests: The confessions referred to in this poem were extorted under torture. The town council of Strasbourg tried to protect the Jews from a mob. The council (composed of master tradesmen) was thrown out of office and replaced with new Anti-Semitic Jewish members, artisans who organized beforehand to win greater political power. Of the 1,884 Jews of Strasbourg, more than 900 of them were burned on the grounds of the Jewish cemetery and the rest were banned from the city. Through this massacre, the townsmen's debts were erased, and they were assigned all Jewish assets. Anti-Semitic Jewish riots, (these were later called ~~known as~~ pogroms), occurred throughout Europe during the Black Death. By 1351, 60 major and 150 smaller Jewish communities had been destroyed, and over 350 separate massacres had taken place."

**Comments:** First, this document should be removed if its accompanying Note is not revised as recommended above and moved to a location directly above the document itself.

Wherever it may be used it should be renamed to reflect the fact that the term anti-Semitism (also spelled antisemitism) was a construct that came only later. Likewise, the term anti-Semitism should be changed throughout, since, in the Christian context at that it was really anti-Judaism.

The Note should be moved so that students will not fail to read it before reading the document itself. Its current location, combined with its small font size, may lead students to ignore it, or to misconstrue the document; it is not sufficient to present students with corrective information only later. It is insufficient to mention this in the

Teacher's Toolkit, (where, in Teaching Tips, para. 5, p. 178, it notes "Be sure students see the note that follows the poem.").

Introducing students to anti-Jewish material without proper scaffolding is inappropriate and poor pedagogy; it could have the unfortunate result leading students to embrace antisemitism. The additions to the Note supplied here should be incorporated in it to ensure that students do not base their knowledge of the events the document describes on the document (a poem) itself. The economic motivations of the townspeople in slaughtering the Jews of Strasbourg should be presented, as should the circumstances of torture that produced extracted confessions, to avoid students' misapprehension of the material.

Document N: Antisemitism (Source: Michael Kleinlawl, as reported in the *Strasbourg Chronicle* (Alsace, France)), Teacher's Toolkit, Teaching Tips, para. 5, p. 178, **Change:** Be sure students see the note that ~~follows~~ precedes the poem. The pogroms that occurred throughout Europe were mostly initiated by the uneducated "mob." Many educated Christians who had nothing to gain from anti-~~Semitism~~ Jewish behavior, perhaps like the author of this document, could see that the Jews were dying from the plague and therefore could not be responsible for it. It should be noted, however, that Jews did not die in as large numbers as Christians. ~~The~~ A possible reason for this is ~~probably~~ that due to widespread anti-Semitism, Jews were mostly forced to live in ghettos, apart from the larger community. Some also credit the better hygiene of that community, since observant Jews wash hands more frequently, which may have inhibited the spread of bacteria. ~~These ghettos often had walls and gates that kept out the cities' rats and were usually kept cleaner than the cities behind the walls.~~

**Comments:** See comment above regarding change of the term anti-Semitism.

As noted above, wherever this document is ultimately used, the note should precede the poem. The reasons presented should be stated with greater reservation; also, a more logical reason should be given for the lower death rate among Jews.

The suggestions that the ghetto gates successfully kept rats out is untenable; the explanation that ghettos were kept cleaner cannot be accepted without additional information given.

Document Q: Michael Dols, *The Black Death in the Middle East*, Teacher's Toolkit, Teaching Tips, p. 182, para. 3, lines 3-4, **Add:** "Students might want to look at Document L in which the Arab chronicler Ibn Taghri Birdi reports that..."

**Comments:** The name above is not referred to as shown; the patronymic (ibn) prefix precedes the name Taghri Birdi. (Taghri should not be viewed as a middle name that may be ignored or deleted.)

Teacher's Toolkit, Teaching Tips, p. 182, para. 4, **Change:** "By "messianic movements" Dols is referring to flagellant-type movements. The point Dols makes here is obvious: there were no flagellants ~~and no anti-Semitism~~ in the Middle East. Have students discuss why it is that some Christians formed messianic movements and persecuted minorities in response to the plague and Muslims did not. Student answers to this question will cut right to the worldview of each religion in the 14th century and will make the difference between a basic response to the DBQ question and a sophisticated one.

(One possible answer to the worldview question is that some devout Muslims, more than Christians, believed the world was in God's hands. The Black Death was from God and people were not to question. In conservative Islamic circles [Document E], believers were even encouraged to accept the plague as a blessing. The Christian world view seems to have been more interventionist. In some Christian circles at least, things could be fixed if people sinned less; ~~or~~ guilt could be removed if guilty groups they perceived as guilty could be eliminated. We add a definite word of caution here, however. While the documents may suggest a difference in worldview, they also show a surprising number of similarities in Christian and Muslim responses. It is for students to weigh both differences and similarities when constructing their answer to the analytical question.)"

**Comments:** The one suggested possible answer provided in the Teaching Tips to the question (Why some Christians formed messianic movements and persecuted minorities in response to the plague and Muslims did not?) is, oddly, not related to what is identified at the start of the paragraph as the "obvious" point, namely, that "there were no flagellants and no anti-Semitism in the Middle East." Given that, and given the documents provided, it is useful to note that the answer provided was given by Dols.

The word "some" should be added before "Christians formed messianic movements and persecuted minorities" to provide needed nuance.

A more obvious answer that could have been provided here is that anti-Jewish sentiment and behavior were more entrenched in Western Europe than it was in Eastern lands under Islamic rule (which is more accurate than stating that there was no anti-Jewish sentiment and behavior in Islamic-ruled lands). The Teacher's Tips ascribes Christian anti-Jewish behaviors and actions to an interventionist worldview, and contrasts that view with Muslim acceptance of God's decisions and of one's fate; it assigns purely (or mostly) religious motives to the anti-Jewish actions of Christians in that period, and practically justifies them as determined by an understandable philosophic worldview. In other words: Their actions were understandable; they did what they perceived they must for self-preservation.

It is important to specify that the groups Christians acted against were perceived as—but were not—guilty.

Document M: The Flagellants, Teacher's Toolkit, p. 176, Content Notes, third bullet point, **Change:** "~~Ultimately, the~~ The flagellants did not contributed to persecutions that had have a major impact on the Jewish communities in Europe. Hundreds of Jewish communities were attacked, with many of those destroyed in more than 350 massacres. They were also an annoyance to the Church, they provided spectacle to the people and perhaps solace to themselves, but their overall historic impact on the Church was limited."

**Comments:** The notes for this document lesson minimize the effect of the actions of flagellants and of other groups hostile to Jews, and their effects are relegated to the minor "annoyance to the Church." This note to teachers dismisses the significant effect of actions by these flagellants and other Christian persecutors on European Jewish communities in anticipation of, or in response to the plague. Numerous historians have made the case that these persecutions had a severe impact, nearly eradicating the principal Jewish communities of the Rhineland. (See Samuel K. Cohn, Jr. *The Black Death and the Burning of Jews* (*Past and Present* 196, August 2007, pp. 3-36); Anna

Foa, *The Jews of Europe After the Black Death* (UC Press, 2000), p. 146; and Richard S. Levy, ed., *Antisemitism: A Historical Encyclopedia of Prejudice and Persecution* (ABC-CLIO, 2005), p. 763, and elsewhere.) Interestingly, the Teacher's Toolkit Content Notes for Document N provides important and useful information about the numerous anti-Jewish acts throughout Europe that were linked to baseless charges made against Jews poisoning wells, in which thousands were massacred and thousands of other Jews were expelled.

In contrast with a more nuanced historical reality, the lesson depicts Christianity largely in negative terms, while portraying Islam in a favorable light, basing this portrayal on selective use of sources; it includes many primary sources, a good number of which are pointed to (at least in the Teacher's Notes) as evidence that Christians in Europe actively scapegoated certain members of society, while Muslims in the Middle East behaved with restraint, accepting their fate as God's will, rather than a punishment that could be avoided through violent human intervention. However, other documents could just as well have been adduced that provide evidence that Muslims persecuted women. See Joseph P. Byrne, *The Black Death* (Greenwood Press, 2004), p. 108.

Document N: Anti-Semitism, Teaching Tips, p. 178, sixth bullet point, **Change:** “Ask students if it is human nature to assign blame to a specific group of people when calamity strikes. ~~Ask them if there is anything in Christianity that teaches people to look for blame. (There is nothing in the religion itself that would cause the people to blame the Jews.) Since there is nothing in Christianity that would lead people to blame and kill the Jews, what else could explain the pogroms? (Perhaps the instinct to scapegoat)”~~ **Comments:** Asking students whether it is human nature to assign blame is a leading question, since it will probably lead to acknowledgment that most people assign blame (to themselves, to others, etc.); this will, in turn, lead them to minimize such an action overall (without addressing the situation of blaming a particular people out of prejudice, as in the historic events under discussion). The addition “assign blame to a group of people,” and deletion of the specific religious groups, appropriately sharpens the question's focus, while maintaining a broad focus, avoiding singling out one religious group.

The answer provided in parentheses to teachers is incorrect: Until 1965, when Pope Paul VI issued *Nostra aetate* (the *Declaration on the Relation of the Church with Non-Christian Religions of the Second Vatican Council*), the Church taught that Jews were responsible for the death of Jesus, a teaching which had a major impact on the treatment of Jews by Christians. Even when individual Church authorities acted to prevent massacres, this was to little effect.

The final question above was deleted for several reasons: As noted above, it is based on a false premise (in fact, Christian teachings are known to have inspired persecution of Jews). The reason suggested to teachers in answer to the question why Christians persecuted Jews (“Perhaps the instinct to scapegoat”) does not explain why Jews specifically were singled out. The question itself may evince unwanted anti-Jewish prejudices among the answers suggested by students. In fact, the question as originally stated above is inappropriate altogether, since it increases the potential for marginalization of a religious community.

Document Q: Michael Dols, *The Black Death in the Middle East*, Teacher's Toolkit, p. 182, Content Notes, lines 4-8, **Delete:** "In all his research, Dols was unable to uncover any Muslim messianic movement (like the flagellants) and any persecution of minorities by Muslims (like the anti-Semitism found in Europe)."

**Comments:** If Dols' work (excerpted here and presented as Document Q) is adduced as proof that a) there was no Muslim messianic movement like the flagellants and there was b) no persecution of minorities by Muslims (like the anti-Semitism [later] found in Europe)," then the document should not be used here, because such information is both inaccurate and misleading. While Dols may not have provided (or "in all his research...was unable to uncover") evidence of flagellants or of such anti-Jewish activity, many reputable scholars with expertise in Middle Eastern history have, to the contrary, found abundant such evidence. Numerous examples of discrimination against Jews in this period (as well as in early and in later Islam) are to be found in Norman A. Stillman's classic *Jews of Arab Lands: A History and Source Book* (Jewish Publication Society, 1979). See also comments on Document Q: Michael Dols, *The Black Death in the Middle East*, Teacher's Toolkit, Teaching Tips, second bullet point, below.

Document Q: Michael Dols, *The Black Death in the Middle East*, Teacher's Toolkit, p. 182, Teaching Tips, second bullet point, **Add:** "One question that students should ask is whether or not Dols' generalization about European (Christian) persecution of Jews vs. no Middle Eastern (Muslim) persecution of any group is supported by other documents in this DBQ. (In fact, Dols' generalization is not supported.)"

**Comments:** The parenthetical note (meant to provide the correct answer that teachers should look for) is incorrect. Based on the documents provided, one might imagine that this is correct, and following the notes here, teachers (and their students) will likely think this is true, but, despite Dols' research lauded on the teacher's page, the generalization referred to above is inaccurate. There are distinctions to be made between the persecution Jews experienced in Christian and Muslim-ruled lands, but the text should not dismiss the latter. As noted above, Jews suffered at the hands of Muslims in the form of anti-Jewish decrees, sentiment, and violence.

See also comments on Document Q: Michael Dols, *The Black Death in the Middle East*, Teacher's Toolkit, Content Notes, Teaching Tips, lines 4-8, above.

Document Q: Michael Dols, *The Black Death in the Middle East*, Teacher's Toolkit, p. 182, Teaching Tips, fourth bullet point, lines 2-9, **Change:** " The point here is obvious: there were no flagellants and ~~no~~ there was a different level of anti-Semitism intolerance of Jews in the Middle East. Have students discuss why it is that Christians formed messianic movements and persecuted minorities in response to the plague, and Ask them whether viewing one or two documents are sufficient for them to conclude that Muslims did not acted differently. Student answers to this question will cut right to the worldview of each religion in the 14th century..."

**Comments:** Antisemitism is a late-19<sup>th</sup> century term and use of it for this earlier time period is anachronistic. Discrimination and persecution of Jews can and should be described as such without using a construct developed much later.



The second question is repetitive; it would benefit students more to consider a question about how documents can be understood and used to draw conclusions about the lesson's key question.

Inclusion of this document may be preserved provided the guiding questions posed by teachers do not lead students to arrive at conclusions that are unwarranted by historical fact. The case may be made that Muslims did not persecute Jews specifically in response to the plague (as asserted in Document Q). However, students are likely to misapprehend from that that there was not "any persecution of minorities by Muslims (like the antisemitism found in Europe)." They will also learn this from teachers who teach from the Content Notes on this page. The assertion that there was "no anti-Semitism in the Middle East" will lead readers to assume incorrectly that Muslim discrimination against Jews was non-existent and without effect; the changes above ask students whether such a generalization may be made when examining only a few documents. It is true that the plight of Jews in Christian Europe involved hatred, rather than the overall contempt expressed toward them by Muslims. At the same time, the treatment of Jews under Islamic regimes varied over time and place. While, in general, they had more rights and security under Islamic regimes, and in some periods flourished, they were second class citizens and experienced some periods of outright persecution, e.g., Jews were massacred under the Almohads. Even in more peaceful times, there were various indicators of their reduced status (poll tax and distinctive clothing) and indignities faced by Jewish communities.

Document P (Source: Ibn Battuta, *Travels in Asia and Africa 1325-1354*), Teacher's Toolkit, p. 182, Teaching Tips, **Delete:** "• Student attention should be drawn to the following: "...3. ~~The acceptance of Jews and Christians in communal prayer (as opposed to Document N which shows anti-Semitism in Europe).~~"

**Comments:** The teacher notes and the text itself both encourage sweeping generalizations based on partial/limited information/documents. In this document, Ibn Battuta mentions an instance when Muslims, Jews and Christians all prayed together ["as a result of the plague."]. It is worth noting that, in contrast to the prevailing religious rulings forbidding Jews from praying in churches, some Jewish religious leaders in Muslim-ruled countries viewed praying (Jewish prayers) in mosques as permissible. The contrast which teachers are told to highlight here is not necessarily an indication of greater tolerance on the part of Muslims. The particular mosque in (or outside of) which these prayers occurred was a site of great significance to all three communities (which some claimed was the grave site of Moses).